



Teacher Researcher Programme 2003/2004

The Role of the Duke of Edinburgh's Award in the Promotion and Development of Citizenship

Donald Smith
Western Isles

gtc
SCOTLAND

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writing of this Teacher Researcher Scholarship would not have been possible without the support and assistance of a number of people. The help provided by those listed below is gratefully appreciated.

The General Teaching Council Scotland for the opportunity to be part of the first ever Teacher Researcher Scholarships

The Headteachers below for permission to use their schools as case studies and for agreeing to be interviewed as part of the research.

- Mr Robert Fawkes, Headteacher, Park Mains High School
- Mr J. G. Knowles, Rector, Hutchesons' Grammar School
- Mr Jean-Guy Carpentier, Campus Principal, International School, Geneva

The teachers below for making the arrangements to visit their schools and agreeing to be interviewed as part of the research.

- Mr Ian Armour, PT of PE, Park Mains High School
- Mr Brian Donaldson, PT of Geography, Hutchesons' Grammar School
- Dr John Pollatschek, International School, Geneva

All the pupils who agreed to be interviewed as part of the research.

Mrs Christine Pollatschek for her wonderful hospitality during my stay in Geneva

Dr Dean Robson, Research Fellow, General Teaching Council Scotland for his advice and support throughout the research

The Headteachers of my own schools who willingly gave me leave of absence to undertake the research

THE ROLE OF THE DUKE OF EDINBURGH'S AWARD
IN THE PROMOTION AND DEVELOPMENT OF CITIZENSHIP

SYNOPSIS

This study sets out to explore whether teachers and pupils regard participation in the Duke of Edinburgh's Award (Award) as an appropriate vehicle for the development of citizenship. In particular, the study aims to find answers to three main questions:

- (1) How is the Award organised and managed within schools?
- (2) Does participating in the Award help to develop the personal skills and qualities associated with citizenship education?
- (3) Does participating in the Award encourage active citizenship?

The concept of citizenship education is discussed around the key issues which have arisen as a result of continuing concern from successive governments about the relationship between education, the economy and society. An analysis of how citizenship education is to be implemented in schools is provided along with an overview of the role which the Award can make to the development of personal and social education.

A case study was conducted involving three schools from different educational backgrounds that were actively participating in the Award. Teachers and pupils were interviewed about their perceptions of the contribution which the Award made to citizenship education. The findings show that teachers and pupils viewed participation in the Award as an appropriate vehicle for the development of citizenship education. These findings are discussed and recommendations for future research are presented.

CONTENTS

Page No. (s)

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1	Background	1
-----	------------	---

Chapter Two: Key Issues and Literature Review

2.1	Historical Perspective	4
2.2	Definition	5
2.3	Political, Social and Economic Factors	6
2.4	Citizenship Education in England and Wales	8
2.5	Citizenship Education in Scotland	10
2.6	Duke of Edinburgh's Award	12

Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology

3.1	Aim of Study	14
3.2	Sample	14
	3.2.1 Selection of Subjects	15
3.3	Methods	15
	3.3.1 Research Questions	15
	3.3.2 Data Collection	16
	3.3.3 Questionnaire	16
	3.3.4 Administration of Survey	17
	3.3.5 Analysis of Data	17
	3.3.6 Semi-Structured Interviews	17
	3.3.7 School Visits	19

Chapter Four: Research Results

	<u>Page No. (s)</u>	
4.1	Questionnaire	20
4.1.1	Information on Schools	20
4.1.2	Organisation and Management of Award	20
4.2	Semi-Structured Interviews	23
4.2.1	How the Award is Organised and Managed within Schools	23
4.2.2	The Role of the Award in Developing Personal Skills and Qualities	27
4.2.3	The Role of the Award in Developing Leadership Skills	29
4.2.4	The Role of the Award in Promoting Active Citizenship	30

Chapter Five: Discussion

5.1	Overview of Study	33
5.2	How is the Award Organised and Managed within Schools?	33
5.3	Does Participating in the Award help to Develop Personal Skills and Qualities?	35
5.4	Does Participating in the Award Encourage Active Citizenship?	36
5.5	Conclusions and Implications for Future Research	37

References		39-43
-------------------	--	-------

Appendix	Questionnaire	44-50
-----------------	---------------	-------

Appendix 2	Interview Schedules	51-52
-------------------	---------------------	-------

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

My interest in applying for a Teacher Researcher Scholarship was stimulated by my previous involvement in educational research and the underlying belief that teachers should endeavour to promote the concept of the extended professional, by being involved in professional self-development through systematic self-study (1). In accordance with the views of Sachs (2) who suggests that the primary aim of school-based teacher enquiry is with understanding and improving practice, I viewed the Teacher Researcher programme as providing the opportunity to explore an aspect of educational practice which was of particular interest to me as a practising teacher. I also recognised the potential which a Research Scholarship offered to ‘contribute to the professional development of colleagues and the educational effectiveness of the school and the wider community’ (3), through raising awareness and stimulating debate which might lead to improvements in educational practice.

Having taught physical education and been involved professionally in the development of sport within my own authority for over twenty years, I strongly believe that extra curricular activities have a significant role to play in the educational and personal well being of pupils and staff. Commonly referred to as the ‘hidden curriculum’, the contribution, which the less formal aspects of schooling can make to the development of a positive ethos within schools, is well documented (Stenhouse (4); Hargreaves (5)). Recently, the profile of the hidden curriculum within schools has been heightened as a result of the introduction of ‘Values and Citizenship’ as one of the five National Priorities in Education, introduced by the Scottish Parliament in December 2000. Its inclusion alongside ‘Achievement and Attainment’, ‘Framework for Learning’, ‘Inclusion and Equality’ and ‘Learning for Life’

has focussed attention on how schools promote and develop the skills of citizenship, both within the school and the wider community.

The basis for the introduction of citizenship education in Scotland is set out in the document ‘Education for Citizenship in Scotland: A Paper for Discussion and Development’ (6) which defines the broad aim of citizenship as:

“ encouraging schools to work with parents to teach pupils respect for self and one another and their independence with other members of their neighbourhood and society and teach them the duties and responsibilities of citizenship in a democratic society ”

In light of the uncertainty about what exactly education for citizenship is and how it is to be delivered within schools, my attention was drawn to the way in which citizenship is analysed in terms of four related aspects: knowledge and understanding; skills and competencies; values and dispositions; and creativity and enterprise (7). Of particular interest was the emphasis that is placed on the importance of developing ‘generic skills’ along with various personal qualities such as self-esteem, confidence, initiative, determination and emotional maturity, and the recognition that *“effective education for citizenship is a key part of the responsibility of every teacher”*(8) and *“ should be fostered in ways that motivate young people to be active and responsible members of their communities”* (9).

Unlike England, where Citizenship Education has been labelled as a new subject within the curriculum, there is no prescriptive approach to the development of citizenship in Scotland.

Instead, schools are encouraged to take the view that:

“ citizenship can be secured through combinations of learning experiences set in the daily life of the school, discrete areas of the curriculum, cross-curricular experiences and activities involving links with the local community” (10).

Whilst, by its nature, the concept of citizenship consists of a range of factors and qualities, it is clear that there are many different activities that can contribute to the overall development of citizenship education. From my experience, however, there are some activities that are particularly well suited to promoting the personal skills and qualities which are viewed as an essential element of citizenship education. One of these activities is the Duke of Edinburgh's Award (Award), which offers young people the opportunity to develop their personal and leadership skills and take an active part in community service. Having been responsible for the delivery of the Award programme in my own school, I believe there are close parallels between the educational experiences which can be provided as part of the Award, and aspects of the learning outcomes associated with citizenship education. This leads me to suggest that, in view of the recognised difficulties surrounding how best to teach citizenship, schools should consider introducing activities such as the Award, which offers a relevant context for the development of personal skills and the promotion of active service. This study, therefore, sets out to examine whether teachers and pupils engaged in the Award view their involvement as a useful way of developing the personal skills and qualities which are regarded as an essential aspect of citizenship education.

In order to place the discussion in context, sections 2.1-2.5 explores some of the key issues, which have surrounded the introduction of citizenship education, along with a review of some of the key educational reforms which have led to the calls for citizenship education to be taught in both primary and secondary schools. A brief analysis of the implications of citizenship education for those involved in its delivery will be examined, including the role which activities such as the Award can play in the personal and social development of pupils.

CHAPTER TWO

KEY ISSUES AND LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Historical Perspective

Although the demands for the introduction of citizenship education in schools have increased over the past few years, there is ample evidence that citizenship education itself is not a new phenomenon (11). In the early Greek states and Roman republic it was closely associated with involvement in public affairs by those who had the rights of citizens, to take part in public debate and, directly or indirectly, shape the laws and decisions of a state (12). It has also featured prominently in a number of key educational reforms during the last two centuries. Aldrich (13) noted that the Education Acts of 1870, 1902 and 1944 all promoted the desire to extend a reasonable quality of life to all. Stenhouse (14) reports that from the 1960's onwards, there have been a number of progressive curricular initiatives in England such as the Schools Councils Humanities project, which contributed to the promotion of citizenship by engaging pupils in debate about such issues as poverty, race, education and war. The Education Reform Act (1988) also promoted citizenship and:

“ required a balanced and broadly based curriculum which promotes the spiritual, moral, cultural, mental and physical development of pupils...and prepares such pupils for the opportunities, responsibilities and experiences of adult life” (15)

The most recent educational reform, which recommended that citizenship education be given enhanced status within schools, was the publication of a 1997 White Paper, Excellence in Schools (16), which was introduced with the aim of strengthening education for citizenship and the teaching of democracy in schools. Whilst the findings of this report were devoted to the education system in England and Wales, and resulted in citizenship

education being introduced as a statutory entitlement in the curriculum, it can nevertheless be seen as the precursor to the introduction of citizenship education in Scotland.

2.2 Definition

A review of the literature on citizenship education reveals that one of the inherent difficulties in dealing with the concept of citizenship is the problem of definition.

According to Stonefrost (17), trying to pin down the definition as the only one, and real one, of citizenship is, in itself, a political activity because it brings into play a more general normative or ideological commitment within which an idea of citizenship sits as part. This leads Demaine and Entwistle (18) and others (Heater (19); Coare and Johnston (20); Lister (21)) to suggest that citizenship is essentially a contested concept with significantly different meanings for disparate individuals and groups, which makes it difficult to know how it should be implemented within schools. Evidence to support this claim (Davies and Evans (22); Chamberlain (23)) highlights that those currently engaged in citizenship education in a variety of roles reveal a wide variation of understanding about citizenship and preferences for particular types of citizenship education. A number of definitions of citizenship have been put forward. Jerome (24) suggests that citizenship education is about providing opportunities for young people to develop the necessary skills for participation and responsible action. Others such as Cathy Jamieson, the former Minister for Education and Young People in the Scottish Executive, point to the wider responsibilities of citizenship education and suggest that its prime role is to:

“ educate young people in ways that prepare them for living effectively and responsibly as members of local, national and global communities”

(25)

Although the definition of citizenship is problematic, a useful way of trying to understand its relevance is to consider the social, economic and political context within which the recent interest in citizenship education has emerged.

2.3 Political, Social and Economic Factors

As with all educational reforms, the increasing demands for citizenship education have come about as a result of continuing concern from successive governments about the relationship between education, the economy and society. Writers such as Lawson (26) and Loxley and Thomas (27) suggest that citizenship is best understood to be a conditional relationship between rights and responsibilities and the desire on behalf of the government to create an all inclusive society. Kerr (28) lends support to this theory and contrasts the different approaches to citizenship taken by Conservative and Labour governments. The former, he claims was based on the rights and responsibilities of the individual over those of the state, whilst the latter have promoted an approach to citizenship centred on the communitarian rhetoric of ‘community’-what has commonly been referred to as the ‘Third Way’ (Giddens (29)). Deuchar (30), in an interesting paper on ‘The Challenges for Citizenship Education for Scottish Pupils and Teachers’, discusses this issue more widely and suggests that a communitarian approach based on citizenship as ‘an obligation’ is an attempt to create a route between old socialist ideals with more recent neo-liberal individualism, which serves to unite a commitment to equality and inclusion with individual autonomy.

Whilst the demands for citizenship education can be set against the backdrop of the United Nations Convention of the Rights of the Child (31), evidence suggests that there are other reasons for its revival. These include the desire to combat political apathy; tackle rising levels of anti-social behaviour within communities; and the weakening of community values (Potter, 1999 (32); Humes (33)). The introduction of the Crick Report reflected these

concerns and summarised education for citizenship as being three things that would be mutually dependent on each other: social and moral responsibility, community involvement and political literacy (34). The political overtones of citizenship education within this report were not disguised and were stated categorically:

“ we aim at no less than a change in the political culture of this country, both nationally and locally: for people to think of themselves as active citizens, willing, able and equipped to have an influence in public life and with the critical capacities to weigh evidence before speaking and acting; to build on and to extend radically to young people the best in existing traditions of community involvement and public service, and to make them individually confident in finding new forms of involvement and action among themselves”

(35)

One of the consequences of the introduction of citizenship education is that it has caused people to re-examine the whole nature of education and exactly what our education system should be trying to develop in young people. Writers such as Best (36), Osler and Starkey (37) and Levin (38) have called into question the desirability of a politically motivated curriculum and suggest that the democratic ideas promoted by citizenship cannot be developed in the authoritarian structure of schools. Others such as Smith (39), however, point out, that the curriculum does not develop in a vacuum but is socially and historically located and culturally determined and as such will always be viewed as a tool for political or ideological purposes.

If defining citizenship in a meaningful way is difficult, then it follows that the translation of policy into practice will also be problematic. It is useful, therefore, to consider briefly how citizenship education has been implemented within schools and the impact which it has had on those who are responsible for its delivery. In view of limited research and the fact that

citizenship education is still in its infancy, it is appropriate to look, firstly, at how things have developed in England and Wales, and, secondly, the situation in Scotland, where it remains a non-statutory area of the curriculum.

2.4 Citizenship Education in England and Wales

As reported earlier, the importance of citizenship education was such that it was made a statutory requirement of schools in England and Wales to ensure that it is an entitlement of all pupils. The reasons for it being made a statutory subject may well be due to three main issues. Firstly, attempts by policy makers to introduce citizenship education in the past are reported to have floundered because of lack of consensus on definition and approval (Davies and Evans (40)). Secondly, Heater (41) points out that previous attempts to deliver citizenship were fraught with problems due to the lack of commitment from teachers, which was largely due to there being no great tradition of explicit teaching of citizenship. Thirdly, the lack of a solid research base to determine judgements about the effectiveness of practice resulted in there being no consistent framework in which to frame discussion and take the debate forward (42).

Following the publication of the Crick Report, Citizenship Education in England became a foundation subject for pupils aged 11-16 and part of a non-statutory framework alongside personal, social and health education (PSHE) for pupils from age 5 to 11 (43). In a paper entitled 'The Making of Citizenship in the National Curriculum (England): Issues and Challenges', Kerr (44) provides a detailed account of the way in which citizenship education was introduced. The three key issues which emerged within the Advisory Group on Citizenship Education related to: definition, status and curriculum time, and appropriate assessment and inspection arrangements. Although it was recognised that aspects of citizenship education already existed in many schools it was decided to allocate 5% of curriculum time to the new subject. How this time was to be distributed, however, was left

to individual schools to decide. Whilst the scope for citizenship education was broad based and could combine elements from across different subject areas, it was organised around a series of learning outcomes, which were to be supported by a broad range of teaching and learning approaches. The mainstay of these approaches were opportunities for pupils to be involved in discussion and debate on topical and contemporary issues, along with the chance to learn through action in case studies, projects and activities in school and the community.

As the report made clear (45):

“ it is difficult to conceive of pupils as active citizens if their experiences of learning in citizenship education has been a particularly passive one”

The emphasis placed on ‘civic activism’ within the Crick Report is apparent and is regarded by some as an attempt to develop a mindset which will lead to young people taking responsibility, exercise initiative and challenge established practices (46). In support of this view, Best (47) reports that much of the emphasis on citizenship education is directed at encouraging participation in environmental projects and wider community activities.

Whilst the decision about how to deliver citizenship education continues to be a source of debate, it is not helped by the fact that the long-term benefits are, as yet, difficult to evaluate, due to a lack of well-designed studies in this area.

Data gathered from a number of small-scale studies, however, have generally reported positive support for citizenship education. A study by Davies and Evans (48), which aimed to illuminate a number of key issues about citizenship education in secondary schools in one local education authority, highlighted the different areas in which it was being delivered. These included: Personal and Social Development (PSD) activities; community activities; relationships between people in schools (ethos) and special opportunities outside school.

Despite an increase in commercially produced materials, it was reported, however, that there was no consensus about the right way for teachers to proceed.

A similar study undertaken by Johnson and Holness (49) into the criteria used by student teachers (ten in total) in their choice of teaching and learning strategies, also found that there were divisions about how best to teach citizenship. They also reported concerns about how it would fit into the curriculum; the effect of their own political persuasions on practice; how it was to be resourced and how it would be assessed.

In another small-scale study, Lawson (50) was interested in finding out what effect the process of participating in community work had on pupils. Using a qualitative approach, Lawson visited three schools and interviewed Citizenship Education Co-ordinators, Citizenship Education Providers and school pupils about their involvement with outside groups. Activities which pupils were involved in included working with the disabled, technology projects and the DOE Award. Her findings showed that there are many reasons for schools and pupils becoming involved in community work. Although she reported that the skills gained through working in the community can be applied to other contexts, she also suggested that being involved in community work did not necessarily lead to a change of attitude from individualist to collectivist, nor did it necessarily lead to pupils continuing their involvement once the experience was over.

Given that all three studies were small-scale, uncontrolled and largely subjective in nature it is clear, however, that an interpretation of the results will need to be treated with caution.

2.5 Citizenship Education in Scotland

In contrast to the situation in England, the development of citizenship education in Scotland was introduced as a discussion document by Learning and Teaching Scotland (51) with the aim of providing a framework for use by schools to evaluate the extent and quality of provision for education for citizenship. This paper set out the position of the Advisory

Council of LT Scotland and recommended actions that should be taken to ensure that important principles are turned into effective practice.

The justification for its inclusion within schools followed the same lines as that reported in the Crick Report and highlighted the need to empower young people to participate thoughtfully and responsibly in community and civic life through:

“approaches to all aspects of education for citizenship in the classroom, or in the wider life of the school or community (which) should be informed by the awareness that citizenship is best learnt through experience and interaction with others” (52)

Similar to the approach taken in England, capability for citizenship in Scotland has been analysed in terms of a set of broad categories of learning outcomes. These relate to: knowledge and understanding; skills and competencies; values and dispositions and creativity and enterprise. Although there is no prescriptive approach to the delivery of citizenship education in schools, an analysis of the National Priorities in Education Performance Report 2003 (53) notes that schools generally regard programmes to promote values and citizenship as high priorities. Whilst it is clear that different learning outcomes can be addressed in a range of different ways, the fact that the two quality indicators which H M Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) (54) expect schools to report on, and which relate to Values and Citizenship are: (a) The personal and social development of pupils, and (b) What schools thought about their relationships with parents, strongly suggests that one of the main functions of citizenship education is to promote the development of personal qualities and dispositions. This is supported by findings from the Performance Report, which highlights the various approaches taken by schools in the promotion of pupils personal and social education, including the contribution made by extra-curricular activities in the development of personal and social skills. Mention is also made of the opportunities, which schools provide to pupils to work with others within the day-to-day operation of the

school and in the wider community and which are regarded as being inextricably linked to other National Priorities such as ‘Framework for Learning’ and ‘Achievement and Attainment’. One of the activities which is provided as an example is the DOE Award which is regarded by a number of authors as being particularly appropriate for personal and social development (Cooper (55);Keighley (56)).

2.6 Duke of Edinburgh’s Award

Several writers have highlighted the experiential dimension of citizenship as being a crucial aspect of citizenship education and view it as necessary to ensure genuine participation. (Maitles (57); Rafferty (58); Dobie and MacBeath (59). Rather than generate curriculum content that reinforces passivity, projects such as the Award are seen as providing opportunities for active engagement, which are perceived by young people as purposeful and personally relevant. Interestingly, one of the case studies provided by Learning and Teaching Scotland to illustrate how citizenship education can be addressed is linked to an Outward Bound course developed by Bellshill Academy. This course aims to build on experiences gained in outdoor activities, and reports that students appreciate the transferability of skills gained through outdoor activities, for use within the community and in their lives beyond school (60).

The value of outdoor activities in enhancing personal and social development is supported by a number of studies (Ewert (61); Gibbs and Bunyan (62)). A small-scale study by Hopkins (63) found that for many young people, the completion of a DOE Award expedition was found to be one of the greatest challenges of their lives and brought about positive changes in their self-esteem.

What is particularly interesting about the Award in relation to the delivery of citizenship education is the way in which it is structured. Similar to the learning outcomes identified for citizenship education, the Award programme requires participants to actively participate

in four distinct areas. These are: Skills, Physical Recreation, Service and Expedition.

Achievement is based on personal improvement and development within each of the three levels (Bronze, Silver and Gold) and is recorded using a record book acquired on enrolment.

Underpinning the Award is the development of personal skills and attitudes and the importance of working as part of a team. Two particular sections of the Award: Expedition and Service would appear to be ideally suited to the development of citizenship skills, in view of the opportunities which such activities provide for the development of personal skills and for promoting active involvement in the community.

Given the importance, which has been placed on the development of personal qualities and dispositions as an aspect of education for citizenship, this study seeks to explore whether teachers and pupils regard participation in the Award as contributing to the development of citizenship.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 Aim of Study

As indicated in the previous section, the purpose of this investigation was to explore whether teachers and pupils regard participation in the Award as an appropriate method for the development of citizenship education.

Whilst many factors such as parents, youth leaders, sports coaches, politicians and others can influence citizenship education, this study will focus on the attitudes of teachers and pupils as it is around them that many of the issues concerning the promotion and development of citizenship will relate.

The decision to focus the investigation on the contribution which the Award makes to the development of citizenship was made following a review of the literature which highlighted two central issues relating to the development of citizenship education. Firstly, that education for citizenship involves developing a range of generic skills along with various personal qualities such as self-esteem, confidence, initiative, determination and emotional maturity; and, secondly, that the citizenship that formal education should be seeking to promote should be 'active', in the sense of people being able to act and participate in various communities, wherever it seems to them desirable to do so (64).

3.2 Sample

As the aim of the research was to improve practice, it was considered appropriate to use research techniques from the within the 'action research' paradigm. Consequently, a case study approach was adopted which Blaxter et al (65) claim is ideally suited to the needs of the small-scale researcher and is often used to indicate good practice.

The sampling unit chosen for the investigation was three schools that were known to be involved in the delivery of good practice in the Award. As the Award is recognised for its

inclusiveness, it was decided to include within the study a state school, a private school and an international school.

Following personal contact to outline the research proposal, three schools agreed to take part in the study:

- Park Mains High School, East Renfrewshire
- Hutchesons' Grammar School, Glasgow
- The International School, Geneva

In view of the fact that the schools invited to participate in the study were selected on the basis of good practice, it is recognised that this may lead to accusations of bias on the part of the researcher. It was regarded as important, however, that participating schools provided the opportunity to a cross section of pupils between the ages of 14-18 years to undertake the Award.

3.2.1 Selection of Subjects

In each of the three schools the following were invited to take a part in a semi-structured interview with the researcher:

- The Headteacher or member of the SMT
- The teacher with responsibility for overseeing the Award
- A focus group of 6-10 pupils who were actively involved in the Award

3.3 Methods

3.3.1 Research Questions

As this was a small-scale study, the research focussed on three specific questions:

- (1) How is the Award organised and managed within each school?
- (2) Does participating in the Award help to develop personal skills and qualities?
- (3) Does participating in the Award encourage active citizenship?

3.3.2 Data Collection

Having identified the objectives for the investigation and the research strategy, the next step was to decide on an appropriate method for the collection of data relevant to the three research questions. For a part-time researcher involved in a full-time post, it was important that, whatever strategy was adopted, it should be both realistic and feasible. In this sense, the advice offered by Munn and Drever (66) that:

“ it is always better to go for a small-scale project which can be completed than an over-ambitious design which falls because of pressure of work”

was carefully considered. As the investigation was concerned with exploring pupils and teachers' attitudes, it was felt that a single research approach, such as a questionnaire, would not have provided sufficient insight into the issues to be explored.

Two appropriate methods for collecting data for the proposed investigation identified by Herbert (67) were the use of a questionnaire and interviewing the people concerned. Each of these methods was considered appropriate for use in this study.

The investigation, therefore, can best be considered as two separate phases:

Phase 1 - a quantitative survey by questionnaire

Phase 2 - a qualitative survey using semi-structured interviews

3.3.3 Questionnaire

The principal purpose of the questionnaire was to gather descriptive information regarding how the Award was organised, managed and promoted within each school. This information was regarded as important as it provided a context within which the findings of the research could be placed.

The structure and content of the questionnaire was devised in line with advice offered by Stone (68).

The questionnaire consisted of five small sections:

Sections 1-3 used a close-ended approach and sought factual information on such things as the size of the school, how the Award was organised and activities which pupils were engaged in.

Sections 4 and 5 aimed to gather information on how achievement was recognised within each school and whether it was viewed as a valuable activity for promoting citizenship education. Both these sections consisted of an open-ended question, which would allow the respondent to comment freely on it.

The questionnaire was piloted with a teaching colleague who had a good working knowledge of the Award, in order to check that questions were appropriate and unambiguous. There was only one small change to the questionnaire, following this process.

3.3.4 Administration of Survey

The questionnaires were sent to the teacher with responsibility for the organisation of the Award within each school approximately one month prior to visiting the school.

Completed questionnaires were returned within two weeks, which enabled an analysis of the findings prior to the visits to each school.

A copy of the questionnaire is included in appendix 1.

3.3.5 Analysis of Data

Information gathered from the questionnaires was analysed through looking at the similarities and differences in responses that emerged.

3.3.6 Semi-Structured Interviews

As the research was exploratory in nature and sought to find out whether teachers and pupils regarded participation in the Award as an ideal vehicle for teaching citizenship, an appropriate method for collecting qualitative information was the use of interviews.

It was decided to use a semi-structured interview approach, in which questions were framed around general subject areas, but which allowed respondents to speak openly about the questions asked. In order to set the research in context the first part of the interview was devoted to questions about the organisation of the Award within the school. In the second part, questions were related to three key areas which had been identified within the literature review as being closely related to the development of citizenship. These were:

- (1) The role of the Award in developing personal skills and qualities associated with citizenship
- (2) The role of the Award in developing leadership skills
- (3) The role of the Award in promoting 'active citizenship'

In all three schools semi-structured interviews were undertaken with:

- The Headteacher or member of the Senior Management Team
- The teacher with responsibility of the organisation and management of the Award
- Focus groups, consisting of a minimum of six pupils

The interviews lasted for approximately 45-60 minutes each. Interviews with members of staff were recorded in note form and transcribed immediately after. The use of focus groups to interview pupils offered the opportunity to speak to a number of pupils at one time and to use the interaction within the group as a source of insight. Following permission from the pupils involved, the interviews were taped in order that they might be transcribed and analysed later. This was regarded as important as it allowed the researcher to concentrate on the interview rather than worrying about note taking, which could be off-putting for those being interviewed. Information gathered from the interviews with teachers and pupils was analysed through looking for common themes and similarities and differences in responses that emerged.

3.3.7 School Visits

Due to the limited time-scale for the study, it was not conceivable that a large number of interviews with teachers and pupils could be conducted within each school. The author recognises the limitations of this and acknowledges that any conclusions must therefore be treated with caution.

Visits to schools were arranged at times convenient to each school. The visit to the International School in Geneva took place in early October and lasted for five days. This allowed the researcher the opportunity to speak to a greater number of pupils and staff, both formally and informally, and to view aspects of teaching and learning in relation to the wider school curriculum. The visits to Hutchesons' Grammar School and Park Mains High School were undertaken in November and were completed over two days.

The semi-structured interview schedules were piloted with a teacher and a small group of pupils not involved in the study and no modifications were found to be necessary. The piloting exercise was found to be useful and enabled the researcher to become familiar with the interview schedules and to identify strengths and weaknesses of the questions.

Copies of the interview schedules are included in appendix 2.

As the success of the interviews were recognised as being dependent upon the expertise of the interviewer it was decided to interview pupils in a relaxed setting such as the school social area.

A summary of the main findings are presented in sections 4.1.1-4.2.4.

CHAPTER FOUR

RESEARCH RESULTS

This section contains a description and summary of the main findings of the investigation.

4.1 Questionnaire

The purpose of the questionnaire was to gather descriptive information regarding how the Award was organised, managed and promoted within each school.

4.1.1 Information on Schools

Each of the schools involved in the study came from a different educational background and represented the state sector, the private sector and the international sector.

In all schools the pupil role exceeded 1000 with a fairly even split between boys and girls.

The number of teachers in each school ranged from 95 to 175. The breakdown of male and female teachers also varied between schools. In one school the ratio of male to female teachers was 1:2, whilst in another this ratio was reversed.

4.1.2 Organisation and Management of the Award

In both the state school and the private school the Award had been operating for over five years, whereas in the international school it had been running for two years.

The presentation of pupils for different sections of the Award varied between schools. The state school offered the programme to pupils at Bronze, Silver and Gold levels; the private school at Silver and Gold levels; and the international school at Bronze and Silver levels.

The total number of pupils involved in each school ranged from 116 to 206.

In the private school the ratio of boys to girls was evenly split, whilst in the state and international schools there were a greater number of girls participating than boys.

In all schools a designated member of the teaching staff was responsible for the organisation and management of the Award. The number of teaching staff involved in the programme within schools ranged from 5 to 25. In addition to teachers, all schools reported that others

such as parents, community education workers and outdoor instructors were also involved in delivering aspects relating to the expedition and extra curricular activities.

The number of subject departments involved varied between schools. In the international school two departments were reported to be actively involved, whilst in the private and state schools the number was five and ten respectively.

All schools offered the Award to all pupils from S3-S6. Recruitment into the programme was through a number of avenues. These included: an open meeting to outline what the Award was all about; parents nights; information letters and bulletins; posters and notice boards; via the PE Department; and as part of the Guidance/PSD programme. In all schools pupils were generally given an initial trial period to allow them the opportunity to decide if they wished to continue with the programme.

In view of the expense involved in the administration of the Award and the organisation of expedition training and excursions, all schools required participants to make a financial contribution towards costs. The costs of the Award varied between schools and were set at £20, £150 and £200 + for the state school, international school and private school respectively. In addition to costs involved in transporting pupils to and from excursions, the private school used a commercially operated Outdoor Activity Centre for training, which increased the cost to the school considerably.

The activities which pupils were involved in under the Physical Recreation Section were similar across all schools and reflected the sports and cultural activities being promoted within the school community. All schools indicated that extra curricular activities were popular, with many pupils participating at the end of the school day and at weekends.

There were no real differences between schools in the activities which pupils were engaged in under the Skills Section. Whilst the range of skills which pupils were involved in was extremely varied, all schools reported that use was often made of personal interests of staff

in providing opportunities to pupils. One such example was the production of a school newsletter, which was linked to the English and ICT departments.

The activities which pupils were involved in under the Service Section also varied between schools. Similar to the findings of Lawson (69) all schools encouraged active service through links with charitable organisations within the community.

All schools reported that the Expedition Section was a particular highlight for pupils involved in the Award at all levels. Although the most popular form of expedition was on foot, one school offered the opportunity to undertake kayaking and cycling expeditions, whilst another offered a combined expedition/ exploration to pupils at Gold level.

All schools reported that a range of methods were used to deliver training for the expedition. These included: extra-curricular activities after school, in the evening and at weekends; visits to Outdoor Centres at weekends; visits of outdoor specialists to schools; and involvement of former pupils and parents.

Although all schools recognised the achievement of pupils who successfully completed the Award, this was done in different ways. Two of the schools organised their own Award ceremony for pupils and parents, which were reasonably high profile events within the school. The other school chose to recognise achievement more discreetly on the basis that the Award was about personal rather than public achievement. In one school, pupils who achieved the Gold Award received their certificate at a national Award ceremony at Holyrood Palace.

Teachers and pupils in all schools felt strongly that the Award promoted citizenship and recognised the potential which it offered to promote active service in the community. An example of this was cited by the state school, which had developed close links with Flexicare Paisley, an organisation that supported people with disabilities, and the Light Trust of Port Glasgow, who worked in Bulgaria with orphaned children. The relevance of

the Award to citizenship education was outlined in one of the written responses in the questionnaire, which stated that:

“ over the course of Bronze, Silver and Gold pupils will work on citizenship skills.

This begins with personal development and learning skills at Bronze level, through to the delivery and application of these skills to the benefit of the community at Gold level”

4.2 Semi-Structured Interviews

As the findings from the questionnaire could only provide a crude picture of the way in which the Award was organised within schools, and its role in the promotion and development of citizenship, it was important that qualitative data was gathered which would build on the quantitative data obtained from the questionnaire. To this end, semi-structured interviews were undertaken with the Headteacher or member of the SMT, the teacher with responsibility for the organisation of the Award and a focus group of pupils that were presently going through the programme. The purpose of the interviews was to explore further some of the issues raised within the study. The main findings from the interviews are presented in sections 4.2.1-4.2.4 and relate to the key areas drawn up for the interview schedules.

4.2.1 How the Award is Organised and Managed within Schools

In all schools the interest and enthusiasm for the promotion of the Award was clearly expressed by the Headteacher or member of the SMT. This was viewed as critical to the success of the programme as it provided an indication of the importance of the Award within the school. As one teacher remarked:

“ the fact that the Headteacher openly embraces the Award makes it so much easier to obtain support from other teachers who often have something valuable to offer the programme”

All Headteachers emphasised the contribution that the Award made to the ethos of the school and the opportunities that it provided for the development of close working partnerships within the community. This was particularly evident in one school which had forged close links with the local hospital and charitable organisations through the involvement of pupils in community service.

In view of the work involved in organising and managing the Award across three different levels and with large numbers of pupils, it is not surprising that Headteachers acknowledged the excellent work being undertaken by both the teacher with responsibility for the programme and other staff involved. An example of the scale of the work which is undertaken is illustrated by the fact that in all schools between 100-200 pupils are required to undergo training and complete a practice and full-scale expedition each year. As pupils going through the programme have to be closely supervised, in order to ensure that the requirements for all sections of the Award are met, it is essential that there is a sufficient number of staff to provide regular support.

Despite the large numbers of pupils participating in the programme, the organisation and management of the Award within all schools was largely the responsibility of one member of staff. Although one teacher stated that his timetable had been lightened to allow time to undertake administrative duties for the Award, the other two teachers reported that their involvement was over and above a full teaching commitment.

Interestingly, the success of the programme within all schools has led to unintended consequences. As one Headteacher remarked:

“ the programme has become so popular with pupils and parents it is now becoming a logistical nightmare to fit everything in around other school activities. Whilst this is a very positive problem, we are now going to have to look closely at how the Award is delivered and funded within the school”

In this particular school the success of the Award was such that it had reached saturation point and could not expand any further due to the large numbers of pupils taking part.

The opportunity, which the Award offered to connect with parents, was a common feature in the discussions with Headteachers, teachers and pupils. All of the schools reported that parents valued the involvement of their children in the programme and many believed that it was an excellent way of encouraging pupils to develop responsibility. This was illustrated by the comments of one pupil at Bronze level who, when asked what his parents thought of his involvement, stated;

“ my mum said, this is your big chance to show you have responsibility so I’m going to leave it up to you. “

The fact that pupils are required to undertake the Award over a period of time is regarded as an important factor in helping pupils to develop a sense of responsibility towards their work. This was emphasised by one of the teachers with responsibility for the organisation of the Award:

“ the word which I think sums up pupils involvement in the Award is ‘ stickability’. They have to be prepared to stick at the programme throughout the course of the year. One of the most rewarding aspects, however, is seeing their faces when they finally achieve their certificates, and they realise they have succeeded.”

Another feature of the Award within schools was the opportunity which it provided for cross-curricular activities. One such example was the link that had been developed between history and environmental studies in aspects of a Gold Award exploration/expedition with participants who were involved in an archaeological project. A pupil who was involved in this project suggested that it had caused him to view subjects from a different angle. As he put it:

“ I think it’s a good thing that pupils and teachers get the chance to relate work in class to things outside of school. On the exploration/expedition we were involved in discussing lots of environmental issues which were much more relevant when you were away from school. Our Gold exploration/expedition was in Argyllshire so issues such as the effects of pollution on the countryside were brought home to us quite vividly.”

Headteachers and teachers also reported positively on the contribution which the Award made to the ethos within the school. The general view that came across was that the Award was one example of a number of activities that could be regarded as promoting education for citizenship. As one Headteacher remarked:

“ I believe education for citizenship is an ongoing process which occurs in lots of different ways. Certainly, activities such as the Award are recognised as developing a ‘feel good’ factor about the school, but then so do many other activities which the school promotes.”

In a similar vein, another Headteacher spoke enthusiastically about the value of the Award to individual pupils and the effect it had on their self-esteem. As he put it:

“ in this school there are pupils involved who might not achieve much from the school system in terms of formal qualifications. The Award gives them a great sense of achievement and lets them see that they can be successful in other important areas.”

The reasons which pupils gave for getting involved in the Award varied. Two of the main attractions of the programme that were frequently reported, however, were the opportunity to provide some sort of service within the community and the chance to go on an outdoor expedition. Surprisingly, only a few pupils highlighted the opportunity to take part in physical recreation or learn a new skill. The following responses illustrate the different views that emerged:

“ I wanted to get involved with my community and I also wanted to learn more skills, like hiking and mountaineering ”

(Sebastian, Geneva)

“ when it was explained to us it sounded like so much fun ”

(Claire, Glasgow)

“ I thought it would be a good thing to have on your CV ”

(Robert, East Renfrewshire)

Overall, the responses from pupils to the organisation and management of the Award were positive and reflected the work which had been developed within schools over a number of years. Although not all pupils carried on to Gold level there was clear evidence of support for the programme, which was generally reported to be extremely rewarding. Far from being an extra burden, most pupils were of the opinion that it provided a welcome release from academic work.

4.2.2 The Role of the Award in Developing Personal Skills and Qualities

There was an overwhelming view from Headteachers, teachers and pupils that participation in the Award was an appropriate mechanism for developing the personal skills and qualities associated with citizenship education. Headteachers and teachers made frequent reference to the importance of developing personal skills such as self-confidence and initiative and suggested that the Award offered a range of opportunities for this to happen.

One of the teachers with responsibility for the organisation of the Award stated that he was sceptical about what participation in the programme would achieve when he first became involved, but having ran the programme for close on ten years was absolutely convinced about the impact which it had on the development of personal and social skills. As he made clear:

“ it’s amazing how children adapt and change when they get involved in the Award, and in particular the training for the expedition. You can see them growing in confidence, making decisions and speaking up for themselves. I suppose what is memorable for the kids is the whole business of working together...it’s what the kids say every year.”

This view was reinforced by a number of pupils who stated that they felt they had changed as a result of having to work closely with others to achieve a common goal. The following comments are illustrative of the views that were aired:

“ I think being involved in the expedition brings the best out of you. It certainly helped me find out about myself and about other people. I suppose it gave me a sense of responsibility and an understanding that people have to work together to bring out the best in people.”

(Jack, Geneva)

“ I think it has changed me a little bit- not on a massive scale, of course, but at least it has made me look differently at different things.”

(Julie, Glasgow)

Across all of the interviews with pupils there was a clear linkage between being involved in the expedition and the development of personal skills and attitudes. There was little doubt that taking part in an expedition was the most exciting feature of the Award and this was reflected by the fact that pupils were eager to talk at great length about their experiences in this area.

4.2.3 The Role of the Award in Developing Leadership Skills

In view of the importance which the document Education for Citizenship in Scotland placed on personal qualities and dispositions and the ability to be able to make decisions and exercise responsibility, it was felt important to explore whether involvement in the Award was recognised as providing the opportunity to develop basic leadership skills. From the interviews with teachers and pupils, evidence strongly suggests that this is perhaps one of the strongest claims that can be made regarding the involvement of pupils in outdoor education activities. Consequently, the emphasis, which was placed on the development of leadership skills as an aspect of teaching and learning, appeared to be given a high priority from teachers in the planning and organisation of expedition training. This was reflected in the following comment from one teacher:

“ many pupils have never taken part in an expedition before and have never been faced with working as part of a team in such an independent way. The training therefore tries to bring out their leadership qualities, because this is what is required when they are out there as a group on their own. It never ceases to amaze me how often the one’s you least expect to show leadership are often the one’s that do.”

The opportunity which the Award offered to develop leadership qualities, was highlighted by pupils across all schools and was regarded as one of the long-term benefits of signing up for the programme. Comments, which were made to support this, were:

“ I definitely think I developed my leadership skills. I am much more confident now about being in front of a group.”

(Claudio, Geneva)

“ leadership skills are important, particularly when you are doing the expedition, where you are put into situations where you have to lead the group. I suppose it forces you to develop these skills. I think that is important.”

(Amanda, Glasgow)

“ I think I will never lose these skills that I have developed through working as part of a team. I will always remember about this and how I felt. They are skills for life really.”

(Jane, East Renfrewshire)

The importance of ‘stickability’ mentioned earlier was very much a key feature of the expedition and highlighted the resilience required to complete the Award. As one pupil remarked:

“ sometimes on the expedition when you get cold and wet you feel as though you hate it, but after it’s over I think you appreciate what you went through, what you learned.”

In addition to developing basic leadership skills, pupils also reported that being involved in teambuilding exercises helped them to view others in a different light. One pupil expressed this succinctly:

“ I remember we were working on map skills and there was this girl who I had never seen contribute anything and she was just doing everything. She could calculate the height, the distance, the time travelled, the compass bearing. I think the Award pushed her to contribute. It certainly changed my view of her.”

4.2.4 The Role of the Award in Promoting Active Citizenship

Although the interviews with teachers and pupils tended to be dominated by the role of the expedition in developing personal skills and attitudes, there was a positive response from teachers and pupils regarding the opportunity which was provided for pupils to become involved in active service within the community. In many ways, this was reported as being one of the most challenging aspects of the Award, as it required pupils to demonstrate a

consistent commitment to an organisation or group over a long period of time. Whilst it was clear from the interviews with pupils that many of them found this quite daunting at the outset, evidence suggests that once they were actively involved it became a particularly rewarding experience.

When pupils were asked whether they thought participation in the Award helped to develop citizenship, the majority of them were of the opinion that it did, and referred specifically to the service they were undertaking to support this claim. One pupil who was working in a charity shop after school said:

“ we used to just hang out and go to MacDonald’s and stuff. Now we have something to do which we feel is important.”

Whilst the range of services which pupils were engaged in varied considerably, many of the pupils in this study reported that they were involved in activities that were linked to the school. Interestingly, three pupils who were completing their Gold Award pointed out that they had been working with a local charitable organisation since starting at bronze level and fully expected to continue to be involved after they left school.

One pupil summed up the perception that being involved in some sort of service was a good measure of citizenship. As he stated:

“ I think learning skills such as first aid are really important as a citizen. After all, it’s the sort of skill that could end up saving someone’s life.”

Some pupils felt quite strongly that young people should become more active in the community, but often did not know how to go about it. This led them to suggest that the Award pushed them in this direction by making them get involved in something which they otherwise might not have thought about. One pupil, who was helping out with his local Scout troop said:

“ it never occurred to me that I could become involved in helping with the younger members, until it was suggested to me at a DOE meeting. I’ve been going along now for six months and I really enjoy it.”

Although it is unclear how pupils and teachers defined citizenship, there was general agreement amongst the majority of those interviewed that citizenship education should include the opportunity to work with others in a meaningful way. One teacher who summed this up stated:

“ true citizenship education must include some sort of tangible effort to make life better for others. I mean, surely that’s what active citizenship is all about.”

CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION

5.1 Overview of Study

The purpose of this study was to explore whether teachers and pupils regard participation in the Award as an appropriate vehicle for the development of citizenship.

The sampling unit chosen for the investigation were three schools that were known to be involved in the delivery of good practice and included a state school, a private school and an international school.

The results of the study were produced from data gathered using a questionnaire, which sought quantitative information on how the Award was organised within each of the three schools. Qualitative data was also obtained using semi-structured interviews with Headteachers and teachers, and pupils that were presently going through the Award.

The results of this study showed that teachers and pupils viewed participation in the Award as an appropriate vehicle for the development of citizenship education. It is acknowledged, however, that as the study was small-scale and lacked any form of control or comparison group, an interpretation of the findings is questionable. Nevertheless, the results provide an interesting insight into the perceptions of pupils and teachers to this aspect of education.

The responses of teachers and pupils are discussed in sections 5.2-5.4 under the headings of the three research questions.

5.2 How is the Award Organised and Managed within Schools?

The findings of this study showed that the issues which impacted upon the organisation and management of the Award within all schools, were similar, irrespective of educational or cultural background of the schools involved. The level of interest in the Award within schools was evident from the number of pupils that enrolled and were successful at different levels, and from the positive responses to the programme that were received from those that were

interviewed. From the evidence gathered from speaking to teachers and pupils, all schools shared a number of essential characteristics, which contributed to the success of the programme.

Firstly, in each school the enthusiasm and commitment of the Headteacher for the Award was clearly demonstrated. This was evident in the support provided to the teacher with responsibility for managing the programme, and in the commitment to the provision of extra-curricular activities within the school. The large number of extra curricular clubs and activities that existed within all schools highlighted the importance of the hidden curriculum in developing a positive ethos within schools, and supported the findings of the National Priorities in Education Performance Report 2003 which highlighted the various approaches taken by schools in the promotion of pupils' personal and social education (70). From the discussions with pupils in this study, the requirement to take part in some form of physical recreation as part of the programme encouraged pupils to participate in extra curricular sport and other activities.

Secondly, in all schools the Award was organised and managed by a committed member of staff who believed passionately about the value of the programme in promoting and developing the personal skills and qualities of pupils. Interestingly, in all schools the member of staff with responsibility for the Award came from a physical education or outdoor education background, which adds weight to the views of Wild (71), who suggests that teachers from such backgrounds are well placed to deliver aspects of citizenship education.

Thirdly, in all schools close relationships had been formed with local community organisations, which provided valuable outlets for pupils to undertake active service within the community. This also reinforced the findings of the National Priorities in Education Performance Report, which drew attention to the opportunities that schools provide to pupils

to work with others within the day-to day operations of the school, and in the wider community (72).

Overall, there was a clear belief within each school of the value of the Award to the school and the community. The only real negative response that came across was the frustrations felt by teachers regarding the difficulties associated with organising and managing the programme for large numbers of pupils, and the pressure that existed at times to help all pupils achieve the Award. In view of the potential which the Award has to promote aspects of citizenship education, it may be necessary for schools to review the organisation and management of the programme so that such pressures on staff are reduced.

5.3 Does Participating in the Award help to Develop Personal Skills and Qualities?

The evidence gathered in this study suggests that teachers and pupils regard participation in the Award as being a useful mechanism for developing the personal skills and qualities such as self-esteem, confidence, initiative, determination and emotional maturity, which are regarded as an essential aspect of education for citizenship. In general, teachers and pupils were positive about the role which activities such as the expedition provided to foster personal and social skills. This supports the findings of Cooper (73) and Keighley (74) who suggest that aspects of the Award are particularly well suited to the development of personal and social education. The findings of small-scale studies into the value of outdoor activities in enhancing personal and social education (Ewert (75); Gibbs and Bunyan (76)) were also mirrored in this study, with many pupils reporting that they had grown in confidence and had developed their leadership skills as a result of their involvement in an outdoor expedition. Similar to the findings from the small-scale study by Hopkins (77) the expedition section was viewed as the most exciting aspect of the Award, with many pupils suggesting that the completion of the expedition was one of their greatest personal achievements in their lives so far.

Pupils also reported that many of the skills they felt they had acquired, as a result of their experience in outdoor activities, would be useful in other aspects of their lives outside of school. This reflects the findings of pupils from Bellshill Academy who also reported positive effects from being involved in an Outward-Bound course as part of their citizenship education programme (78).

From the findings of this study it is clear that one of the principal reasons why the Award is regarded as a suitable vehicle for developing personal skills and dispositions is the fact that the activities which the scheme promotes are delivered through experience. As suggested in chapter two, the fact that projects such as the Award are seen as providing opportunities for active engagement, which are perceived by young people as purposeful and personally relevant, provides an excellent starting point for teaching and learning. This also corresponds with the advice offered within the Citizenship Co-ordinators' Handbook which makes clear that for genuine participation and responsible action to occur, teaching pedagogy needs to ensure that students are active learners and not passive recipients (79). Whilst it is recognised that the Award is not an appropriate activity for all pupils, the fact that thousands of pupils are actively engaged in the programme world wide suggests that it has something valuable to offer citizenship education.

5.4 Does Participating in the Award Encourage Active Citizenship?

One of the fundamental issues identified within the paper Education for Citizenship in Scotland was the need to ensure that effective education for citizenship should be fostered in ways that motivate young people to be active and responsible members of their communities. Although this can be achieved in an infinite number of ways, the results of this study back up the claims by Chamberlain (80), that providing opportunities for pupils to play a role in the community is not easy and requires a great deal of organisation. The fact that the Award

requires pupils to become involved in providing active service suggests, however, that it is a useful vehicle for schools that wish to promote closer links within their own communities. Several writers have highlighted the importance of the experiential dimension of citizenship (Maitles (81); Rafferty (82); Dobie and MacBeath (83)) as being a crucial aspect of citizenship education and view it as necessary to ensure genuine participation. This view came across strongly in this study, and found that teachers and pupils believed it would enhance pupils understanding of citizenship if they actively took part in some sort of service within the community. From the interviews with pupils, evidence suggests that far from being reluctant to get involved, pupils openly welcome the opportunity to show responsibility, which comes with helping others. Unlike the findings of Lawson (84), the results of this study showed that many pupils continued to be involved in community service even after their participation in the Award was over.

In this study, schools used the Award programme to develop links with charitable organisations within the local community, which had enabled high levels of service activity to be promoted to the benefit of the organisation and the school. This approach is recommended for schools that might wish to get involved as it opens the door for numerous other school related activities to be developed in partnership with other organisations.

5.5 Conclusions and Implications for Future Research

The findings of this study showed that there was a positive response from teachers and pupils regarding the role of the Award as a vehicle for the promotion and development of aspects of citizenship education. In particular, the Award was viewed as providing a relevant context for the development of personal skills and for the promotion of service within the community. However, as the study did not include a control or comparison group it is difficult to interpret the findings in a meaningful way. Consequently, whilst evidence suggests that teachers and pupils have positive attitudes about the contribution which the Award can make to the

development of citizenship, it is recognised that there may well be other reasons for this. For example, it is possible that teachers and pupils involved in the Award are predisposed to positive attitudes to citizenship and, therefore, may already view it in this light. Similarly, pupils who enrol in the Award may well be inclined to become involved in active service within the community, regardless of whether the Award was offered or not. The fact that the study did not include pupils who had dropped out of the Award, or teachers that were not directly associated with it, is recognised as being a weakness in gathering a wider view of how the Award was perceived within schools.

As there has been limited research into the way in which citizenship education is promoted and developed, a similar study using a control group of pupils may illuminate further the role that the Award can play in this important aspect of the curriculum. In view of the number of schools which participate in the Award in Scotland a larger study of how the programme is used to develop citizenship would also be worthwhile.

REFERENCES

1. Stenhouse, L., 'An Introduction to Curriculum Research and Development', Heinemann, Oxford, 1975, Chapter 10.
2. Sachs, J., 'The Activist Teaching Profession', OU Press, Buckingham, 1999, Chapter 1.
3. <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/ctfaqs-00.asp>
Last accessed 02/12/2004
4. Stenhouse, L., 'An Introduction to Curriculum Research and Development', Heinemann, Oxford, 1975, Chapter 4.
5. Hargreaves, D., 'Social Relations in a Secondary School', Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1966.
6. Learning and Teaching Scotland., 'Education for Citizenship in Scotland: A Paper for Discussion and Development', LTS, 2002, Dundee
7. ibid. p. 11
8. ibid. p. 16
9. ibid. p. 3
10. ibid. p. 16
11. 'Citizenship Education: seeking Definitions and Recognising their Consequences for Teaching and Learning Strategies. Johnson, H and Holness, M., Paper Presented to Annual Conference of the British Educational Research Association, Leeds, September, 2001, pp 2-16
12. 'Education for Democracy? A Philosophical Analysis of the National Curriculum. Carr, W., Journal of Philosophy of Education, Vol. 25, No. 2, (1991), pp 183-190.
13. Aldrich, R., 'Education for the Nation', Cassell, London, 1996.
14. Stenhouse, L., 'Authority, Education and Emancipation', Heinemann, London.
15. QCA. 'Education for Citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools', DfEE, London, 1998, p.8
16. DfEE, 'Excellence in Schools', HMSO, London, 1997.
17. 'Citizenship: In need of care and attention?'. Stonefrost, M., Public Money and Management, October-December, (1994), pp 25-28.
18. Demaine, J and Entwistle, H., 'Beyond Communitarianism', St. Martin's Press, New York, 1966, Chapter 4.

19. Heater, D., 'Citizenship: The Civic Ideal in World History, Politics and Education, Longman, London, 1990.
20. 'Citizenship, Communities and Adult Learning'. Coare,P and Johnston,R., Paper Presented at SCUTRREA, 32nd Annual Conference, 2-4 July, University of Stirling, 2002.
21. Lister,R., 'Citizenship. Feminist Perspectives, MacMillan, Basingstoke, 1997.
22. 'Encouraging Active Citizenship'. Davies, I and Evans, M., Educational Review, Vol. 54, No.1, 2002, pp 69-78.
23. 'Only If You Have'nt Got A Life: secondary school pupils' views of Citizenship Education'. Chamberlain, R., Westminster Studies in Education, Vol 26, No. 2, October, 2003, pp87-97.
24. Jerome, L., 'The Citizenship Co-ordinators Handbook', Nelson Thornes Ltd, London, 2003, pp 81-82.
25. Learning and Teaching Scotland. op. cit. p. 2
26. 'Active Citizenship in Schools and the Community'. Lawson, H., The Curriculum Journal, Vol 12, No.2, Summer, (2001), pp 163-178.
27. 'Neo- Conservatives, Neo-Liberals, The New Left and Inclusion: Stirring the Pot'. Loxley, A and Thomas,G., Cambridge Journal of Education, Vol. 31, No. 3, (2001), pp 291-301.
28. 'The making of Citizenship in the National Curriculum (England): Issues and Challenges', Kerr, D., Paper Presented at the European Conference on Educational Research, Edinburgh, 20-23 September, NFER, (2000), pp 2-16
29. Giddens,A., 'The Third way: The Renewal of Social Democracy', Policy Press, London, 1998.
30. 'Preparing Tomorrow's People- The new Challenges of Citizenship Education for Involving Scottish Pupils and Teachers in Participative Decision Making Processes', Deuchar,R., Scottish Educational review, Vol. 35, No. 1, (2003), pp 1-25.
31. Ibid. p. 4
32. Potter, J., 'Education for Life, Work and Citizenship', CSV, London, 1999.
33. 'Disaffection, The Citizenship Agenda and Democratic Renewal',. Scottish Youth Issues Journal. No. 5, Winter, (2002), pp 11-31.
34. QCA, 1998, op.cit. p. 4
35. ibid. p. 8
36. 'New Bottles for Old Wine? Affective Education and the Citizenship Revolution in English Schools',. Best,R., Paper Presented at the European Conference on Educational Research, University of Lisbon, 11-14 September, (2002)

37. Osler, A and Starkey, H., 'Teacher Education and Human Rights', David Fulton, London, 1996
38. 'The Educational Requirement for Democracy'. Levin, B., Curriculum Inquiry, 28,1, (1998)
pp 57-79
39. [http:// www.Itscotland.org.uk/citizenship/reports/globalchallenges.pdf](http://www.Itscotland.org.uk/citizenship/reports/globalchallenges.pdf) Last accessed 04/04/2004
40. Davies, I and Evans, M., *op. cit.* p. 69
41. Heater, D., *op. cit.*
42. Kerr, D., *op. cit.* p. 3
43. DfEE/QCA., 'Citizenship: Key Stages 3-4', DfEE/QCA, 1999
44. Kerr,D., *op.cit.* pp 1-16
45. QCA.,1998., quoted in Kerr,D., *op.cit.* p. 10
46. Humes,W., *op.cit.* p. 11-31.
47. Best, R., *op.cit.*
48. Davies, I and Evans, M., *op. cit.* pp 69-78
49. Johnson, H and Holness, M., *op.cit.* pp 2-16
50. Lawson, H., *op. cit.* pp 163-178
51. Learning and Teaching Scotland., *op.cit.* p. 3
52. *ibid.* p. 10
53. [http:// www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/nper-07.asp](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/nper-07.asp) Last accessed 13/02/2004
54. SOEID., 'How Good Is Our School', Edinburgh, SOEID, 1996
55. 'The Role of Outdoor Education in the 21st Century'. Cooper, G., Journal of Adventure Education and Outdoor Leadership, Vol. 11, No. 2, (1994) quoted in 'The Development of Self-Esteem Through a Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme'. Gibbs,C and Bunyan,P., The Journal of Adventure Education and Outdoor Leadership, Vol.14, No.2, Summer, (1997), pp 3-4.
- 56 'A Consideration of the Appropriate Teaching, Learning and Assessment strategies in the Outdoor Adventurous Activity Elements of Outdoor Education as it Relates to the Physical education National Curriculum'. Keighley, P.W. S., British Journal Of Physical Education, Vol., 24, No. 1, quoted in 'The Development of Self-Esteem Through a Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme'. Gibbs,C and Bunyan,P., The Journal of Adventure Education and Outdoor Leadership, Vol.14, No.2, Summer, (1997), pp 3-4.

57. 'Political Education in Schools' ., Maitles, H., International Journal of Inclusive Education, 3, 3, pp 181-190
58. ' Giving Children a Voice? What next? A Study from one Primary School' ., Rafferty, S., SCRE Spotlights, No. 65, (1997)
59. Dobie,T and MacBeath, J., 'Pupil Councils: A Case Study of Pupils Councils in Fife' ., University of Strathclyde Quality in Education Centre/Fife Council, Glasgow, 1998
60. [http:// www.Ltscotland.org.uk/citizenship/](http://www.Ltscotland.org.uk/citizenship/) Last accessed 05.04.2004
61. Ewert,A., ' Outdoor Adventure and Self-Concept: A Research Analysis', College of Human Development and Performance, University of Oregon, 1982, quoted in 'The Development of Self-Esteem Through a Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme'. Gibbs,C and Bunyan,P., The Journal of Adventure Education and Outdoor Leadership, Vol.14, No.2, Summer, (1997), pp 3-4.
62. 'The Development of Self-Esteem Through a Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme'. Gibbs,C and Bunyan,P., The Journal of Adventure Education and Outdoor Leadership, Vol.14, No.2, Summer, (1997), pp 3-4.
- 63 'Changes in Self-Concept as the Result of Adventure Training' ., Hopkins, D.,Canadian association for Health and Recreation Journal, Vol. 48, No. 6, 1982, quoted in 'The Development of Self-Esteem Through a Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme'. Gibbs,C and Bunyan,P., The Journal of Adventure Education and Outdoor Leadership, Vol.14, No.2, Summer, (1997), pp 3-4.
64. Learning and Teaching Scotland., op. cit. p. 10
65. Blaxter,L, Hughes, C and Tight, M., 'How to Research', OUP, Birmingham, 2001, Chapters 6 & 7
66. Munn, R and Drever, E., 'Using Questionnaires in Small-Scale research', SCRE, Edinburgh, 1990, p. 2
67. Herbert, D., 'Planning a Research Project', Cassell El Ltd, London, 1990
68. 'How To Do It: Design a Questionnaire'. Stone,D,H., British Medical Journal, Vol. 307, November, (1973), pp 1264-1266
69. Lawson, H., op.cit. pp 163-178
70. [http:// www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/nper-07.asp](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/nper-07.asp) Last accessed 13/02/2004
- 71 'Citizenship Education Physical Education: The Forgotten Subject'. Wild, A., The British Journal of Physical Education, Summer, 2002, pp 23-24
72. [http:// www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/nper-07.asp](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/nper-07.asp) Last accessed 13/02/2004
73. Cooper, G., op. cit.

74. Keighley, P.W. S., op. cit.
75. Ewert,A., op.cit.
76. Gibbs,C and Bunyan,P.,op. cit.
77. Hopkins, D., op .cit.
78. [http:// www.Ltscotland.org.uk/citizenship/](http://www.Ltscotland.org.uk/citizenship/) Last accessed 05.04.2004
79. Jerome, L., op cit.
80. Chamberlain, R., op. cit. pp 87-97
81. Maitles, H., op.cit. pp 181-190
82. Rafferty, S., op. cit.
83. Dobie,T and MacBeath, J., op. cit.
84. Lawson,H., op.cit. pp 163-178

Appendix 1

Questionnaire

Information on School

1. Type of School

State		Private		International	
-------	--	---------	--	---------------	--

2. Size of School

Less than 300		301-500		501-800		801-1000		1000 +	
---------------	--	---------	--	---------	--	----------	--	--------	--

3. Number of Pupils

	S1	S2	S3	S4	S5	S6
Boys						
Girls						

4. Number of Teaching Staff (FTE)

Male		Female	
------	--	--------	--

Section 2

Details of Award

5. How long has the School been offering the Award?

Less than 2 years		2-5 years		More than 5 years	
-------------------	--	-----------	--	-------------------	--

6. What levels of the Award are offered within the school?

Bronze		Silver		Gold	
--------	--	--------	--	------	--

7. How many pupils are presently involved within each level of the Award?

	Bronze	Silver	Gold
Boys			
Girls			

8. How is the Award programme managed within the school?

Designated member of SMT	
Designated teacher	
Designated member of non-teaching staff	
Parent	
Outside representative eg. Former pupil, Community Education worker	

If none of the above please indicate how the Award is managed.

9. How many teachers/members of staff are involved in supporting the Award within the school?

Male		Female	
------	--	--------	--

10. Which departments within the school are actively involved in supporting the Award?

Art		History	
Biology		Home Economics	
Business Studies		Latin/Classics	
Chemistry		Mathematics	
Computing		Learning Support	
Drama		Modern Languages	
English		Modern Studies	
Gaelic		Physics	
Geography		Religious Education	
Guidance/PSD		Physical Education	

11. How are pupils recruited into the Award?

Open meeting	
Parents evening	
Via Guidance/PSD	
Via PE department	
Via letter of invitation	
Via posters/information leaflet	
Via word of mouth	
Combination of the above	

12. How is the Award financed?

Personal contribution by pupils	
School fund	
Outside support	
Benefactors	
Fund raising by pupils	
Other means	

13. What is the average cost to participants of taking part in the Award at each level?

Level	Cost
Bronze	
Silver	
Gold	

Section Three

Pupil Participation in Activities

Physical Recreation Section

14. Please indicate which activities pupils participate in as part of the Physical Recreation Section of the Award

Activity		Activity		Activity	
Archery		Handball		Synchronised Swimming	
Angling		Hockey		Table Tennis	
Badminton		Judo		Tae Kwon Do	
Basketball		Karate		Tennis	
Bowling		Lacrosse		Triathlon	
Canoeing		Netball		Volleyball	
Cricket		Orienteering		Water Polo	
Cycling		Racketball		Water Skiing	
Diving		Rowing		Weight Lifting	
Equestrian		Rugby		Wrestling	
Fencing		Sailing		Yachting	
Football		Softball		Skiing	
Golf		Squash		Hiking	
Gymnastics		Swimming		War games	
				Sub Aqua	

Please specify any other activities which are not listed.

Service Section

15. Please indicate which activities pupils participate in as part of the Service Section of the Award

Service		Service		Service	
Disabled		Church		Uniformed Organisations	
Youth Clubs RSPCA		Fire service		Teaching	
Hospital		Police		Working with refugees	
First Aid		Ambulance		Supervising children	
Local Radio		Coast Guards		Working with animals	
Media/TV		Charity Shop		Elderly Citizens	
Sports Club		Hospice			
Nursery		Cat Protection			

Please specify any other activities not listed

Skills Section

16. Please indicate which activities pupils participate in as part of the Skills Section of the Award.

Activity		Activity	
Pottery		Radio Presenting	
Sign Language		Model making Singing	
Fly Tying/Fishing		Navigation	
Calligraphy		Soft furnishings	
Computing		Stamp collection	
Dressmaking		Painting/Drawing	
Needlecraft		Dancing	
Horse handling		Jornalism	
Chess		Photography	
Musical Instrument		Learning languages	
Car Mechanics		New Sport	
Learn to drive		Refereeing	
Drama		Young Enterprise	
Cooking			

Please specify any activities not listed

Expedition Section

17. Please indicate which type of expeditions pupils are involved in within each level of the Award

Expedition Type	Bronze	Silver	Gold
Foot			
Cycling			
Horse riding			
Canoeing			
Kayaking			
Sailing			
All modes of travel			

Please indicate any other type of expedition not included above.

18. Which of the following activities are used as part of the training for the Expedition Section of the Award

Extra curricular activities after school	
Extra curricular activities (week-ends)	
Visits to Outdoor Centres	
Visits of Outdoor Specialists to school	
Involvement of parents	
Involvement of former pupils	

Please indicate other forms of training that are provided :

Section Four

Recognition of Achievement

19. How does the school recognise the achievements of pupils that successfully complete the Award ?

Section Five

Education for Citizenship

20. From your experience of running the Award do you think that it is a valuable activity for the promotion and development of citizenship in schools?

Thankyou for taking the time to complete this questionnaire.

Appendix 2

Research Questions for Focus Groups

Background

1. What level are you at in school?
2. What level of the Award are you working at?
3. Have you obtained any other levels of the Award?
4. Can you tell me what the Award involves?
5. What sorts of activities are you involved in within each section of the Award?

Recruitment

6. How were you recruited into the Award?
7. Why are you doing the Award?
8. What is it about the Award that interests you?
9. Are you hoping to progress through higher sections of the Award?

Citizenship/PSD

10. How do you view your participation in the Award in terms of your Personal development?
11. Do you think the Award helps to promote citizenship?
12. Do you think participation in the Award helps to develop leadership skill?
13. Do you think the Award helps to develop team-building skills?
14. Do you think the Award helps you to look at things or people in a different way?
15. How do your parents view your involvement in the Award?
16. What would you say to someone that was thinking of doing the Award?

Research Questions for Staff

What are the main reasons for the school offering the Award?

How long has the school been offering the Award?

Who manages and runs the Award within the school?

Do you get any extra time to run the Award?

Is the Award well supported within the school?

What benefits does the Award bring to pupils?

In what ways do you think staff benefit from being involved in the Award?

Education for citizenship is one of the national priorities for education, but it is not clear how schools will deliver education for citizenship.

Do you see the Award as a way of promoting citizenship education?

Do you think the spirit of the Award could be developed further down the school and even into primary school?