



WIDENING ACCESS TO THE
TEACHING PROFESSION

SUMMARY



**SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW
COMMISSIONED BY
THE GENERAL TEACHING COUNCIL SCOTLAND**

**WIDENING ACCESS TO
THE TEACHING PROFESSION**

SUMMARY

**Bryce Hartshorn, Ian Hextall, Irene Howell, Ian Menter and Geri Smyth
SEPTEMBER 2005**



SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

with



FACULTY OF EDUCATION

First Published 2005
The General Teaching Council Scotland

© 2005
0-902481-04-5
978-0-902481-04-6

This book is published for
The General Teaching Council Scotland.
The views expressed in this report are those of the author
and do not necessarily represent the views of
The General Teaching Council Scotland.

No responsibility for loss occasioned to any person acting
or refraining from action as a result of any material
in this publication can be accepted by the author or publisher.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be
reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in
any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopy,
recording or otherwise, without prior permission of the publisher.

Printed and bound in Great Britain

1 Introduction

1.1 Background

There has been growing concern about the composition of the teaching workforce in Scotland. The General Teaching Council has expressed disquiet at the relative lack of men, especially in primary schools, and the lack of teachers from black and minority ethnic (BME) backgrounds.

With the Parliament and Executive of post-devolution Scotland emphasising the importance of multiculturalism, social inclusion and diversity, a teaching workforce generally representative of the population must be a priority. The motives underlying this concern for representativeness are a traditional commitment in Scotland to universal access to public services and the current concern about teacher supply. This review was commissioned by the General Teaching Council Scotland in order to ascertain the extent to which the workforce in Scotland draws from the whole community and, where sections of the community are significantly under- or over-represented, to consider what is known about the reasons for this, both in Scotland and elsewhere. The research team was also encouraged to consider what steps might be taken to develop good practice in supporting the development of a fully representative teaching profession. The main findings of this review are summarised in this document.

1.2 The scope of the review

In carrying out this review, the members of the project team have drawn on their experience across many aspects of social inclusion in education in order to identify reports of research and good practice that may enable an understanding of the current situation in Scotland and the barriers to achieving a representative teaching workforce.

A broad definition of inclusion and representativeness has been adopted, incorporating eight main (frequently overlapping) dimensions:

- 1 social class/socioeconomic status
- 2 gender
- 3 ethnicity (including refugees and asylum seekers and travellers)
- 4 bilingualism
- 5 religion
- 6 disability
- 7 sexuality and sexual orientation
- 8 age.

1.3 Structure of the report

Section 2 provides an account of the existing information on the make-up of the teaching profession in Scotland and looks at steps, which have been taken to address issues of under-representation. Section 3 analyses the sequence of events and procedures, which may lead to an individual becoming and remaining a teacher. Section 4 discusses in turn each of the eight dimensions of representativeness. Section 5 offers a synthesis and analysis of the data presented

and seeks to relate the findings to the Scottish context, while Section 6 concludes with a number of recommendations for consideration by the Council and others.

1.4 Review methods

The team members conducted a literature review of educational libraries, databases and websites to identify material appropriate to this study. Some 250 relevant items were summarised and circulated to all members. At the end of the full review, there is a list of references to the literature cited in the report.

2 Background

2.1 Teacher identity and national culture: the Scottish context

In the wake of Scotland's devolution, the education system and the teaching workforce may be seen as critically important in the creation and transmission of a collective national identity. If Scottish civic culture is to be based upon equality, inclusion and social justice, the key workforces responsible for generating, maintaining and transmitting those principles must reflect those same principles in their make-up.

Historically, the profession was affirmative for people of middle-class origin, while providing the opportunity of social advancement for people of working-class origin. However, if the profession developed in an inclusive manner in terms of social class, its differentiation by gender was far more problematic. Social and economic roots underlie the historical and current 'feminisation' of the profession.

Across the whole of Scottish society, the principles of inclusion remain intentions, goals or targets. This review contends that genuine representativeness within the teaching profession is central to the development of Scottish civic culture, but it is often overlooked in current concerns about curriculum, assessment, pedagogy and pupil attainment.

2.2 Teachers and professional identity

Much recent work in philosophy, psychology and social theory has emphasised the need to consider the multiple identities which characterise each of us as an individual. While we need to be able to talk about people in collectivities, such as 'women' or 'BME groups', these groups do not necessarily represent discrete communities.

There is a great danger that in arguing the case for a representative workforce, the sheer dynamism and fluidity of society is forgotten. Rather, the question of representativeness must be seen as being as much concerned with how teaching is defined as with who actually undertakes the work.

Therefore, in looking at the composition of the teaching workforce we should simultaneously be looking at how concepts of professional identity are being developed. Teacher identity is constructed through the experience of teachers: how they understand their work and place in society.

2.3 The teaching workforce and the population of Scotland

The data below are taken from the 2003 School Census.

Gender

The workforce is disproportionately female: In 2003, 93 per cent of teachers in primary schools were female, 57 per cent in secondary schools, 82 per cent in special schools.

In addition to a significant under-representation of men in the Primary sector, the number of young men joining the Secondary sector has decreased significantly in recent years. The combined proportion of male teachers in both sectors dropped from 30 per cent in 1996 to 26 per cent in 2003.

Senior posts are disproportionately held by men. In contrast with a 26 per cent male workforce, 44 per cent of promoted posts were held by men and 36 per cent of head teachers and deputies were men.

Male seniority is particularly apparent at secondary level. Women held more than 80 per cent of promoted posts at Primary level, but much less than 50 per cent at Secondary level, and only 18 per cent of Secondary headships – despite a 57 per cent female workforce at Secondary level.

Age

There is a rapidly ageing workforce. The average age of teachers was 44, with 37 per cent over 50 and 61 per cent over 40.

Minority ethnic

Where ethnic background data was given, 0.7 per cent of teachers and 0.4 per cent of those holding promoted posts were from minority ethnic backgrounds. (GTC Scotland figures show that of all new teachers in Scotland in 2003, under 1 per cent were from BME background; the corresponding figure for 2004 was 1 per cent.)

Religion

The only data available in terms of teachers' religion regards those teachers who have Roman Catholic approval to teach in Catholic schools.

Rarer workforce data

Similarly, little or nothing is known about the numbers of teachers who are gay, lesbian or bisexual, about the numbers who are bilingual, about the numbers who are disabled or about the social class backgrounds of teachers.

Conclusion

Age and gender are thus clearly the dimensions with the most information available due to the legal requirement to declare. Data on most other dimensions will remain dependent on teachers' willingness to declare.

2.4 The recruitment of teachers in Scotland

As yet, no mechanism has been suggested for actually increasing sectors of the population among entrants (eg increasing the number of men entering Primary courses or increasing the proportion of BME students).

Recruitment in general has a regional or even local dimension. An example relates to the growing number of places available for teachers of Gaelic and for Gaelic-medium education, most of whom will come from the Highlands and Islands and thus reflect a largely mono-ethnic population. However, these remote areas are also areas where teacher supply can be particularly challenging.

It may be that special initiatives are required throughout Scotland to target particular groups of the population and recruit them into the teaching profession. One such programme is described below.

The Scottish Wider Access Programme (SWAP)

Through SWAP, access to higher education (HE) is available to students who have difficulty attaining the entrance qualifications demanded by the more usual channels. Among the most popular programmes are those which offer access to a place within Primary Teacher Education (leading to a Bachelor of Education, BEd).

Students attend a 1-year intensive course programme, in a college of FE. Guaranteed entry to a BEd programme within any of the Scottish universities which provide teacher education is dependent upon a successful interview halfway through the Access programme and successful completion of the Scottish Qualification Authority (SQA) units.

Acceptance onto an Access course is linked to the applicant's circumstances, usually social factors. Applicants given priority include women, the socially disadvantaged, single parents, the unemployed, the disabled, and ethnic minorities.

A number of interesting findings arise from the data collected:

- The percentage number of males entering the teaching profession via the Access route is greater than those entering via the more traditional routes.
- Students over 30 are more likely to enter via Access than younger students.
- Some 47 per cent of male and 25 per cent of female students left full-time employment to enter an Access programme which could lead to a Primary Education degree.

2.5 The present position (2005)

This is an exciting time for those involved in teacher education. Among the new programmes of teacher training which are widening access to the profession are: part-time delivery of postgraduate certificate of education (PGCE) Primary and Secondary programmes, distance learning supported by on-line study, teaching practice in the students' local area and a Postgraduate Diploma in Education for classroom assistants.

3 Widening access and the teaching profession

3.1 Introduction

This Section considers the general place of teaching within the overall occupational structure; the implications of widening access for recruitment and retention in teaching; and the general movements towards widening participation in HE.

3.2 Teaching, the labour market and the public sector

Teaching must be interpreted alongside other public sector occupations which are likely to compete for many of the same potential entrants and whose changing employment patterns are likely to be similar. A major review of public service employment observes that:

- The UK labour market is currently highly competitive with unemployment at an historically low level and with widespread recruitment and retention problems across local public services. Fewer younger people are being attracted to the public sector; 27 per cent of the public sector workforce are aged 50 or over.
- Recruitment in the public sector is expensive. The average direct cost of recruiting a member of staff is £3456.
- There is a wide range of recruitment and retention initiatives in place across the public sector.

3.3 Teaching and widening access

Due to a serious lack of Scottish research into teacher recruitment, retention and progression, there is little evidence and data on which to base policy development. This section therefore looks elsewhere to gather evidence.

An Australian Government review highlights problems in the gender and age composition of the teaching workforce, notes that the country's ethnic and cultural diversity is not well represented, and calls for research into teacher workforce trends, including specific geographic areas.

In the USA, there is concern about teacher supply and the under-representation of certain groups within teaching. Issues of recruitment and retention are viewed as particular to specific socioeconomic contexts: the rural poor; the inner-city.

In England there is limited research into recruitment in shortage subject areas and recruitment of under-represented groups (male Primary teachers, minority ethnic groups, people with disability). A variety of funding measures/financial packages are available to attract new teachers and encourage qualified teachers to return.

3.4 Moving into teaching via higher education

The majority of teachers prepare for their careers through courses in HE Institutions (HEIs). This means that current attempts to widen participation in HE will have direct and indirect implications for recruitment into teaching.

Motivation for access initiatives are multiple and ambiguous and include widely differing aims – a concern with social justice, concerns about performance indicators, concerns over institutional survival. An initiative designed to widen access (for a diversity of learners) may narrow into a policy of merely increasing access. Thus the claim is made that throughout the UK, increased participation in HE in the 1990s *increased* access, but did little to *widen* access.

Widening access/participation policies may indeed exacerbate already existing patterns of differentiation and status. A widely expressed concern is that increasing ghettoisation in terms of non-traditional enrolment is taking place with low-income students increasingly concentrated within newer universities.

4 Dimensions of representation in the teaching workforce

4.1 Introduction

Section 4 reviews research and good practice literature relating to the eight dimensions of representation. These vary greatly in the extent to which they have been recognised as concerns within teaching and in the amount of research carried out.

4.2 Class

There is no legislation covering class discrimination. It is suggested that in both official policy statements and academic research, educational debate has been sanitised by the use of 'disadvantaged' or 'socioeconomic status' to denote class inequality.

Despite increasing access, structural barriers remain for those prevented by life chances or family circumstances, from taking advantage of increased provision. Among these are the abolition of the maintenance grant and the necessity for increasing numbers of students to work substantial numbers of hours, in addition to study requirements.

A small-scale piece of research suggests that speech patterns and accent can result in specific material outcomes in teaching, eg being given the lowest streams; that schools want to create an image and the way teachers look, speak and behave is part of this image; that there are repercussions if teachers do not conform; that school policy and rhetoric of social justice and inclusion are not carried through into practice.

4.3 Gender

In recent years, gender issues have had an increasing focus on issues of equality and inequality. Gender debates now have high visibility in relation to teachers and teaching.

Concern is expressed about the 'feminisation' of teaching and the under-recruitment of male teachers. Patterns of promotion and progression suggest an issue around the 'masculinisation' of teaching. Much of the recent debate about the recruitment of males has been fuelled by consistent evidence of the under-achievement of boys in school.

Recruitment, retention and promotion

A balanced workforce, representative of the community at large, is able to draw on a larger pool of talent and offer a broader range of experience. A serious gender imbalance in the teaching force may have repercussions for service delivery, when issues such as bullying, violence and exclusion clearly have a gender dimension.

Gender refers to the psychological, social and cultural differences between males and females and is linked to socially constructed ideas of masculinity and femininity. Stratification by gender is a feature of most societies, structuring people's life chances and opportunities with men typically in a more dominant position than females.

Education is a key site for the negotiation and formation of gender identity. Teachers and pupils alike 'do' gender in the myriad routines and interactions of school life, reproducing or challenging the inequalities embedded in society.

If current trends continue, the proportion of female teachers in the secondary sector will rapidly increase, as older teachers (mainly men) retire.

Males attracted into the profession tend to be mature entrants changing career. Here, there are implications for marketing and recruitment strategies, including the provision of various routes into the profession.

However, to market teaching as a caring career carries connotations of low status, low income and poor working conditions. A more effective strategy is to present teaching as enjoyable, intellectually challenging and with good working conditions and salaries.

Retention of students on Initial Teacher Education (ITE) courses and opportunities for progression and promotion of staff are as much a part of widening access as recruitment. A critical mass of male support within university tutor groups and positive relevant prior experience in schools are key factors in improving retention and progression rates.

An increasing proportion of students and teachers are lone parents, who find that the inflexible working hours make it difficult to combine work and family. It is important that teacher education institutions are flexible enough to offer appropriate and timely support at pressure points and at different stages in the student life cycle.

Gender is one factor that clearly impacts on promotion prospects in reality, or in perception. White male teachers typically believe that teachers are promoted according to their experience and ability. Female teachers are more likely to perceive a connection between career progression and gender.

One study concluded that family circumstances, rather than gender *per se*, appeared to be associated with the career progression of female teachers. Female head teachers were found to be significantly less likely than male head teachers to live with a partner or to have children.

The gendered nature of childcare provision

Most female childcare respondents linked family experience with children to their career option, their progression into childcare representing a 'seamless career'. However, compared with women, men's careers tended to be chequered rather than linear. Typically, male respondents had a wider range of employment experiences and most regarded childcare as a 'second chance career'.

Far from being supportive, the views of family and friends were likely to be an inhibiting factor. It is seen as crucial for the retention of men to construe the childcare worker not in relation to a mothering role, but as a pedagogue, focusing on young children's learning.

It is important in pre-school as in the primary school that children are offered models that counter stereotypes and present a range of positive roles for both males and females.

Gender and partnership in ITE

The context for ITE is partnership with schools. Research indicates that increased accountability may be linked to an increase of staffroom bullying. Mentor training should incorporate anti-bullying tactics and the development of constructive evaluation protocols focusing on gender, age, disability, ethnicity and sexuality.

Bullying and the lack of power to challenge such behaviour may be a significant factor affecting both recruitment and retention. The cumulative effect of racist peer and tutor behaviour results in a form of 'degradation' for those minority ethnic students, who leave during or immediately after ITE. Where ethnicity is combined with gender, the effects of prejudice and bullying are not additive but multiplicative.

Current legislation has implications for employment procedures and highlights the importance of monitoring each stage of the teacher's life cycle. There are implications for the curriculum in teacher education institutions and in schools, as segregation by gender is illegal. All subjects, including options, are to be open equally to males and females.

Gender roles and education

Schools present opportunities to develop new Scottish male identities that reject macho posturing. They offer a space within the wider context of popular male and female youth cultures for the reconstruction of gender roles.

A key question for male and female teachers alike is whether it is the gender similarities or gender differences which are important. Are the differences problematic or are they to be celebrated and exploited?

The elements of gender discourse – gender identities, gender differences and gender relations – converge in the debate over what it is to be a male or female in the teaching force. The challenge is how to demonstrate gender equality while encouraging a recognition of gender difference.

The 'feminisation' of teaching is only part of a highly-gendered discourse. Evidence of stratification in promotion and progression patterns and the demarcation of curricular area by gender suggest that the 'masculinisation' of teaching is the other side of the same coin. The total gender regime of schools and teacher education institutions needs to be taken into account.

By way of recommendation, it is timely for the GTC Scotland to consider recognising non-traditional degree qualifications as routes into teaching. In order to gain a clearer picture of the teaching workforce, it will be important for the Scottish Executive to publish statistics which relate gender to ethnicity.

4.4 Ethnicity

Ethnic background describes how we think of ourselves and is not the same as nationality or country of birth. National Union of Teachers guidelines (2003) suggest that a classification based on ethnic origin rather than place of birth or colour produces more reliable and comprehensive results as it permits the identification of any differences between and within different ethnic groups.

The need for ethnic monitoring has been well established in research and in legislation. Consideration needs to be given to the usefulness of the statistics that have been thus gathered and to how people themselves view their ethnicity.

Why should we be interested in the recruitment of an ethnically diverse teaching force?

Where ethnic background data was collected in the 2003 Census of school staff, only 0.7 per cent of teachers were from minority ethnic groups, and in promoted posts only 0.4 per cent. Where ethnic background data were provided in the 2003 census of school pupils, 4.6 per cent of pupils in Scottish schools were of an ethnic origin other than 'white UK'.

When the dominant ethnicity of the teaching workforce is white, there may be little recognition of culturally contrasting norms and outlooks. When the dominant group identifies the socio-culturally marginalised as the 'other', members of oppressed groups may even come to view themselves through the lens of supposed normality.

Race Relations legislation requires schools and education authorities to eliminate unlawful racial discrimination, promote equal opportunities and promote good race relations between people from different racial groups. To ensure that the legislation is engaged with, ethnic monitoring must be put in place.

What kinds of experiences do minority ethnic students and teachers report?

Respondents mention the disincentive of teaching as a profession due to low status, reduced support from family, lack of financial incentive, poor chance of promotion for black teachers, the constant need to prove themselves, a reluctance to work in all-white schools and racial harassment by pupils in the form of verbal abuse.

Students believed black students needed support because of their greater susceptibility to being misunderstood. Support to combat racism in placements was also mentioned. The authors argue that mentor training needs to focus more on structural/power issues.

Respondents highlighted peer and family support as a major contribution to success on their PGCE courses.

Power relations – between students and teachers and between teachers themselves – comprise an important site for the investigation of equality in schools. It seems that bullying and the lack of power to challenge such behaviour could indeed be a significant reason affecting both retention and recruitment.

Refugees, asylum seekers and travellers

The Carrington Report of 1999 recommends more flexibility in the consideration of qualifications from outwith the European Union. In Glasgow, it is estimated that there are around 80 experienced teachers among the refugee population. Yet very few are able to register to teach in Scotland, due to the lack of equivalence of their qualifications, or limited English.

Recent research on traveller pupils has shown that they experience both racism and underachievement in the school sector. Widespread misrepresentation and negative stereotyping has been reported. Positive impact has been made on the education of traveller children where traveller adults have been involved in their education.

What are the general guidelines for good practice which could be followed for the recruitment of minority ethnic teachers, including travellers and refugees?

- Taster courses for potential trainees
- Partnerships with local minority communities
- Collaboration between schools, teacher education institutions, the GTC Scotland and local communities
- Efficient, effective systems to provide immediate support in the event of racial harassment on placement
- Appeals to potential ethnic minority teachers stressing the distinctive contribution they can make in all kinds of schools.

4.5 Bilingualism

Issues around bilingualism include the valuing of community and heritage languages and the promotion of language diversity, language maintenance and language restoration.

In the context of education, bilingual pupils are those who use two or more languages in their everyday life. In this review, the term 'bilingual teachers' is used to apply to those teachers who are specifically employed, because of their own bilingualism, to use a language other than English to support the education of bilingual pupils.

The majority of the curriculum is taught in English, with the notable exception of Gaelic-medium education. Support for bilingual pupils focuses on integration into mainstream education through the acquisition of English, with home languages virtually ignored.

Problems faced by bilingual pupils with the English language may be misinterpreted as learning difficulties and result in inappropriate assessment or even exclusion of bilingual pupils. In contrast with the remedial English provided for bilingual pupils, research has found that it is dual language enrichment models, ie the curricular mainstream taught through two languages, which offer effectiveness in terms of student outcomes.

How do the patterns vary from country to country and in different employment sectors?

There is little evidence available concerning the recruitment of bilingual teachers but a study conducted in the USA into the supply and demand of teachers, across the curriculum, found that the demand for bilingual teachers was as high as the demand for other shortage subjects including physics, chemistry, mathematics and computer science.

There is no legal requirement to provide linguistic support in a child's first language through formal education, although European Union legislation requires that children of migrant workers receive instruction in their first language.

There is no Scottish-based research on the experiences of bilingual students and teachers. However, concerns have been expressed that bilingual teachers can become ghettoised and have few promotion prospects, as no clear career structure exists. In interviews, a number of bilingual ethnic minority teachers reported that they were not convinced that their colleagues valued their linguistic skills.

Gaelic-medium education in Scotland

For almost 30 years there has been growing pressure on the Scottish Executive (and its predecessors) to support Gaelic-medium education. This has resulted in the growth of Gaelic playgroups and nurseries, bilingual units in mainstream schools, bilingual schools and, since 1999, all Gaelic schools – not only in the Gaelic heartlands but also in the inner cities of Glasgow and Edinburgh.

As many of the Gaelic-speaking population are geographically distant from the Scottish teacher education institutions, alongside a Gaelic pathway in pre-service courses there have been added part-time routes into teaching and a new flexible course delivered electronically to more remote areas.

The Scottish Executive now collects statistics related to teachers' abilities in and their use of Gaelic. It would also be appropriate to collect data regarding teachers' knowledge and use of the other languages spoken on a daily basis in Scotland.

Positive consideration given to fluency in a language other than English at the recruitment stage would enhance the status of bilingualism as would the provision of modules designed to enable bilingual teachers to use their skills to support the growing numbers of bilingual pupils in Scotland.

4.6 Religion

Introduction

It is not only Christianity which informs the religious and cultural life of Scotland. Scotland is host to a range of religions, typically located in the towns and cities of Scotland, more especially in the urban conurbations of the central belt.

The religious communities are themselves internally diverse. A one-to-one correspondence between country of origin, ethnic background and religious practice can not be assumed. Increasingly, faith communities are viewed by Government as having a positive role to play in public life, on a range of social issues.

For all believers, religion is rooted in ultimate reality, understood by some as personal, others as impersonal. Religions offer their followers a sense of community and inclusion. The converse of this is that religions sometimes reinforce a sense of difference between people, particularly when they make exclusive claims to truth. There can also be a tension, often keenly felt by young people, between individual and communal identity.

It is important that education is able to draw on the insights and wisdom of members of all the religious traditions represented in Scotland. Such varied experience will invigorate the curriculum and enrich the teaching force. It will also serve to demonstrate to young people that education is owned by the whole community.

Concerns about religious representation are part of a wider concern that in the past the teaching force in Scotland has been largely mono-cultural as well as mono-faith. The drive towards widening access is designed to ensure that teaching reflects and draws on the wealth of diverse cultural heritages in Scotland.

What do we know about patterns of recruitment with respect to religion?

The largest religious group is Christian, with Muslims forming the second largest group. There is also a significant minority who claim no religion. The age profile for Buddhism and Christianity is older than the national norm, while for Hinduism and Islam it is younger than the national norm. The religions are in the process of developing relationships with each other by sharing common interests in social and political, as well as educational and spiritual, issues.

Most recent figures from the Scottish Executive (2004) demonstrate that a steady supply of teachers with Roman Catholic approval has been maintained across the age bands. Anecdotal evidence suggests that, apart from Christians, members of the religious communities are not to be found in the teaching force to a level commensurate with their share of the population.

A range of factors affects recruitment to teaching from the religious communities. A major one concerns the Religious Education curriculum with which some groups of teachers may not feel comfortable. Religious observance in schools, whatever the detail of national and local authority guidelines recommends, tends to be 'of a broadly Christian character' where it happens at all.

Because of cultural sensitivities, there are also concerns about social education, health education, sex education, art and physical education. Even teachers who share the prevailing cultural perspectives may find difficulty with aspects of these areas.

Underlying these specific difficulties are the different pedagogies to which religious communities are accustomed. It is no accident that child-centred, critical approaches have

derived from western, secular and Christian traditions, which are both liberal and sceptical and which value the individual above the community.

Denominational and non-denominational schools

The National Guidelines 'Religious and Moral Education 5–14' were produced for use in non-denominational schools. Separate guidelines were produced for use in Roman Catholic schools. At Secondary level, certificate courses are based on documents which are common across denominational and non-denominational sectors.

There is now only one specialist provider of teacher education for the Roman Catholic sector, located in Glasgow University. Although ITE courses at Glasgow University are open to any suitably qualified candidate, there is particular support for and emphasis on the initial education of those who wish to teach in Catholic schools. The Scottish Executive sets separate targets for entry to ITE for the Roman Catholic sector.

Proponents of the Roman Catholic sector believe that there are pressures to restrict Roman Catholic education. This has come about through actual and threatened closures of schools on the grounds of falling rolls, and the provision of joint denominational/non-denominational schools with a shared campus. Non-denominational schools have no brief to promote any denominational belief or practice.

There are pressures to provide state-funded schooling for a broader range of religions, notably Islam. Proponents of such an extension of 'faith schools' believe that the arguments applied to a successful Catholic sector apply equally to the communities of other religions. There are also issues related to the representativeness of new faith schools, and the impact they may have on existing state provision. Such issues ensure that the debate will continue.

What is the current legal situation and what are its implications for education/teaching?

Race Relations legislation requires public authorities actively to promote good relations between people of different racial groups. There are implications for education authorities and schools, with respect to religious as well as racial groups, as they seek to implement the requirement.

New government 'Employment Equality (Religion or Belief) Regulations' of 2003 make it illegal to discriminate directly or indirectly, to harass or victimise anyone in the workplace on the grounds of their religion or lack of it. The legislation applies to all facets of employment including recruitment, terms and conditions, promotions, transfers, dismissals, and training.

The Criminal Justice (Scotland) Bill (2003) creates a requirement for courts to take into account religious or sectarian hatred as an aggravating factor in determining the appropriate sentence for a criminal offence. For the purposes of Section 59A of the Bill, an offence is aggravated by religious prejudice if the offender evinces towards the victim malice and ill-will based on the victim's membership or presumed membership of a religious group. Common law also allows for religious hatred as an aggravating factor to such offences when considering sentence.

Sectionalism is a visible and insidious feature of Scottish religious and civic life, a product of the interplay between cultural, historical, political, religious and territorial factors. Its societal dimension reflects the power structures inherent in social systems and acts as a catalyst for inter-group conflict. It is clearly important that schools take account of the complexities of religious discrimination, individual and societal, as they affect pupils and staff. Education in anti-

discriminatory practice must be embedded in all aspects of the curriculum and at all levels of decision-making.

What are general guidelines for good practice in relation to recruitment and retention?

- It is essential as a first step to commission research on the religious profile of the teaching profession with crossovers to age, gender, geographical distribution, sector and subject area.
- It is essential for employers to adopt codes of practice, which enable all employees to fulfil their religious obligations without in any way diminishing their effectiveness as teachers.
- It is necessary to alter those societal structures, which have the effect of excluding or discouraging certain groups from mainstream public life.
- Such steps as are taken to widen access with respect to the religious communities must be consistent with best recruitment practice and the vision of a plural society.
- Consideration needs to be given to the likely effect on recruitment from the diverse religious communities if there were to be an extension of faith schools.

4.7 Disability

It is true that disabled people represent a potentially significant, largely untapped source of teacher recruitment. But on the grounds of social justice, equal opportunities and inclusion, it is vital that they should not experience the discrimination that prevents their access to the profession.

Disabled pupils need to see that teaching and educational success – and other professional careers – are goals to which they can aspire. And it is important for the community at large to recognise the potentialities which disabled people possess – in order to combat stereotyping, accommodate diversity and counteract the generally low expectations held of disabled people.

One needs to distinguish between the medical model and the social model of disability. The former refers to an impairment which can be subjected to ameliorative treatment or rehabilitation. The latter is concerned with the barriers (physical, intellectual, attitudinal, etc.) within our society, which serve to disable people with impairments.

What do we know about the pattern of recruitment of disabled teachers? How do the patterns vary from country to country and in different employment sectors?

There are considerable difficulties in acquiring robust and reliable data about the overall employment and education patterns of people with disabilities, partly due to the shortcomings and complexities of official data-gathering procedures. A further factor is unwillingness of disclosure, due to possible stigma or damaging effect on career prospects.

The quarterly Labour Force Survey (LFS) estimates that in the UK, approximately 19 per cent of all persons of working age are long-term disabled, of whom 48 per cent are women. It also estimates that 49 per cent of this total population are currently in work. Within this working population of long-term disabled employees some 28 per cent are employed in public administration, education and health.

The National Audit Office (NAO) has cited the recruitment and retention of disabled students as one of the areas in which HE widening participation strategies and practices could be strengthened. In 1999–2000, the intake of full-time higher education students included only 5 per cent who had declared a disability.

In Ireland, 0.9 per cent of first-year university students were registered in 2004 as having a disability.

There is little research on the proportion of teachers with disability. Two figures have been suggested: 0.05 per cent and 1 per cent. In contrast, 4 per cent of Civil Service employees indicate disability.

The Disability Discrimination Act 1995 places a legal duty on employers not to discriminate against disabled people. This includes the duty on employers to make reasonable adjustments to a job or to the workplace so that disabled people are not disadvantaged. 'Reasonable adjustments' refer to all aspects of employment: recruitment, terms and conditions, benefits, promotion, training and development.

What kinds of experiences do disabled students in HE and teachers report?

Concerns about the shortcomings of admissions procedures, job applications and interviews point to the need to provide interview training for admissions staff to ensure that they understand the needs of disabled students and can put reasonable adjustments in place.

The question of attitudes plays a vitally important part in all stages of the careers of disabled people whether in education, training or at work. Where staff attitudes are positive, they appear to be influenced by personal interest in disability issues, rather than institutional training or policies.

Adopting a medical approach to disabled students can have important institutional consequences. Time is expended repeatedly devising interventions. Students with disabilities have to continually explain their needs and face ongoing problems in accessing information.

Specific learning difficulties remain a contested issue for the academic community, and some academics and students view it as a strategy to gain an unfair advantage.

What are the general guidelines for good practice which could be followed for the recruitment of disabled teachers?

- Establishing and maintaining a positive attitude towards disabled people
- Ensuring that an overall policy framework exists, which is embedded in the institutional structure and ethos
- Providing disability equality and awareness training throughout the institution
- Focusing advertising and publicity appropriately and ensuring that recruitment, interviewing and selection procedures are sensitive, transparent and fit for their purpose
- Ensuring that there are clear information, communication and induction procedures for students and teachers
- Providing open discussion contexts for the consideration of working demands, time-tabling, and the physical contexts of teaching/learning
- Ensuring that issues of professional development, progression and promotion are clearly and transparently discussed and negotiated.

4.8 Sexual orientation

Increasingly, a move is being made towards the specification of lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender orientations, or (LGB(T)) as used here.

One estimate suggests that there are roughly 3.5 million lesbian, gay and bisexual people in the UK, approximately 6 per cent of the population. Evidence suggests that colleges and schools are characterised by an atmosphere of homophobia, with bullying and harassment being endemic features.

For society in general, it is important that pupils, their parents/guardians and the wider community recognise LGB(I) people in all walks of life in order to combat stereotyping and celebrate diversities. In schools and colleges diversity policies which help to build ‘cultures of respect’ are likely to complement already existing recruitment and retention strategies.

What do we know about the pattern of recruitment of LGB(T) teachers? How do the patterns vary from country to country and in different employment sectors?

This review was forced to reach the unfortunate conclusion that existing records and databases tell virtually nothing about the employment patterns of LGB(I) people in either the UK, or Scotland more specifically.

A survey of ‘sexual orientation’ found that 95 per cent of respondents regarded themselves as heterosexual, 2 per cent homosexual, 1 per cent bisexual, and a further 0.5 per cent indicated ‘other’. Such data present real difficulties of analysis and generalisation because of the problems associated with disclosure.

Many LGB(I) people are very reluctant to disclose their sexualities because of anxieties about discrimination and harassment. A survey suggested that 64 per cent of lesbians and gay men conceal their sexuality from some or all of their colleagues. Research has shown that LGB people who are out at work are vulnerable to harassment, bullying and discrimination in their careers.

What is the current legal situation and what are its implications for education/teaching?

The Employment Equality (Sexual Orientation) Regulations cover direct and indirect discrimination, harassment and victimisation and apply through both the training and employment aspects of occupations.

Following concern that the Regulations might lead to possible discrimination against LGB(I) teachers in faith schools, the High Court indicated that teachers in faith schools are ‘likely’ to have full protection from discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation.

There are still areas of clarification which remain within the Regulations, however, they do provide a basis upon which it is possible to clarify the educational and occupational situations of LGB(I) students and teachers and will thus form a foundation upon which recruitment and retention policies can be directly constructed.

While quantitative data is thin on the ground, there exists an extensive body of qualitative data on the experiences of LGB(I) students and teachers. Some examples follow.

- In the workplace, harassment, dismissal and refused promotion are reported.
- Many gay and lesbian people report unhappy, stressful school years. If open about their sexuality they suffered homophobic bullying. If not they witnessed the bullying of other children or staff labelled gay or lesbian. Loss of self-esteem was experienced with consequences for later life.
- Teacher educators who identify as gay or lesbian experience vulnerability when students are critical of the inclusion of gay and lesbian issues.

What are the general guidelines for good practice which could be followed for the recruitment of LGB(T) teachers?

- Understand the law
- Make sure your policies and practices comply with the regulations
- Explain the new laws to staff and line managers
- Make the business case for diversity. Robust diversity policies contribute substantially to long-term competitiveness, attract higher skills, motivated employees and loyal customers
- Build a culture of respect in which LGB people can feel safe
- Ensure that recruiters understand fair selection criteria and apply them consistently
- Tackle harassment and bullying
- Review key benefits such as pensions and insurance cover, and ensure your policies explicitly state that benefits such as parental leave, relocation allowances and travel benefits are available to same-sex partners or nominees of the employee's choice
- Ensure that all decisions are based only on merit and competence
- Monitor and evaluate your policies and practices.

4.9 Age

Young teachers bring new ideas and greater energy, while older teachers offer wisdom and experience. A school with a disproportionately large number of older teachers faces a challenge in recruiting new staff. A school with a disproportionately large number of younger teachers finds difficulty in filling senior posts and posts of responsibility.

Age does not directly correlate to teaching experience or length of service, but often does correspond. Teachers who have gained more experience are closer to the end of their careers. But people may enter or leave teaching at any age. Many women leave during their 20s and 30s; many return in their late 30s and 40s.

What do we know about the age profile of the profession and the age pattern of teacher recruitment?

A 2003 survey established that the mean age of teachers is 44; that 11 per cent are 55 or over; that there is a huge 'bulge' in the workforce in the late 40s/early 50s, but a 'flat profile' among younger groups. Well under 15 per cent of teachers are under 30.

The census report also shows how this bulge in older teachers has itself reduced in size as older teachers have left the workforce over the previous 5 years. This decline has been less severe in Secondary schools than in Primary.

The age profile of Special schoolteachers has an even more pronounced peak than Primary or Secondary, with it being normal to expect considerable experience of mainstream schools before taking up a special school post.

The age profile of those entering teaching in Scotland through ITE has typically been predominantly from those in their early to mid-20s, although with the average age of males being higher than that of females

At present, there is no UK (or Scottish) legislation covering discrimination on the basis of age. The European Union is developing a directive, which will prevent employers from rejecting applicants on the basis of their age. The UK government is considering raising the normal

retirement age to 70. The impact of these changes is difficult to predict in a profession often felt to be particularly demanding of energy and emotion.

Research has shown that young teachers, male teachers and minority ethnic teachers are more likely to regard being young as a positive career influence. Older teachers, both male and female, regard their age as a negative career influence.

Much could be done to increase the proportion of people who return to teaching in their 30s and 40s, including:

- facilitating job sharing and other part-time working
- maintaining relationship with former teachers
- identifying potential returners
- using Fast track to target returners
- building confidence among potential returners
- increase distance-learning courses.

Employers should carefully monitor younger teachers in the early stages of their career to ensure that support systems are in place to keep good teachers in the profession. Older teachers may wish to move to a post with fewer responsibilities or to part-time work. Retired teachers may be interested in temporary or supply work.

4.10 Conclusions

The following broad elements of practice relate to each of the eight dimensions discussed in this Section:

- systematic monitoring
- positive and appropriate promotion of teaching as a career
- provision of personal and professional support
- flexibility in employment arrangements
- fair employment procedures
- systems for tackling bullying or harassment.

5 The teacher's career cycle: implications of the review

5.1 Introduction

This Section relates the foregoing discussion of eight dimensions of representation to the teacher's career cycle with a view to identifying aspects of comprehensive policy.

5.2 Phases of the teacher life cycle

The identification of discrete stages in the process of 'becoming and being a teacher' carries a number of advantages:

- It recognises that each stage is a point at which some may be lost to the profession while others move forward.

- With a view to representativeness, it aids the identification of the stages that raise particular problems for specific groups and cohorts of students/trainees.
- It provides a basis for institutional audits to identify practices and procedures needing to be strengthened.
- It enables institutions to spell out the responsibilities and reporting mechanisms for individuals, groups and committees.
- It facilitates processes of record-keeping and monitoring to identify which groups may need to be the focus of particular institutional energy.

Routes into teaching

The typical route into teaching remains Higher Education, undergraduate or postgraduate. In England, alternative routes have been developed, with a view to increasing supply but sometimes with claims about diversifying the workforce. Examples are the Open University, the Overseas Trained Teacher, Fast-track and Teach First.

In Scotland, the exceptional entry process for admission to the Register has provided something broadly equivalent. Teachers with overseas qualification are able to use this approach. The most successful cases are people who have qualified in other parts of the UK, but a growing number of teachers from elsewhere are now joining the profession.

Application and interview procedures for entry to ITE

All matters relating to application and interview procedures (including the structure of the application, its processing, selection for interview, interview procedures and protocols, criteria for selection or rejection of candidates) require specific statements of values and intentions as well as professional development and training for personnel.

The definition of admission requirements is a crucial element in establishing any profession. If there is any sense in which either a requirement or a process through which applicants are assessed unwittingly discourages certain sections of the community from applying for teaching it is clearly problematic and might be judged discriminatory.

Course experiences

Data are needed to determine whether there are disproportionate patterns of non take-up from particular demographic groups and why this might be so.

Concerns are being raised about retention and successful course completion rates. Research indicates that some male students find a predominantly female environment difficult. Black students may experience isolation and racism. Students have identified ethnicity, religion, language and friendship as having a bearing on isolation.

Reference has been made to the importance of curriculum issues and assessment procedures in the development and adaptation of institutional procedures with respect to widening access. Of particular concern are the practical or school experience elements of courses which raise very particular and stressful problems for some trainees.

Moving into employment; career development

There is debate as to whether years of experience as a parent, childminder, playgroup leader, or in business and industry, are recognised as positive features in initial applications for posts.

While the induction year should provide teachers with guaranteed support, it can prove to be a variable experience. HEIs, the schools themselves, the Scottish Executive Education Department

(SEED), local authorities, unions and the GTC Scotland all have roles to play in ensuring that people receive adequate guidance and support as they make their transitions into teaching.

A significant number of teachers leave during the first 5 years. As there are relatively few young teachers in the workforce, it is crucial that those who are there – especially those from under-represented groups – are supported in ways which retain them in the profession and support their development into experienced teachers.

Early professional development is receiving increasing attention in Scotland through the GTC Scotland and the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC). Similarly, the Chartered Teacher programme is an avenue appealing to teachers who are averse to career development and/or promotion through a management and leadership route.

The patterns of promotion and entry for advanced qualifications (Standard for Headship, Chartered Teacher) do not exhibit proportional recruitment in terms of gender. It is a major concern to ensure that a proportionate number of women achieve promotion through both pathways and it is urgent that monitoring is developed in relation to the other dimensions of representativeness.

Towards the end of teachers' careers much more could be done to facilitate a gradual winding down and to retain some of the most experienced teachers as they approach full retirement.

5.3 Conclusion

In too many cases, stated policies for widening access/participation have foundered because no resources or commitment have been invested in keeping track of the translation of policy into actuality nor have adequate procedures been established to ensure that cases which cause concern can be reviewed. The identification of critical stages in the career process enables the development of precise monitoring and review procedures.

6 Recommendations

This review concludes with the following broad recommendations for the GTC Scotland and other interested stakeholders.

The Council should review its work in promoting teaching as a profession.

The Council should consider establishing a reference group to promote the interests of groups experiencing discrimination or disadvantage in the community and in the profession.

The Council should review the extent to which its own register along with the SEED census provides a basis for monitoring the composition of the teaching workforce in all eight dimensions of representativeness herein discussed.

The Council should review its own employment procedures in order to ensure that it is setting an example of good practice.

The Council should review all of its key procedures, such as registration of teachers, accreditation of ITE programmes, registration of Continuing Professional Development (CPD) providers, with a view to representativeness.

There should be a major review of entry requirements, routes into teaching and the development of flexible approaches in these areas.

The Council should consider how best to promote and encourage the development of professional development for its own staff and others in the education workforce, in terms of equal opportunities and anti-discrimination.

The Council should encourage further research into under-explored aspects of widening access into teaching. The lack of data relating to disability, sexuality, social class, bilingualism and religion requires particular attention.

The Main Review covers these points further and provides a considerable amount of statistical detail within its Figures and Tables. The document also includes the list of references reviewed.