



# **Teacher Researcher Programme 2003/2004**

**Resources for Teaching Citizenship  
in Scottish Primary Schools :  
New Zealand School Journal Model**

**Alexander Thom  
New Aberdeen Primary School,  
Aberdeenshire**

**gtc**  
SCOTLAND

## **Acknowledgements**

Thanks must be expressed to several parties who contributed to the completion of this project.

I am much indebted to Dr. Dean Robson, Research Fellow, GTCs for his patient and good humoured guidance throughout, and for his prompt attention to my many questions.

The researcher group have been constantly available for support and always willing to share their thoughts with mine.

I must thank those teachers, here and in New Zealand, who ploughed their way through my questionnaires and gave their opinions on sometimes difficult questions.

My wife, Kathleen, also deserves mention for keeping her cool and foregoing outings when I 'just had to' get to this work.

## Contents

page 4		Synopsis
page 5		Introduction
page 14		Methodology
page 19		Results and Discussion
page 36		Conclusions and Recommendations
page 38		References
page 40		Appendices
Appendix 1		Questionnaire sent to Scottish teachers
Appendix 2		Questionnaire sent to New Zealand teachers
Appendix 3	Table 1	New Zealand results for Section 1 of questionnaire
Appendix 4	Table II	New Zealand results for Section 2 of questionnaire
Appendix 5	Table III	New Zealand national identity collated targets
Appendix 6	Table IV	New Zealand local issues collated targets
Appendix 7	Table V	New Zealand national issues collated targets
Appendix 8	Table VI	New Zealand global social/humanity issues collated targets
Appendix 9	Table VII	New Zealand global environmental issues collated targets
Appendix 10	Table VIII	Scottish results for Section 1 Knowledge and Understanding
Appendix 11	Table IX	Scottish results for Section 2 Skills and Competencies
Appendix 12	Table X	Scottish results for Section 3 Values and Dispositions
Appendix 13	Table XI	Scottish results for Section 4 Creativity and Enterprise

## **1. SYNOPSIS**

Currently the Scottish Executive has five National Priorities for Education. The promotion of Inclusion and Equality is one of these, and the promotion of Values and Citizenship is another. In the view of the author, the promotion of inclusion impacts positively on the promotion of good citizenship, which may be fostered by taking advantage of the opportunities for flexibility in the curriculum.

This study investigated the use of New Zealand ‘Schools Journals’ as a vehicle for the teaching of citizenship in New Zealand, and to investigate whether this approach could be appropriately applied in the Scottish primary school context. New Zealand teachers indicated that they regularly used School Journals as a resource for teaching citizenship. Completed questionnaires received from Scottish teachers indicated a perceived lack of available resources for teaching certain aspects of citizenship, and a desire to have more readily available and appropriate resources.

In this report, a proposal is made on resourcing citizenship education in primary schools, based on New Zealand School Journals, to allow it, unlike the system in England, to be integrated into the curriculum.

## **2. INTRODUCTION**

### **2.1 Background**

Education for citizenship is a new arrival to the Scottish curriculum. In 2002, Learning and Teaching Scotland published “Education for Citizenship in Scotland: A Paper for Development and Discussion”. [1]

‘Education for Citizenship’ envisages four aspects of good citizenship, namely,

- Knowledge and Understanding
- Skills and Competences
- Values and Dispositions
- Creativity and Enterprise

Each of these aspects is exemplified by a set of learning outcomes.

Education for citizenship in Scotland, though having only a short life to date, has had a focus in England under the banner of civics, and latterly as social studies, for most of last century. Then, as now, events of world importance gave new stimulus and heightened priority to educating young people to be informed and competent citizens. The First World War, Nazism and the Second World War, the foundation of the United Nations, the forming and evolution of the European Union, globalisation and, much more recently, the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001 and the upsurge in world terrorist activity,

have driven the urgency to promote inclusion, democracy and sympathetic insight. Madeley [2] argued in 1920 that the teaching of history must promote active citizenship:

*“We load our memories with the battles and genealogies of the Wars of the Roses, the ministries of George III, the terms of some defunct treaty or some long-repealed bill, and we leave untouched craft history which might give new life to our craft training, studies in social life which might bring a new sensitiveness into human relations, and political discussion which would give both a new zest and a new efficiency to citizenship”.*

In England, and so, presumably, in Scotland, Heater [3] identifies three main reasons why citizenship has not been successfully implanted into the curriculum as basically political, social and pedagogical. By fits and starts citizenship education bumbled along, promoted or derailed by various power interests. Teachers, it seems, did not voluntarily get involved with this political hot potato. Soon after 1918, the term ‘education for world citizenship’ was in use but it was not until 1952 that an unequivocal statement was made in support of international education:

*“Teaching for citizenship and international understanding must not be regarded by the teacher as an extraneous duty or a piece of political propaganda. It is, in fact, fundamental to our survival and the teacher’s part in it is vital. It is certain that we shall not produce good citizens of the world unless we have first produced good citizens of the neighbourhood”.* Strong [4]

By the 1990s, an increasing awareness of ‘Planet Earth’ and ‘Spaceship Earth’ with injunctions to ‘Think locally, act globally’, was ensuring that the education of the global citizen was becoming both a reality and a necessity. There was no longer a contradiction in being both locally and nationally loyal, and being a loyal global

citizen. The aim of education should be to produce good global citizens, and on the way to this, produce good local and national citizens.

Crick [5], with his political history background, kick-started a thrust for a discrete curriculum slot for the promotion of good citizenship in the English national curriculum and guaranteed programmes of work, in a then recognised multi-racial and multi-cultural society.

In Scotland, the process is gaining momentum. The creation of the new Scottish Parliament in July 1999, focused attention afresh on the political aspect of life. However, social problems such as racism, the integration of asylum seekers into society, a youth culture of drugs and binge drinking and low self esteem (the self esteem of Scotland's youth in Europe is higher only of those in Estonia), make it vital that serious consideration is given to addressing these issues. The last election to elect Scottish Members of the European Parliament had only a 24% turnout, one of the lowest in Europe. In a recent radio programme , a survey by the National Centre for Social Records revealed that 26% of the population felt they could give good reasons to be intolerant of homosexuals and racial minorities. Given statistics like these, the author believes that new approaches to a new curricular area should be considered by the Scottish Executive. Too often, at present, voluntary, developmental education and other non-governmental organisations carry unnecessary responsibility for what is basically a national educational issue.

In England, early attempts to introduce a meaningful citizenship programme were hampered by weak political will. In Scotland, however, several weighty opinions have been expressed by senior politicians, including Jack McConnell, First Minister.

*“It is obvious that Scottish education must increasingly enable young people to acquire a thorough knowledge and appreciation of international and global issues and the necessary skills to enable them to participate actively and responsibly in the affairs of the 21<sup>st</sup> century.”* McConnell [6]

*“Educating young people in ways that prepare them for living effectively and responsibly as members of local, national and global communities is vital to the wellbeing of humanity now and in the future.”* Jamieson [7]

For people to be empowered as envisioned above, the author believes strongly that they must have a high self esteem and a confidence that they will be able to make a difference, and this applies equally to teachers. In addition, change is more comfortable and successful (for both pupils and teachers) if it can be supported in practical ways. The teaching of citizenship in Scotland is undoubtedly ongoing, but the author feels this is done only in a narrow sense. A range of resources is available. Commercial materials such as ‘Go for Enterprise’ and ‘Enterprising Infants’, Jenny Mosley’s ‘Circle Time’, and themed books and videos are available to support Religious and Moral Education, Personal and Social Development, and Health Education programmes. In addition, several local authorities have produced resources for drama, PSD education and Enterprise. Visitors and speakers to school and Pupil Councils provide other opportunities for meaningful participation in a citizenship syllabus. Scottish Development Education Centres have available many catalogued

resources usually dealing with issues of global importance. However, the author is of the opinion that many of these resources deal very inadequately with many of the targets, and consequently, without appropriate resources, the targets are being poorly taught, indeed, if addressed at all. The provision of appropriate resources for all the targets would overcome the avoidance by busy teachers of equally important areas because they are difficult to resource.

New Zealand has an established reputation for excellence in the teaching of language work, especially reading skills. Reading is given a very high national priority and is directly supported by the Ministry of Education which oversees the publication of a wide range of resource materials, the 'School Journal' being part of this coherent set. The School Journal is basically a magazine for New Zealand schoolchildren and is issued free in sets of tens to all primary schools in New Zealand, and on request to intermediate and secondary schools. The journal functions not only as source material for children's reading for enjoyment and as a teacher resource in the teaching of reading, but also as a classroom resource for social studies, science, health and technology. It also functions as a reference source for both teachers and pupils. The journals are designed primarily to support the language curriculum and form the basis of most reading programmes. The stories, articles, plays and poems demonstrate good writing and cover all the genres in a reading and writing programme.

School Journals are produced for four age levels.

Part 1 (issued five times a year) comprises material matched to the interest level and reading ages of seven to eight year olds, though sections may also be suitable for older children.

Part 2 (issued four times a year) is aimed at children aged eight to nine years. Some of the stories and many of the articles are suitable for older children also.

Part 3 (issued three times a year) consists of material appropriate to the interests and experiences of nine to eleven year olds.

Part 4 (issued three times a year) is aimed at eleven to thirteen year olds, and is distributed to all primary, intermediate (Scottish P7 and S1 stages) and, on request, to secondary schools.

One of the huge strengths of the School Journal is the catalogue. Now available electronically, a regularly updated and completely cross referenced catalogue was previously issued in paper form to individual teachers. It comprises three sections. Section A lists all items separately under title and author, but also under various other headings such as year of publication, number of pages in that item and the reading level. The use of keywords allows items to be listed under more than a single entry, facilitating a successful search for resources. Section B has brief summaries of each item, while Section C contains biographical notes of some of the School Journal contributors. Contributors, both adult and children, are invited to submit items through advertisements placed in the educational publication 'Resource Link'.

All items in the journals are totally, though not exclusively, relevant to New Zealand. The topics covered are broad. There are stories about cultures, the diversity of the

country, people with disabilities, industry, physical landscape, engineering feats, national achievements, a Maori poem with a translation, ecology, green issues, family matters, politics and simple menus. There are high quality photographs and children's drawings. The latest edition of the journal is eagerly awaited by teachers and pupils alike. Children find them very interesting and highly motivating.

## **2.2 Aim of the study**

The aim of this study was to investigate the use of New Zealand 'School Journals' as a vehicle for teaching citizenship in New Zealand, and to consider whether a similar approach could be appropriately applied in the Scottish primary school situation.

## **2.3 Specific objectives**

The specific objectives of this research are listed below.

Objective 1: To investigate and critically evaluate the format, design, content and role of New Zealand School Journals.

Objective 2: To investigate the current situation in New Zealand regarding the teaching of citizenship.

Objective 3: To critically investigate the current teaching of citizenship in Scottish primary schools with particular regard to the taught curriculum, resources and areas of concern.

Objective 4: To assess what support Scottish teachers would welcome to facilitate the teaching of citizenship, and assess teacher perception of sample New Zealand School Journal material.

Objective 5: To develop and specify a strategy for the implementation of a journal format in a Scottish context.

#### **2.4 Rationale for methods used.**

It was decided to use a questionnaire format with a covering letter to reach a sufficient number of people so as to give as much reliability as possible to the results. This format also enabled respondents to complete the questionnaires at their convenience. A questionnaire was sent to teachers in a wide geographical area to further increase reliability of the findings. Because it was apparent that individual questionnaires would be quite lengthy, a tick-box approach was seen as appropriate.

The author was not convinced, however, that simply asking primary teachers if they already taught any aspects of citizenship would be helpful. He was sure that replies would be very positive but with attention being paid mainly to old favourites such as bullying, recycling and conservation.

A questionnaire was therefore designed using many of the learning outcomes from the "Education for Citizenship" document. This was expanded to include learning outcomes specifically related to a global perspective. (Appendix 1)

A second questionnaire was designed for sending to New Zealand teachers. Learning outcomes similar to the Scottish questionnaire were used but with a further section to assess how useful New Zealand School Journals proved to be in teaching citizenship.

(Appendix 2)

### **3. METHODOLOGY**

The methodology used to address the objectives is detailed below.

3.1 Objective 1: To investigate and critically evaluate the format, design, content and role of New Zealand School Journals.

Methodology: a) Acquisition and review of past and current New Zealand School Journals.

- b) Structured interviews with two New Zealand teachers to develop the background to the journals.
- c) Acquisition and review of a copy of the journal Catalogue Index.

3.2 Objective 2: To investigate the current situation in New Zealand regarding the teaching of citizenship.

Methodology: a) Design, pilot, update and assess the results of a questionnaire directed at a group of thirty New Zealand class teachers to assess the extent to which the teaching of citizenship is facilitated by the use of School Journals.

- b) Analyse and present results from questionnaire responses.

#### Objective 2

The New Zealand questionnaire contained only the 'Knowledge and Understanding' and 'Values of Respect and Dispositions for Social Responsibility' aspects from 'Education for Citizenship'. Questions on 'Skills and Competencies' were omitted because these are sufficiently general to be handled routinely by the teacher. No

information was sought from New Zealand teachers on the 'Creativity and Enterprise' aspect because it was felt School Journals do not directly cater for this. In addition, the New Zealand questionnaire was to contain additional sections related to the School Journals, and might otherwise have appeared a bit overwhelming in size.

The questionnaire was in three sections. The first referred to issues taught; the second asked if the School Journal were used as a resource for this; the third collected information on how useful the journals proved to be in this.

Information was collected under these headings:

1. Knowledge and Understanding
2. Values of Respect and Dispositions for Social Responsibility
3. School Journals deal well with ..(other individual personal areas)
4. School Journals dispose young people to..(be active)
5. On School Journals generally

Finally, comment was sought on the benefits of published worksheets.

3.3 Objective 3: To critically investigate the current teaching of citizenship in Scottish primary schools with particular regard to the taught curriculum, resources and areas of concern.

Methodology: a) Design, pilot and update a questionnaire for thirty Scottish class teachers to specifically assess:

1. the degree to which citizenship is taught.
2. the availability and accessibility of suitable resources.

3.4 Objective 4: To assess what support Scottish teachers would welcome to facilitate the teaching of citizenship, and assess teacher perception of sample School Journal material.

Methodology: Assess the results of the Scottish questionnaire with particular regard to:

1. areas of concern identified.
2. teacher comments on resources.
3. teacher comments on sample School Journal material.

Objectives 3 and 4

The Scottish questionnaire was the second to be piloted and distributed. Thirty questionnaires were sent to Scottish primary teachers in thirteen education authorities.

For each item, respondents were asked to score on whether they taught this item, how easily resourced it was, and if appropriate, to note the source of the resources. The questionnaire comprised four sections, each dealing with one of the aspects recommended in 'Education for Citizenship', namely:

Knowledge and Understanding

Skills and Competencies

Values of Respect and Dispositions for Social Responsibility

Creativity and Enterprise

Knowledge and Understanding. In the questionnaire all the suggested learning outcomes in 'Education for Citizenship' were incorporated, in addition to six others

from Development Education Centre material focusing on global issues, another two connected to national identity and a final one relating to Arts awareness suggested by Twine.[8] Where it was felt that 'Education for Citizenship's' learning outcomes combined two possible targets, they were subdivided to remove uncertainty from the questionnaire. This made a total of twenty two targets.

Skills and Competencies. All the suggested examples of learning outcomes were used though one was separated into three components.

Values and Dispositions. This section had thirty three targets, using all nine 'Education for Citizenship' suggested learning examples with two expanded questions, six other targets focusing on national identity, an additional fifteen questions prompted by Development Education Centre material, and one by Twine.

Creativity and Enterprise. Only the six suggested learning outcomes of 'Education for Citizenship' were used.

The Scottish questionnaire collected information about teachers' areas of concern, and to address the learning outcomes specified in the questionnaire, asked whether teachers would welcome additional/new resource material. Respondents were provided with a photocopied sample selection of New Zealand School Journal material and asked for their impressions of these. Teachers were then asked in the questionnaire whether they would welcome a similar format in Scotland to provide resources on citizenship issues, and whether they would prefer this in paper or electronic form. A final summarising comment was invited on the teaching of citizenship in schools.

3.5 Objective 5: To develop and specify a strategy for the implementation of a journal format in a Scottish context.

Methodology: Compare the perceived advantages of the New Zealand model with the perceived weaknesses of the Scottish model to assess the possibility, and format, of improved resources for a Scottish primary citizenship curriculum.

## **4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

4.1 **Objective 1** A total of twenty one School Journals covering Parts 1 – 4 and a copy of the School Journal catalogue were acquired and evaluated. Background information on the journals was collected through personal interviews with three New Zealand teachers working in Scotland.

4.2 Objective 2 A total of eleven New Zealand questionnaires were returned.

A slight problem was encountered with the New Zealand questionnaires because of the timing of the summer holiday in New Zealand relative to term time in Scotland. The questionnaire had to be designed, piloted and sent to New Zealand so that respondents had time to complete it before that extremely busy end-of-year time in schools. Thirty of these were personally distributed by a friend of the author. However, only ten were received by the return date of 6 December. Re-issue, to increase the reliability of the sample, was not possible until 26 January because of New Zealand summer holiday dates. Another five contacts in New Zealand were approached prior to the start of their new school session and asked that they each approach four additional teachers, giving then a total sample of thirty one. However, at this very busy school time, only two additional completed questionnaires were returned, making the total sample eleven. One of these, however, was unusable because the respondent had not understood how to complete it. The total sample was therefore ten.

Tables 4.1, 4.2 and 4.3 summarise the results of the comments of New Zealand teachers on School Journals generally. It can be immediately seen that there is a very high satisfaction rate with the journals. Table 4.1 results for Dilemmas, Family Life and Relationships show very high support for the journals in being a resource for these areas. Personal challenge (from Table 4.1) and those dispositions in Table 4.2, indicate a great use in the journals in fostering these attitudes. Table 4.3 is more general but the usefulness of the journal index and back issues is clearly seen. It would appear that use of the journals also provides a good way to listen to children's views. Inclusion and ethos are also fostered through their use, while 77% of the respondents reported that they helped promote a good national ethos.

**Table 4.1**

<b>School Journals deal well with:</b>	<b>1</b> <i>Strongly agree</i>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b> strongly disagree	Percentage in agreement
Personal challenge	5 teachers	5	0	0	100%
Dilemmas	8	2	0	0	100%
Family life	8	2	0	0	100%
Relationships	8	2	0	0	100%

**Table 4.2**

<b>School Journals dispose young people to:</b>	<b>1</b> <i>Strongly agree</i>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b> strongly disagree	Percentage in agreement
Be creative	7 teachers	1	1	0	88%
Have a healthy 'Can do' attitude	8	1	0	0	100%

**Table 4.3**

<b>On School Journals generally:</b>	<b>1</b> strongly agree	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b> strongly disagree	Percentage in agreement
The journal Index is useful	7 teachers	0	0	0	100%
I regularly use back issues of the journals	10	0	0	0	100%
They are a good medium to teach social skills	5	3	1	0	88%
<b>On School Journals generally:</b>	<b>1</b> strongly agree	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b> strongly disagree	Percentage in agreement
They are a good way to listen to children's views	7 teachers	3	0	0	100%
They promote a feeling of inclusion	6	3	0	1	90%
They help promote a good class ethos	6	2	1	0	88%
They help promote a good national ethos	5	2	1	1	77%

Tables I and II (appendices 3 and 4) tabulate the findings from questionnaire Sections 1 and 2. They are based on the number of teachers who reported teaching a particular target. From Tables I and II it can be seen that all targets are taught, but not by all teachers. Sometimes all ten respondents addressed a particular target but on one occasion only one teacher did so. The percentage figures show how many of these teachers found the school journal 'extremely useful' or 'used [them]regularly'. The final column indicates the percentage of teachers who used the journals as source material when addressing a target.

The targets in Sections 1 and 2 of the questionnaire have been divided into five broad categories, namely;

- issues associated with national identity
- local issues
- national issues

- global social/humanities issues
- global environmental issues

The component teaching targets of Sections 1 and 2 have been extracted, and collated in Tables III to VII (see appendices 5 to 9).

Table III (appendix 5) shows that many teachers addressed the National Identity issues when teaching and used the journals as a resource for this, with all teachers using the journal for teaching about heritage and tradition. The journals provide resource material for encouraging appreciation of New Zealand's past.

Table IV (appendix 6) brings together the Local Issues targets. From the table it can be concluded that the journals provide useful resources for highlighting opportunities for individuals and volunteers to bring about change, for teaching about recycling and conservation, for valuing cultural diversity, and considering that actions have consequences. A sensitive and difficult topic like anti-racism is also covered in the journals. Four of the five teachers who work on valuing volunteers report finding the journal 'extremely useful'. From the table it can be assumed that the journal is a source for promoting high self esteem.

Table V (appendix 7) collates National Issues pertinent to pupils. Much of the journal content is of social interest so is a ready source of material for dealing with social justice and other social issues (see Table 4.3). Those teachers who tackled the role of the media and marketing in decision making processes in society (only 3 teachers and 2 teachers respectively), found resource material in the journals. Two of the only

three teachers to work on the topic of homelessness found the journal ‘extremely useful’.

Table VI (appendix 8) brings together the results of the global social and humanity issues. One of the notable things shown in this table is the smaller number of teachers addressing these issues. The challenges faced by developing countries is a topic high on the list of teaching targets for Development Education although it is very poorly addressed by New Zealand teachers. The author speculates that resources for teaching these issues were not easily sourced by teachers, and might not have been available in the journals. Teachers addressing the first eight targets found the journals useful. The low number of teachers addressing the issues of the final five targets did not report finding the journals useful. The author believes that this is a telling set of results, highlighting the importance of the journals to teachers in New Zealand.

Table VII (appendix 9), dealing with global environmental issues, reveals that generally a high proportion of teachers deal with these points. From those who do, it can be seen that the journal was regularly used as a resource. The four teachers only who addressed the teaching target ‘Demonstrate a sense of responsibility for their global neighbours’ all used the journal as a source of teaching material.

The author believes that Tables III – VII demonstrate the wide variety of topics covered by the journals, and how consistently used these are by New Zealand teachers, while Tables 4.1 – 4.3 show how well regarded they are. It is acknowledged that the sample size is very small, though tentative generalisations can be made. It should be remembered that School Journals are designed primarily as a Reading and

Writing resource, and their impressive, yet incidental, use as a resource for the promotion of citizenship is secondary to this purpose.

Objective 3 A total of eighteen Scottish questionnaires were returned from eight local authorities. Many respondents did not fully complete the questionnaires and the analysis is therefore based on the responses actually provided. Because of the incomplete responses, the average scores for the ratings quoted by respondents have been used.

The results from the Scottish questionnaires have been recorded on Tables VIII to XI (appendices 10 to 13), corresponding to the sections of the questionnaire. Ratings of 1 to 4 inclusive, produce a mean score of 2.5. In other words, a score from 1 to 2.5 indicates an agreement with the teaching target and resourcing statements, and a score from 2.5 to 4 indicates disagreement with the statements. On each of the tables an 'X' in the centre column indicates a target taken from 'Education for Citizenship'. In the tables, a topic which is recorded as not being taught is invariably recorded as being difficult to resource. The author believes this correlation is important: for a target to be addressed, the source material must be easily available to teachers.

Table VIII, (appendix 10) shows that thirteen of the twenty two Knowledge and Understanding targets used in the questionnaire are from 'Education for Citizenship'. Of these, three are recorded as not being taught (and difficult to resource), and another six as difficult to resource. Of the remainder of the targets, recommended from elsewhere as suitable for education for citizenship, one is not taught (and

difficult to resource) and another is difficult to resource. It would appear that teachers are happy with the other targets, both in coverage in and resourcing.

Table IX (appendix 11) shows that all the Skills and Competencies targets used are taken from 'Education for Citizenship' and are all taught, with only one rating indicating a difficulty with resourcing. The first column indicates that these areas are very well addressed by teachers.

Table X (appendix 12), showing the results of the Values and Dispositions aspect of the questionnaire, uses the ten suggested learning outcomes from 'Education for Citizenship'. Two of these are recorded as not addressed (and difficult to resource) and an additional four recorded as difficult to resource. In other words, six of these ten suggested learning outcomes from 'Education for Citizenship' present difficulties for teachers sourcing teaching material. The outcome suggested by Twine is not addressed, and difficult to resource. Twenty two more targets were suggested by others including Developmental Education, one of which is not taught, and with an additional seven being addressed but difficult to resource.

On Table XI (appendix 13), in the Creativity and Enterprise aspect, only the suggested targets in 'Education for Citizenship' were used. Only one of these is not addressed (and difficult to resource) and another difficult to resource only.

The author is of the opinion that there would appear to be an issue with teachers finding easily resourced teaching materials. From the averaged ratings received in the returned questionnaires, six of the 'Education for Citizenship' suggested targets are

not addressed (and difficult to resource) and an additional eleven are not easy to resource. Therefore, of the total forty suggested learning outcomes in ‘Education for Citizenship’, seventeen (42.5%) are proving difficult for teachers to resource.

The targets in the Scottish questionnaire were similarly divided into five broad bands, namely:

- issues associated with national identity
- local issues
- national issues
- global social/humanities issues
- global environmental issues

From these, results were collated as shown on Table 4.4.

**Table 4.4**

<b>Teaching target issues</b>	Number of targets	Number not being addressed by respondents	Number addressed, but difficult to resource
National identity	4	0	0
Local	13	0	2
National	15	2	4
Global social/humanity	13	3	7
Global environmental	6	0	2

From these ratings it can be seen that all four national identity issue targets are reported as being addressed and easily resourced.

Of the thirteen local issues targets, two are recorded as being difficult to resource.

Of the fifteen national issues targets, two are not addressed, with an additional four being difficult to resource.

Of the thirteen global social/humanity issues, three are not addressed and seven of the others, though taught, are not easily resourced.

All the global environmental issues are addressed, but two of the six are difficult to resource.

From these results the author believes that there appears to be a lack of appropriate and easily accessible source material for the social/humanities aspect of global education. Ten out of thirteen (77%) of the targets are recorded as proving difficult to resource. From the above table, citizenship education of national issues also appears to be not easily resourced.

Thirteen of the fifteen national issues grouped in Table 4.4 are those suggested in 'Education for Citizenship'. Four of these are recorded as not being addressed (and difficult to resource) with an additional seven being difficult to resource. In other words, eleven of the thirteen suggested outcomes (85%) from 'Education from Citizenship' are reported as being not easily resourced.

Objective 4. There is certainly evidence in the comments received that there is no commonly understood concept of citizenship amongst teachers. One respondent reported that, after reading the questionnaire, she was concerned that she was not teaching citizenship issues. Another was relieved that she was teaching citizenship, although she did not realise she was.

The responses indicated there was a slight concern that citizenship might be a gimmick and a passing buzz word, and consequently not taken very seriously. The main area of concern, by far, was the 'time' factor in an ever expanding and what is recognised as an already overcrowded curriculum. In the contexts of planning, teaching and assessing, eleven of the respondents specifically mentioned lack of time as a problem.

The other main difficulty identified was the lack of appropriate resources to teach sometimes abstruse concepts. The diversity and vagueness of the topic, and the need for continuity and progression in the citizenship curriculum, highlight the importance of the provision of suitable resources. One respondent felt very strongly that if mathematics were to be taught with so few commercial resources, and left to the school or individual teacher to organise, there would be an uproar.

Suggestions for helpful resources were of four main types:

- internet web pages
- photocopiable packs graded A to E
- a collated reference book stating the resource, and its source.
- human resources

These should contain real life stories and situations, and have suggested activities and worksheets.

Scottish teachers were asked also to comment on a small sample of New Zealand School Journal material which was included with the questionnaire. All teachers,

without exception, indicated they would welcome a similar format in Scotland to provide resources on citizenship issues. Comments on the journals were varied, perceptive, and all were positive. Views were expressed that the articles:

- related to children
- were contemporary,
- of varied design
- covered a wide range of informative articles
- were child friendly, but non-patronising
- encouraged personal responsibility
- encouraged inclusiveness
- exemplified different genres
- provided many opportunities for good discussion and follow-up work

Objective 5. There is no doubt that all teachers in Scottish primary schools are addressing citizenship education issues. However, the author does not accept that all targets in a well balanced citizenship curriculum are being taught, and this for different reasons. There would seem to be a definite lack of easily accessed appropriate resource material available to teachers. For some of the learning outcomes this is a great problem. In addition, a perceived lack of expertise on the part of teachers does not encourage them to include certain targets in their programmes.

The teaching of citizenship allows some teachers to address social issues such as bullying and discrimination. For others, it is a way of introducing young people to issues that they will encounter in a civic situation. However, there is now a much

greater perception and acceptance of the notion of global citizens, and this concept is being addressed by many education systems worldwide.

In answer to the question, 'What should education for citizenship seek to achieve?', 'Education for Citizenship' states that it

*“should aim to develop capability for thoughtful and responsible participation in political, economic, social and cultural life. This capability is rooted in knowledge and understanding, in a range of generic skills and competencies, including ‘core skills’, and in a variety of personal qualities and dispositions. It finds expression through creative and enterprising approaches to issues and problems.”*

Knowledge and Understanding and Skills and Competencies can be taught in a straightforward didactic manner (though not necessarily with best results), but will not on their own realise the concept of 'active citizenship' envisaged in 'Education for Citizenship'. Effective citizenship encouraged through personal conviction and positive values and dispositions, plus a willingness to be active locally while thinking globally, are the new ingredients in a citizenship programme.

It is recommended that schools have an active participatory ethos. The author believes that this is only achievable if pupils feel empowered, and this in turn is affected by the degree of self esteem of the children. Having a low self esteem and a lack of pride in oneself, the author believes, basically prevents action. Perhaps, even as a first step to encouraging effective citizens, it is necessary to ensure that children

have a healthy sense of self, and a confidence in who they are and in their cultural heritage.

Osler, A and Vincent [9] maintain that having a full sense of citizenship requires a sense of belonging, or grounding, and that this can be encouraged through opportunities for critical reflection. The author believes that such an approach requires appropriate source material. One of the perceived advantages of School Journals is that they provide many opportunities for discussion over a wide range of informative articles written so as to be appealing to different ages groups of children. They also encourage inclusiveness and a good group ethos.

The author firmly believes that there is the opportunity for the introduction of a similar concept in Scotland. The changing world is forcing changing methods and approaches to education. The range of learning outcomes to which children will be exposed during education for citizenship is extremely wide. However, this is the same set of learning outcomes that teachers have to resource, plan for, teach and assess! It is not feasible that these targets be additional to either the curriculum or the workload. They must be dovetailed into existing programmes if they are to be properly addressed. Following the National Debate in Education it was concluded that the breadth and balance of the curriculum must be retained. By integrating a full citizenship syllabus into the curriculum, the breadth and balance remains unaffected.

The author believes that citizenship can be the unifying factor in the curriculum, but it cannot be taught in a vacuum. Settings in real life stories and situations give meaning

to mere information and encourage empathy. Instead of learning facts, pupils will be helped to understand their role and place in the world in which they live. It will give them time to think and talk, with no sense of right or wrong answers. Education for citizenship addresses all five of the National Priorities in Education. Given this, the author believes that full support should be given to the implementation of citizenship education.

The national priorities encourage flexibility and innovation and the author suggests that a new means of resourcing the learning outcomes similar in concept to School Journals, be developed for primary schools in Scotland.. Douglas Osler [10], suggests that education for citizenship in Scottish schools must have a Scottish perspective and set in an ethos which is conducive to the fostering of good citizenship. As a country, Scotland is small enough for people to come into personal contact with others from different areas and cultures, and as a nation, is involved in, and influenced by, global issues. It is big enough to be varied but small enough to be unified.

Respondents to the Scottish questionnaire were almost equally divided on their preference as to whether, should a similar resource to School Journals be introduced in Scotland, it be delivered electronically or in paper form. Each format has advantages over the other. In paper form, full colour could be used. If this were produced in A3 folded format, personal individual copies could be issued to all children to be taken home to share with parents once finished with in school. It would still be necessary that an electronic version was also available to have as a future

resource, especially as New Zealand teachers reported finding back numbers of the School Journal very useful.

Resources received electronically allows for a full journal to be downloaded intact, while the delivery of individual items allows a steady drip of fresh resource material to be available. However, this method does not lend itself to useful planning.

In either paper or electronic form, the author believes there are many advantages to such a concept. First, there is evidence, albeit from a small sample, that if a learning outcome is difficult to resource, then it may well not be addressed by teachers. Availability of appropriate resources, especially for an area that is seen by some teachers as a passing gimmick and an additional thing to teach, considerably improves its chances of being taught. Such a journal could easily resolve the difficult to resource learning outcomes in whatever age group. Equally importantly, it could also address those issues of greatest national or global importance at very short notice, and be continually updated. This might be seen as politically contentious, but if offered to schools as an available source, then it should not be seen as political meddling. Contributions could be invited from practising teachers, classes or from individual children themselves. This might indeed foster the sense of ownership of the topic which is encouraged by Learning and Teaching Scotland while distancing the notion of political manipulation.

If issued once a term, a wide range of learning outcomes would soon be addressed. The material could reasonably be available in different reading levels or in national

assessment A – E levels. This must be supplemented by an electronic index which is fully cross referenced and easily accessible.

One of the unique advantages of such a resource is that it can carry current and personal stories which can be updated and, after a fashion, serialised. Children are always attracted to personal scenarios and quickly become emotionally involved in an unfolding narrative. Material produced in this way would always be refreshing and interesting.

Along with each issue of the journal the author envisages an accompanying teacher's support sheet. For each of the stories, articles, plays, poems, menus etc, the citizenship learning outcomes addressed would be listed. Because citizenship in primary schools cannot be taught in a vacuum, those other learning outcomes addressed in the carrying feature would also be listed. By integrating citizenship teaching in the existing curriculum, it should be possible to be also addressing targets in such areas as language, study skills, technology, mathematics and religious festivals. Summaries of electronically available follow-up worksheets could be included in the teacher's section. Perhaps crib sheets could also be available to ensure that all the main points were extracted from an article. In order to further ensure children's interest in the journal, a short quiz could be included to be completed either at school or, preferably, at home, and a small prize offered each term for the national winner.

Another of the journal advantages is that it allows children to see positive role models, rather than being swamped by the bullies. It allows them to know what situations they may encounter and what others have done about it. By having the journal produced regularly, topic and lesson planning is made easier and more meaningful, and so citizenship would be more readily accepted by teachers as the important study that it is.

## **5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

One of the reasons that early attempts at citizenship education failed was that teachers were unwilling to get involved with a political hot potato. This is now updated as ‘political correctness’ and is still an issue that unnerves teachers. It is important that teachers are given support in this crucial area in this global climate.

More recently, in England, it was reported that secondary schools were struggling with the management of the implementation of citizenship [11]. Many schools considered citizenship as a ‘light touch’ subject and many others had opted to include it in existing personal, social and health programmes without considering the requirements of a national citizenship programme. This was considered to be proving unsatisfactory.

Ofsted inspectors [11] reported that,

*“Together, the idea of a ‘light touch’ and the presence of some citizenship elements may have promoted a degree of complacency, resulting in a low-key response to the citizenship initiative”.*

Ofsted inspectors argued that citizenship be clearly distinguished from other subjects, but this is not the intended approach in the Scottish situation. However, these reminders of failures in implementation are in order. Scotland has some benefit of hindsight in these early stages.

Four central conclusions are made by the author:

- it appears that many of the learning outcomes in a citizenship syllabus are proving difficult to resource
- learning outcomes which are difficult to resource might not be meaningfully addressed.
- School Journals are valued by New Zealand teachers.
- the concept of a 'Scottish Journal' is welcomed by Scottish primary teachers.

If a 'Scottish Journal' were introduced to support resourcing the learning outcomes in education for citizenship, the many advantages previously mentioned would hopefully accrue to pupils, teachers, schools, education authorities, the Scottish Executive and, ultimately, the nation.

The sample numbers in this study are small and the author draws only tentative conclusions. Clarification of the findings requires further research with larger samples used.

## **6. REFERENCES**

- [1] “Education for Citizenship in Scotland: A Paper for Discussion and Development”, Learning and Teaching Scotland, 2002.
- [2] Madeley, H. M. “History as a School of Citizenship”, Oxford University Press quoted in “The history of the teaching of civics and citizenship in English schools”. Batho, G., The Curriculum Journal,1 (1990), 91)
- [3] “The history of citizenship education in England.” Heater, D., The Curriculum Journal, 12, (2001), 103)
- [4] Strong, C. F. “Teaching for International Understanding: An Examination of Methods and Materials”, HMSO, London, (1952)
- [5] Crick, B. “Final Report of the Advisory Group on Citizenship and the Teaching of Democracy in Schools”, Qualifications and Curriculum Authority, (1998)
- [6] McConnell, J., First Minister “An International Outlook 2000”, quoted in International Development Education Association of Scotland, Annual Report 2002
- [7] Jamieson, C. then Minister for Education and Young People, quoted in preface to ‘Education for Citizenship in Scotland’, (2002)
- [8] Twine, C., Learning and Teaching Scotland Development Officer, offered during “RME in the Crowded Curriculum”, a one day conference held on 20 September, 2003
- [9] Osler, A. and Vincent, K., “Citizenship and the Challenge of Global Education”, Trentham Books, Stoke on Trent, (2002)
- [10] Osler, D. “Education for Citizenship in the new Scotland”. Gordon Cook Foundation Conference ‘Education for Citizenship’ (1999)

[11] Ofsted Inspectors in BBC Education news. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/education/303824>

July 2003

[12] Young, M. with Commins, E., “Global Citizenship: The Handbook for Primary Teaching”, Chris Kington Publishing for Oxfam, Oxford, (2002)

## APPENDICES

[Available on request from GTCS. Email : [dean.robson@gtc.org.uk](mailto:dean.robson@gtc.org.uk)]

Appendix 1	Questionnaire for Scottish teachers
Appendix 2	Questionnaire for New Zealand teachers
Appendix 3	Table I New Zealand results for Section 1 of questionnaire
Appendix 4	Table II New Zealand results for Section 2 of questionnaire
Appendix 5	Table III New Zealand national identity collated targets
Appendix 6	Table IV New Zealand local issues collated targets
Appendix 7	Table V New Zealand national issues collated targets
Appendix 8	Table VI New Zealand global social/humanity issues collated targets
Appendix 9	Table VII New Zealand global environmental issues collated targets
Appendix 10	Table VIII Scottish results for Section 1 Knowledge and Understanding
Appendix 11	Table IX Scottish results for Section 2 Skills and Competencies
Appendix 12	Table X Scottish results for Section 3 Values and Dispositions
Appendix 13	Table XI Scottish results for Section 4 Creativity and Enterprise