



Teacher Researcher Programme 2003/2004

**Generalists or Specialists for the
P4 Expressive Arts Curriculum :
A Comparative Study of Models of
Delivery**

**Susan Hay
St George's School for Girls, Edinburgh**

gtc
SCOTLAND

Acknowledgements

Through the entire process of this Research Report, from application to submission, I have received unfailing support from my school. Both management and colleagues have encouraged me with their interest and enthusiasm, and this facilitated the progress of my work.

In particular, I would like to thank our school Research Fellow, for her tireless and committed approach to research initiatives, within our school community. I found her support to be invaluable.

Synopsis

This study examines the delivery of the Expressive Arts in the Primary Four curriculum by the generalist and by the specialist. It evaluates the benefits and limitations to each model.

Generalists feel their own competence is unevenly spread over areas of the Expressive Arts. A lack of self-confidence, especially in Drama, affects the organisation and outcome of the lesson. A need for better resources and adequate CPD opportunities to support the class teacher is highlighted.

The experience and expertise of the specialist provides an effective and desirable learning platform. This view is upheld by the specialists, generalists and the children in the study sample. Establishing and maintaining good communication links with the generalist strengthens the value of specialist support and would seem to minimise the problem of a large number of pupil contacts and time constraints.

A good working partnership of the two models is important for a successful learning outcome.

Contents

	Synopsis	Page 3
Chapter 1	Introduction	Page 6
	1.0 The Problem	
	1.1 The Objectives of the Research Project	
	1.2 The Importance of the Research Project	
	1.3 Examining the Problem	
Chapter 2	Literature Review	Page 10
	2.0 What is meant by Expressive Arts?	
	2.1 The Expressive Arts in the P4 Curriculum	
	2.2 The Generalist Approach	
	2.3 The Specialist Approach	
Chapter 3	Methodology	Page 20
Chapter 4	Findings and Discussion	Page 24
	4.0 Results	
	4.1 Discussion and Analysis	
	4.2 Limitations of the Results	
Chapter 5	Conclusion	Page 36
Chapter 6	Recommendations	Page 41

References Page 43

Bibliography Page 46

Appendices Page 48

Chapter 1

Introduction

1.0 The Problem

A variety of methods is used to deliver the Expressive Arts in primary schools.

The general aim of this research project is, within the framework of the P4 curriculum, to explore the benefits and limitations of Expressive Arts areas being taught completely by the generalist, in comparison to the generalist working in partnership with a specialist, where and when support is available.

An investigation was carried out in a school with specialist teaching available in Music and Physical Education throughout the session. This is compared to an associated school with limited or no access to specialist teaching in these areas.

1.1 The Objectives of the Research Project

The objectives are to:

- establish the benefits and limitations of the Expressive Arts being taught by a specialist, from the perspectives of class teachers, specialist teachers and children
- establish the benefits and limitations of the Expressive Arts being taught by a generalist from the perspectives of class teachers, specialist teachers and children

- explore the adequacy of resources and CPD opportunities within schools to facilitate the teaching of Expressive Arts by the generalist.

1.2 The Importance of the Research Project

The importance of specialist support in the area of Expressive Arts is great. Through working with and observing specialists, the class teacher learns to acquire new skills and apply them, to achieve the most successful outcome. Levels of confidence are increased which can result in more positive teaching of the Expressive Arts areas, and a more self-assured approach. Not only is this of use to practitioners in education, but also research indicates it is of benefit to the children's learning. Experts, who can demonstrate and transfer skills, instruct them in the most constructive and beneficial way.

There are strong feelings from both specialists and generalists 'on the ground' against the national decision to phase out specialist teaching. To maintain, or ideally increase the current level of specialist support would seem important, in spite of financial implications. The generalists, in the sample, all expressed the desire to work in partnership with specialists. The current situation in Scottish schools, as an example, with devolved budgets, results in the amount of specialist support being at the discretion of the head teacher. There is no central funding or allocation and the level of specialist support can vary dramatically from school to school. It is important that all children are exposed to the best teaching possible, and that specialist support is widespread and evenly distributed.

With a reduction in specialist support to schools, the generalist faces the burden of demanding curricular areas, where specific skills are required for successful delivery. To address these difficulties, it would be advantageous to provide better CPD opportunities for generalists, to develop confidence and competence, especially in areas where specialist support is unavailable.

1.3 Examining the Problem

The first step in examining the problem was to become familiar with the literature already published around specialist versus generalist teaching.

This is a large area encompassing many subjects, and so the decision was taken to restrict the research to the area of Expressive Arts. Both schools in the sample had different models of specialist support available, and so this gave the opportunity to draw comparisons.

As the researcher is currently teaching in Primary 4, it was considered that to narrow the research to this stage, would allow a better focus.

It was important to get the views of P4 generalists, specialists and the P4 children, and so a number of possible data-gathering techniques were considered.

Limited time and resources available to someone doing research on top of a full-time job, led the researcher to choose the interview over the questionnaire. The latter covers large numbers and the sample used was a small-scale illustrative one. Ideally, a larger sample yields more data and is reflective of a broader population, but again time restrictions influenced the choice. The structured interview provided rich information from all selected interviewees: it was a more flexible

technique than a questionnaire and very productive. More particularly, it was favoured as being the most sensitive way to deal with attitudes and feelings. The disadvantages were that some interviews were postponed because of staff absences. Questionnaires, on the other hand, can be completed at leisure. Another drawback is that interviewing people takes time, careful planning and organisation. Interviewing also requires skill: it is a different technique from asking questions in the classroom. As a novice it can be a daunting prospect, but once the interview schedule has been planned and structured carefully, discussed critically, piloted and modified, the interviewer can proceed with more confidence. It is then important to put the interviewee at ease so that the responses to the questions provide a good quality of information.

Choosing a sample was the next step, and again the limitations of time led to the direction of a small-scale illustrative sample. The research was mainly a case study of the two schools, and did not aim to cover a large number. The focus was on a number of people who work together but have different roles.

It was important to add the views of the P4 children to the research and so informal focus discussions, with small groups of children, took place in each school. This was regarded as the best forum for the children to express their views and opinions to the researcher. It was less daunting than a one-to-one interview.

Chapter 2

Literature Review

2.0 What is meant by Expressive Arts?

The Expressive Arts encompass four subjects: Art and Design, Music, Drama and Physical Education. These constitute curricular areas, which place

“special emphasis on developing creativity, imagination and personal response in individual pupils.” (1)

The rationale for Expressive Arts is described in the national guidelines as promoting distinctive ways of understanding self, developing individual abilities and finding personal satisfaction and enjoyment. It provides important ways for children to express their ideas, feelings and imagination through pictures, paintings, models, rôle-play, music-making and participation in dancing, singing and games, as well as encouraging the acquisition of certain skills.

An Expressive Arts programme adds richness and colour to a child’s life. It

“contributes to children’s learning about themselves and the world and to the development of social, intellectual, physical and communication skills. In developing the expressive and aesthetic experiences the emphasis should be on the enjoyment, expression and learning which takes place during the experience rather than on finished products.” (2)

The beauty of Expressive Arts is that in the normal learning and teaching situation, the four subjects can often overlap and be interdependent. They share concepts, skills and processes, and they also have profitable links with other areas of the curriculum. Concepts and skills from a 'core' area of the curriculum can be developed and extended using expressive media. This can enrich children's experience and understanding, especially as for some it can offer an alternative learning mode. In each area of the Expressive Arts, it is important to remember that the process is as important as the outcome.

2.1 The Expressive Arts in the P4 Curriculum

Expressive Arts are an integral part of the primary school curriculum. As well as opportunities to **learn in** Expressive Arts, there are additional opportunities to **learn through** Expressive Arts in connection with activities in other areas of the curriculum.

The Scottish Office Education Department, in Working Paper No. 1 on Curriculum and Assessment in Scotland, *The Balance of the Primary Curriculum* (1989) emphasise that just as balance and breadth in the whole curriculum is desirable, so it is with the Expressive Arts. Each subject has its own unique contribution to make and must be given due consideration in an Expressive Arts programme.

Due to this distinctive nature, the Expressive Arts are taught in a variety of ways, each with advantages and limitations.

2.2 The Generalist Approach to the Teaching of Expressive Arts.

In this approach the responsibility for delivering the Expressive Arts programme lies with the classroom teacher. He/she prepares and plans the lesson and provides the necessary resources, materials and equipment. The classroom teacher then evaluates the lesson and a variety of assessment approaches is applied.

One of the strengths of this model is that the class teacher keeps in sight an overview of the child's whole experience and can ensure it is evenly balanced, differentiated or developed, according to the individual's needs.

“The rationale for generic class teaching is simple: education is one thing, and the child is one whole being given to his or her whole experience. Someone - the class teacher- needs to keep in sight an overview of the child's experience to ensure a balanced and even development. The teacher knows the children, and knows what they each individually need.” (3)

Another argument for this model is that the class teacher can integrate the Expressive Arts material with other areas of the curriculum to give the work another dimension through a cross-curricular approach. This can also offer an alternative learning platform, which is generally accepted as valuable teaching practice in primary classrooms.

“An eight year old needs the security of a continuous relationship with his teacher, where learning is wide-ranging and not limited by subject boundaries.”

(4)

However, the effectiveness of this model comes into question in terms of the class teacher’s particular skills, interests and competencies in each area of the Expressive Arts. In her **review for UCET: Subject Specialists – Primary Schools, Thornton (1998)** (5) points out that it is the lack of subject knowledge that is the main weakness of the generalist class teacher model.

This can affect a teacher’s level of confidence, which is a key issue in delivering a successful lesson. Hall (1998) found out that teacher confidence in the area of Expressive Arts was investigated in a study of primary school provision for teaching the arts in Australia. This confirmed that many teachers have little experience of the arts in their own education and are not confident in teaching them. This can result in uncertainty on the generalist’s part on how to build upon skills in Expressive Arts areas.

In research done in primary schools in 1990, Green found that few class teachers

“had developed an understanding of art processes through personal involvement. Most felt unsure of what their pupils might be learning from their art experience: of what concepts the pupils were developing, on how their knowledge might be identified or expressed.”

(6)

In extreme cases, those with little confidence in their ability may even stop teaching a particular area all together. The range of work to be covered places such heavy

demands on the generalist's knowledge and skills that some teachers are unable to meet these demands.

A one-teacher system is a source of concern, for it has been argued that

“as the scope of the curriculum widens, many teachers are finding difficulty in coping and are reducing the quality of their work as they increase the quantity.”

(7)

On the other hand, it can be argued that the skills and techniques are only means to participate in the process. Rather than focusing on the product, the most important element is the creative process.

Effective teaching depends upon the successful combination of not only the skills needed to teach subjects successfully, but also the understanding of how children learn, and especially how they learn at each particular stage of development. This is where the generalist's expertise lies.

The main advantage of the generalist approach is that the child is right at the centre of the teaching with the support of a class teacher who interacts daily with the child, and so can build up a sound relationship and realistic expectations, based on the individual's needs and personality.

2.3 The Specialist Approach to the Teaching of Expressive Arts.

An alternative to the class teacher's taking responsibility for the whole curriculum is that a subject specialist is involved to deliver certain areas of the curriculum. The real joys of a specialist teacher are the wealth of skills and genuine abilities, married with

a confident approach. The importance of knowing a subject well is of paramount importance in delivering it successfully to the young learner.

The current trend is to reduce the level of specialism in primary schools, but this disregards the opinions of Alexander, Rose and Woodhead (1992) who argue for retaining an element of specialist teaching.

“...the proposal that specialisation be restricted to certain year groups ignores the important point that all primary teaching needs curricular expertise.” (8)

The main advantage of specialist teaching is that

“the subject specialist brings a high level of subject knowledge to their teaching.” (9)

In the specialist approach the responsibility for delivering the Expressive Arts programme lies with more than one teacher. The Expressive Arts subjects are divided and presented by teachers with subject specialism in Art and Design, Music, Drama and Physical Education, who supplement the teaching of the ‘core’ subjects by the generic class teacher. Indeed, a specialist may teach in any or all of these areas.

There are several different models within specialist teaching:

A specialist can be based within the school community on a permanent basis and teaching their subject throughout the academic session.

Within a school, a class teacher may have a particular talent or interest in one of the Expressive Arts areas and elect to teach several classes within the school in her select area. This team-teaching approach is favoured in many schools and staff often depend on the support of the ‘semi-specialists’.

A specialist may visit the primary school and take full responsibility for the teaching of his/her subject, but only for a specific block of time, with certain classes and in an allocated time-slot.

A specialist may be invited to come into the school to deliver his/her specialist area on a one-off basis, either to support ongoing work in the classroom or just to develop one particular area.

Rather than sole use of one model, most schools consider a combination as the most effective teaching platform.

A specialist has definite skills and expertise and should be able to use these to deliver his/her specialist area with confidence, effectiveness and enthusiasm. This can be of enormous benefit to the young learner.

Alexander, Rose and Woodhead (1992) hold the view that

“subject knowledge is a critical factor at every point in the teaching process: in planning, assessing and diagnosing, task-setting, questioning, explaining and giving feedback.” (10)

In a study of the provision in Expressive Arts by HM Inspectors of Schools (1993) it is reported that

“Pupils generally enjoyed, and benefited from, the added variety and expertise which visiting teachers brought to their learning experience.” (11)

However, there are possible limitations to involving specialists. This view is explored by Thornton (1998).

“What really matters is the quality of teaching.” (12)

This is a subject-oriented approach, and as such there is a risk of compartmentalising knowledge rather than integrating it across the curriculum. Links to other curricular areas should be evident to ensure continuity of content and experience.

“ While the post of visiting teacher had attracted some individualists who were happy to rely on their own resources, the position often imposed fragmentation of experience and a sense of professional isolation on specialists who felt that, as a result, their contribution was less effective than it otherwise could have been.”

(13)

The Report goes on to consider another constraint of the specialist model: the restricted time that a specialist could spend in schools.

“The pattern of deployment of some visiting teachers was too fragmented, involving too many contacts with different schools and pupils, resulting in

some loss of effectiveness and job satisfaction.” (14)

Less satisfaction can sometimes result in a negative effect on teaching.

There must also be sufficient time allowed for consultation between specialist and school. Where the child is at the centre of learning, an effective model of delivery must rely on good communication between the specialist and the class teacher. If these partnerships do not exist then the specialist’s input can be counter-productive.

Hall points out that

“As long ago as 1986, the US journal *Design for Arts in Education* (Mahlmann et al, 1986) ran a special edition under the title ‘Who Teaches: Specialist, Generalist, Visiting Artist?’. They concluded that here was a place for everyone and that ‘partnerships’ should flourish.”
“...expertise needs to inform curriculum planning and teaching, directly and meaningfully, for every year group, class and pupil.”

(15)

Involving specialists in a whole range of ways clearly has enormous value. They can challenge, enrich and deepen the learner’s experience. This is dependent on schools having a range of teaching expertise and good communication between specialist and class teacher.

“This means balancing the pupil’s need for security and stability with their need to follow a curriculum which, because it is rooted in secure subject knowledge, is challenging and stimulating.” (16)

These are the vital ingredients for successful learning, and for the child to derive most benefit from the Expressive Arts.

The literature review shows that there are clearly benefits and limitations to each model, both the specialist and generalist. It is interesting therefore to evaluate these and establish the benefits and limitations from the perspectives of those most closely involved, the generalists, the specialists and the pupils. A small investigation was carried out to sample these views.

Chapter 3

Methodology

The focus of the research is the differing roles of specialist staff working either independently of, or in partnership with the P4 class teachers in contrast to the general class teacher taking full responsibility for an area of the Expressive Arts curriculum. The study involved collecting data in a school, which follows the latter model, and in the researcher's own school, where specialist support is available. This will allow an examination of the benefits and limitations of each model of delivery. All data was collected during the winter term.

The two sample primary schools in Edinburgh, were used to collect illustrative material, with a view to analysis and discussion, and examining links with issues that have been raised in literature.

Reviewing the literature was a springboard into an awareness of pertinent work already carried out in the field of specialist versus generalist teaching in the P4 Expressive Arts curriculum. A desk top study of the literature in this area offered the chance to build on what is already known.

Scrutiny of school documents and Expressive Arts policies gave a background of the two schools that would be used in the research report.

Background of Sample School

School A

School A is an independent school, founded in 1888. It occupies modern, purpose-built accommodation surrounded by extensive garden and play areas.

The Primary department, or Junior School, has a nursery and five year groups:

Primary 1 – Primary 5. Class size ranges from 16 – 21 and the Junior School roll is currently 282.

Specialist teachers take classes in Music and Physical Education from Primary 1, and in Art from Primary 5. The class teacher is responsible for all other areas of the curriculum.

The Junior School offers a broad and balanced curriculum and the Expressive Arts is a valued area, with specialist teaching taking place in Primary 4, five times a week.

There are two 40-minute periods of Music and three 40-minute periods of Physical Education.

School B

School B is a City of Edinburgh denominational school. It is situated with Leith Links, directly in front of the school, being a natural extension to the playground.

The school accommodates 270 children in eleven classes, from P1 through to P7, and has two nursery classes, which cater for the needs of 80 pre-school children. Class size ranges from 16 – 30.

Specialist support is currently available to P1- P7 in Art and Physical Education on a rotating timetable, in blocks of 4-5 weeks. The class teacher is responsible for all other areas of the curriculum.

The Expressive Arts are an important, integral part of the curriculum, and each area of the Expressive Arts is given an allocation of time on a weekly basis. Specialist teachers complement and extend the work done by the class teachers. Each year group has a total of 10-12 sessions with the Art specialist, each lasting for about an hour and a quarter. A similar amount of time is given to specialist support in Physical Education.

A preliminary visit to the partner school was set up, and informal observations were carried out to establish contact with P4 members of staff, both the generalists and the specialists.

On the next two visits, a small-scale illustrative study was carried out, and then repeated in the researcher's own school. Eight separate interviews were conducted with specialists and generalists in a pre-arranged formal situation. Each interview consisted of material related to the objectives of the research project, and lasted for about twenty-five minutes. The teachers were asked questions from a schedule, relating to their roles. (See Appendices One and Two)

Background information from observation in classes, and informal conversations with both generalist and specialist staff in the sample schools, were also used to supply further information.

Four structured 20-minute focus discussions with groups of 6-8 children were carried out, in each of the schools. These were formally led by the researcher, and gave an evaluative response from the children involved in the sample. (See Appendix Three)

Transcripts were made of each interview and the data was put onto tables to provide an easily understood format and to facilitate ready analysis.

Exemplar table

What are the good things about your class teacher teaching you Expressive Arts?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p>Case A</p> <p>She's calm</p>	
<p>Case B</p> <p>She knows about cross-country. She's fun. She'd get fit.</p> <p>She knows about what we like to do and what we find easiest.</p> <p>Don't know if she knows instruments.</p>	
<p>Case C</p> <p>She explains things properly</p>	
<p>Case D</p> <p>She knows us better</p>	

Chapter 4

Findings and Discussion

Responses from interviews and focus groups are presented in tables with text, which illustrate the data gathered in the two sample schools.

The first set of tables refers to the responses of the generalists (see appendix one). The second set refers to the responses of the specialists in the sample (see appendix two).

The responses of the children in the focus discussions are highlighted in the final set of tables (see appendix three).

4.0 Results

The overall view, of each specialist in the sample, is that the benefits of the specialist model greatly out-weigh any limitations.

For the generalists, the main limitations were a lack of self-confidence and technical knowledge in some areas of the Expressive Arts, especially Drama. They valued the support of specialists and indicated a desire to increase the amount available to them.

The majority of the focus children recognised the expertise of the specialist as providing the best platform for learning.

CPD opportunities and resources are available but need to be reviewed to suit the level of skill and knowledge of the user.

4.1 Discussion and Analysis

The data gathered was meant to be illustrative rather than definitive. The sample was small and included schools with contrasting levels of specialist support available.

As a result of the research conducted, a number of issues emerged that are worthy of discussion and further consideration. The areas in question, relate to the research objectives:

- exploring the benefits and limitations of the Expressive Arts being taught by a specialist, from the perspectives of class teachers, specialist teachers and children
- exploring the benefits and limitations of the Expressive Arts being taught by a generalist from the perspectives of class teachers, specialist teachers and children
- examining the adequacy of resources and CPD opportunities within schools to facilitate the teaching of Expressive Arts by the generalist.

The objectives interrelate, and as such the discussion cuts across each of them in different places.

Limitations of Generalist Model

The research highlighted that each respondent agreed that specialist support is required in each area of Expressive Arts. The generalists felt this allows the class

teacher to work in partnership with the specialist, observing and learning from him/her. Teachers in the sample, with specialist support on rotation, could later use and develop some of these ideas in their own Expressive Arts lessons. Their responses confirmed a lack of self-confidence, which generalists feel, in some areas of the Expressive Arts, especially in Drama. It is of interest to note that of the generalists in the sample, there was only one teacher in her probationary year, but even with some years of teaching experience, this lack of self-confidence was evident in the others' responses. The focus children also highlighted this lack of teacher confidence. One child said his class teacher "had not really learned about these".

This lack of confidence could be the result of insufficient teacher training programmes and CPD opportunities in this area, or a need for more supported programmes of study for the class teacher to use. This would support the view of Hall (1998) who found out that if teachers have little experience of the arts in their own education and training, they are usually not confident in teaching them.

This was highlighted by the research: all respondents, both specialists and generalists, strongly agreed that more CPD opportunities, in Expressive Arts areas, would be of benefit. One specialist, in particular, emphasised that courses should take into account the existing knowledge of the specialist. Courses should challenge the specialist and be able to extend and enrich their professional understanding.

The research indicated that generalists, in the sample, find it difficult to build a progression of skills in Expressive Arts. This again could be contributed to lack of confidence, or, as most of the respondents felt, a lack of expert knowledge and skills. Thornton (3) highlighted this as a major weakness of the generalist teacher model.

The children's replies suggested an awareness of this lack of competence. "Miss X wouldn't be able to show us as well. She'd have to practise. Her examples might be clumsy, and in PE, she might have an accident and then we wouldn't have a teacher!"

The generalists, in the sample, felt other limitations were that the organisation of the Expressive Arts lesson was difficult for them, and there seemed to be a sense of insufficient ideas. One child's response supported this. "She stops sometimes because she reads it off a sheet and she loses her place."

It would appear that the joy of the Expressive Arts is at risk of being lost if the teacher cannot engage fully with it.

One surprising result was the view that, in one respondent's case, the lack of expertise in one area of Expressive Arts actually inspired her to allocate more time to improving her self-confidence and teaching skills. This is not a view referred to in any literature read, but suggests that she might be the exception to the rule. It is also likely she might be one of many primary teachers who continually endeavour to improve and hone their personal development and skills.

Benefits of Generalist Model

The views of respondents, regarding the benefits of the generalist teaching the Expressive Arts, centred around their ability to make cross-curricular links more easily than the specialist. On the other hand, this was not seen as hugely important by the generalists, as the teachers in the sample felt that sometimes it was refreshing, for both them and the class, to allow Expressive Arts areas to be distinct. One teacher felt that it really wasn't necessary to "do a topic to death".

The responses of the children in the sample also supported this view. “It gives us a break from class work”. This is not an unexpected result as some of the Expressive Arts areas are skill-based and require to be taught separately. The very nature of teaching demands different strategies to meet the needs of children with individual learning styles.

Some children felt that their class teacher understood their learning style better than the specialist. “They just want it to be perfect. They just know so much!” One child said that “she explains things really fast and it’s hard to understand what to do.” This is another argument for ensuring good communication between the generalist and specialist, so that the latter may be attentive to the children’s different learning abilities.

Another benefit of the generalist model for teaching Expressive Arts is identified by Thornton (3). This puts the child at the heart of learning, and suggests that it is the generalist who is most knowledgeable about each individual in the class, and their needs. This notion was examined in all the interviews and in the focus discussions with children. Most respondents were in agreement, but it was felt that efficient communication between generalist and specialist enables the specialist to be more aware of any special needs. One interesting result was that one generalist felt that knowing the children well could also be a drawback.

Another important finding was that each class teacher felt it was very worthwhile to observe when specialist support was available and to try to play an integral role in the Expressive Arts lesson. This allowed him/her to see a different side to the children

and to see that they achieve and perform differently in other areas of the curriculum.

Through the teaching and observation of the Expressive Arts, the class teacher can sometimes see another important dimension to the child, often hidden in core curricular areas.

One specialist felt that this partnership was also a benefit to the specialist: the class teacher's thorough knowledge of the children assisted in their lesson. "I carry too much information in my head and so having the class teacher with me is helpful."

Benefits of Specialist Model

There was a strong feeling amongst the children that they appreciated the break from class work to take part in Expressive Arts areas with different teachers. Most preferred to be taught by the specialist, if available, and the researcher found their responses insightful. They were astute enough, even at Primary Four stage, to appreciate the expertise of the specialist and to prefer this model of teaching to the generalist one. "She really knows what she's doing and she teaches you exactly what she knows."

"Our music teacher has been practising for a long time. She's very clever and knows lots of instruments. She can play the piano and turn over pages at the same time."

The specialist lesson was perceived as having better demonstrations and more cohesion. One group, in particular, found specialist lessons more enjoyable. This supports the previous view of the HM Inspectors of Schools (1993). (11)

The children in the sample also felt that the specialist was more able to give expert help and advice in their field.

On the other hand, some of the children felt that the enjoyment of the lesson was due to the nature of the activity, irrespective of the teacher.

One child's view was that a change of teacher was "...exciting, because getting someone else is fun." A contrasting view was that "You're just losing one teacher and gaining another."

There were only two children who would rather have their class teacher delivering the Expressive Arts. This was down to strict personal preferences for what they were familiar and comfortable with. It was not surprising that it was girls, who adored their class teacher, who expressed these views.

These differences in opinion show that no one strategy suits all children. While the majority prefer to be taught by the specialist, there are always some who respond better to who they know best, the generalist.

The interviews in Appendix Two, (the specialist interviews), strongly support the specialist model of delivering the Expressive Arts. It was felt by one respondent to be vital to the development of the child, that its inclusion was imperative, and of paramount importance to the child. This would uphold the views of Alexander, Rose and Woodhead (1992). (10)

All specialists in the sample felt that it was they who could ensure that children received the correct teaching and learning of skills from an early stage. They had extensive practical knowledge, and one respondent indicated that the specialist had the "ability to use the correct media or resources to produce the most successful outcome."

This was also the feeling of the focus children, who recognised that the specialists knew their subject “inside out.”

Another view was that the specialist was able to explore creativity satisfactorily and have a deeper understanding of concepts. One specialist’s opinion was that the generalist had “too much on her plate.” With the demands of the other curricular areas, it is unrealistic to expect the generalist to have an in-depth technical knowledge and skill base in each area of the Expressive Arts. This view is upheld by Blenkin and Kelly 1987. (7)

Another point that emerged was that the specialist model allows the children to learn interpersonal skills and extend their repertoire of relationships by having to relate to another adult. Being taught by specialists lays the foundation for the future and prepares them for subject-based teaching.

One specialist proposed that another advantage of using specialist support in primary schools, was that in some cases, it offered the class teacher valuable non-contact time for planning or classroom organisation.

Limitations of Specialist Model

Given the overwhelming support for specialist teaching, it was important also to assess limitations to the specialist model. One generalist argued that the specialist only sees the child in isolation and not as a ‘whole’. She might not know the children as well as the generalist did, but this was the only limitation she could think of.

It might be argued that specialist lessons, being freestanding from the rest of the curriculum, might lack cohesion, however a specialist has strategies to enable continuity in their lessons. This allows children to follow a set course and progression of skills. This was an area in which the generalist felt insecure. It is very important for the specialist to put these strategies into place and use them effectively for the benefit of the children. Some of the focus children reported that from week to week it was hard to remember what had been taught, “because you can’t fit it all in your mind.” It seemed that they remembered basics, but they knew their teacher “always goes over it and reminds us.”

The main criticism offered was the time constraint on the lesson. Some specialists in the sample felt that at times, they were not able to develop their lesson fully, being dictated to by the bell. It was felt that this point might favour the generalist model where there was more flexibility. The generalist is also able to integrate teaching points with other curricular areas and explore concepts thoroughly. It was clear from specialists’ responses in the sample that, this was not considered too much of a drawback, as every effort was made to draw links with curricular areas when possible. This relied on sound communication links between the generalist and the specialist. Both sets of teachers realised the worth of good channels of communication to foster cross-curricular links, and they made every effort to sustain these when necessary. The focus children were aware of this too. Indeed one child argued that such links “made you think more”.

It is interesting to note here that the children were not convinced of the importance of cross-curricular links. Several children said they felt that any cross-curricular links helped them to know their topic only slightly better.

Another view offered by a specialist was that she felt that an allocation of more time to her area of Expressive Arts, (physical education), would allow her to improve the children's basic fitness, and that this would reflect on achievement in core-curricular areas.

In the examination of the specialist model, the research considered the number of pupil contacts. The findings showed that the specialist was coming into contact with a large number of pupils, on average about 120/day. It is certain that some individuals will be known better than others, but it could be argued that it is an unrealistic expectation to profess to know such a huge number of children well. In spite of this, surprisingly, the specialist teachers did claim that they knew the children quite well. They indicated that by Primary Four stage, they had taught the children before in P1-3. This is an unexpected result because the large number of pupil contacts would seem to make it very difficult to know each individual child.

On the other hand, the views of the children contradicted the specialist view, as they all felt that their class teacher knew them best. "Sometimes Mrs X gets confused and doesn't know what class we are."

In one case, a run of absences by the specialist also resulted in feelings, expressed by the children, that the specialist might not know them so well.

The specialist model is certainly favoured by most respondents in the sample, but for it to be a successful method of delivering the Expressive Arts, it seems clear that good working relationships and communication with the generalist, are necessary for it to work effectively.

CPD Opportunities and Resources

Coupled with the provision of CPD opportunities, are the suitability and adequacy of resources. The generalists felt that resources were in need of updating and adapting. In some Expressive Arts areas, resources were limited and it was felt that more were required to support the curriculum. This view was generally reflected in the sample, and was seen as potentially being the vehicle, which would boost teacher self-confidence in areas like Drama. Benefits would be seen in learning and teaching. However, one view that was offered by a specialist was, that sticking rigidly to directions in books might not be such a good thing. Again it could be argued though that this provides a very necessary structure for those who are not experts or particularly confident.

Specialists also felt that more resources could support their teaching too. However, the problem of adequate funding is the issue here. Careful consideration should be taken when allocating funds to curricular areas, especially Drama.

4.2 Limitations of the Results

Consideration should be given to any possible limitations of results.

- This was a small sample providing illustrative data. In spite of being more impersonal, the questionnaire might have provided a broader coverage than the interview, although typically a low return can be expected. It might also have

offered confidentiality, providing more candid responses than the face-to-face interview.

- The researcher was an inexperienced interviewer. Some responses may have been coloured or inadequate prompts and probes used.
- One of the schools in the sample was the researcher's own school and this made it more difficult to be objective.
- In the sample, by chance, the generalists had little experience of teaching P4 in comparison to the specialists in the sample, who were experienced. This may have swayed results.
- Some interviewees felt slightly intimidated by the notion of research. There was the chance that interviewees gave the interviewer what they felt she might have expected.
- Confounding variables may have reduced the validity of results and made generalisations inaccurate. The sample contained a school from the independent sector and one from the maintained sector. It might have been preferable to compare two different modes of Expressive Arts delivery within the same sector.
- The reliability of using young children as respondents is questionable. Findings are based on children's arguments and notions, and not on educational points. It could be argued that a different researcher, on a different occasion might have drawn different responses.

Chapter 5

Conclusions

The purpose of this research was to explore the different models of teaching the Expressive Arts within the Primary Four curriculum, and to look at the benefits and limitations of the specialist and generalist models. The research also explored resources and CPD opportunities available to facilitate the teaching of Expressive Arts by the generalist.

5.0

To establish the benefits and limitations of the Expressive Arts being taught by a specialist from the perspectives of class teachers, specialist teachers and children.

Benefits

In view of the findings that there is a strong feeling that the specialist is the best person to deliver the Expressive Arts curriculum, there would seem to be a need to strengthen and increase levels of specialist support. The specialist can marry a confident approach with expertise and experience. The research suggested that both specialists and generalists in the sample, felt that the specialist was more able to achieve the correct development and progression of skills. It would seem important for the generalist to take every opportunity to learn from the specialist through observation, as this could provide a rich source of ideas and teaching strategies to improve practice.

The sample children agreed that the specialist could offer better tuition, demonstrations and support, when advice was required. If a child can detect a lack of

confidence on the class teacher's part, especially in aesthetic areas, this could undermine the teaching and learning relationship.

Limitations

The findings also indicated certain limitations in using specialists. Given the difficulties specialists have in dealing with a large number of pupils, it would seem reasonable that every endeavour should be made to establish efficient contact with the class teacher. Good partnerships and effective communication links help minimise difficulties and they can promote integration with the rest of the curriculum.

Once the specialist has taught the skills, the generalist can extend and develop the lesson in classroom time, providing the timetable permits. Time constraints hindered the specialist from being able to develop skills fully at times and to incorporate possible curricular links.

In conclusion, any limitation of the specialist model was felt to be strongly offset by the benefits.

5.1

To establish the benefits and limitations of the Expressive Arts being taught by a generalist from the perspectives of class teachers, specialist teachers and children.

Benefits

The findings show the benefits to this model are that the class teacher knows the individual child and his/her learning needs best.

The generalist works a more flexible curriculum and can establish cross-curricular links easily, so coupled with the provision of an excellent support structure a generalist should be able to provide a good model of delivery. Flexible techniques could be employed in schools to allow teachers to teach to their strengths and use a team-teaching approach where appropriate. Given that generalists reported feelings of confidence in certain areas, a team-teaching approach could provide a successful model of delivery.

Limitations

Levels of confidence in teaching Expressive Arts were found to be low, especially in Drama, and this had an effect on the success of the lesson, from both the generalists' and the children's perspective. The presentation of Expressive Arts areas where the teacher lacks confidence or competency may be uninspiring. It may even be neglected to an extent. This would suggest that there would seem to be a need to lift this level of confidence to allow each area to be delivered competently. Adequate resources and valuable CPD opportunities would seem to offer one working solution.

With the burden of an overloaded curriculum, there was a strong feeling amongst generalists towards the value of a good working partnership with specialists and the effect this would have on improving practice. The specialist's in-depth understanding can be used in the context of the generalist's thorough knowledge of each child and his/her abilities.

5.2

To explore the adequacy of resources and CPD opportunities within schools to facilitate the teaching of Expressive Arts by the generalist.

The findings suggested that there was a need for more resources, especially in Drama, and for these to be updated and modified for the user. With current reductions in the levels of specialist support, the generalist would rely heavily on these resources to support teaching of the Expressive Arts and raise confidence levels.

CPD opportunities in the Expressive Arts, especially in Drama, were greatly in demand, by both specialists and generalists. Current courses are over-subscribed and in short supply.

As with resources, any CPD opportunities would have to boost the generalist's self-confidence by offering clear guidance in the basics and providing the generalist with some knowledge of appropriate skill progression. This could result in more meaningful and successful lessons.

CPD opportunities for the specialist should be appropriately directed at their higher skill level, and enable them to take their professional knowledge forward.

Improving resources and CPD opportunities relies on funding in this area and this may limit the implementation. However it would seem important in bolstering the confidence of the generalist so that a whole generation of children are not missing out on the value of the Expressive Arts.

Chapter 6

Recommendations

Further work in this area to develop this investigation could include:

- ❖ a study of the effects of lack of confidence in teaching certain Expressive Arts areas, and of successful ways of building confidence. Consider the notion that a lack of self-confidence in a particular area of teaching encourages the teacher to devote more time to mastering the required skills, necessary for a successful outcome;
- ❖ an exploration into the nature of useful CPD opportunities and valuable resources for both generalists and specialists;
- ❖ an audit of resources and then update ways of improving them;
- ❖ a study of the value attached to more time being built into a specialist's timetable for observation and peer group assessment;
- ❖ further research into the nature of communication between generalists and specialists, with particular emphasis on partnership approaches;
- ❖ further research into the provision and impact of specialist teaching on other stages and in other areas of primary education.

- ❖ an exploration into the supposition, from the study, that specialist teaching in the P4 curriculum should be built upon rather than reduced.

References

- (1) “Expressive Arts 5-14 National Guidelines” SOED, June 1992, ix.
- (2) “A Curriculum Framework for Children in their Pre-school Year”, HM Inspectors of Schools, September 1997, pp32.
- (3) “Subject Specialists –Primary Schools”, Thornton, M., UCET Occasional Papers, 10. : Universities Council for the Education of Teachers, (ed) 1998.
- (4) “Children’s Growth Through Creative Experiences – Art and Craft 8-13” School Council Publications, Van Nostrand Reinhold Co. Ltd, London, 1974, Chapter 4, pp69.
- (5) “Subject Specialists –Primary Schools”, Thornton, M., UCET Occasional Papers, 10. : Universities Council for the Education of Teachers, (ed) 1998.
- (6) Green, L.E “Wasteland Wonderland” The Arts in the National Curriculum Primary Art and Design in the National Curriculum Perspectives 49, School of Education, University of Exeter,(1992), pp32.
- (7) Blenkin, G,M., Kelly A,V. “The Primary Curriculum – A Process Approach to Curriculum Planning”, Harper& Row Ltd, London, (1987) 2nd edition, pp184.

- (8) “Curriculum Organisation and Classroom Practice in Primary Schools – A Discussion Paper” Department of Education and Science, Alexander, Rose and Woodhead, (1992) para 144.
- (9) “Subject Specialists –Primary Schools”, Thornton, M., UCET Occasional Papers, 10. : Universities Council for the Education of Teachers, (ed) (1998).
- (10) “Curriculum Organisation and Classroom Practice in Primary Schools – A Discussion Paper” Department of Education and Science, Alexander, Rose and Woodhead (1992) para 77.
- (11) “Visiting Teachers in Primary Schools A Report by HM Inspectors of Schools”(February 1993) SOED para 4.2.
- (12) “Subject Specialists –Primary Schools”, Thornton, M., UCET Occasional Papers, 10. : Universities Council for the Education of Teachers, (ed) (1998).
- (13) “Visiting Teachers in Primary Schools A Report by HM Inspectors of Schools” (February 1993) SOED para 3.4.
- (14) “Visiting Teachers in Primary Schools A Report by HM Inspectors of Schools” (February 1993) SOED para 4.4.

(15) “Curriculum Organisation and Classroom Practice in Primary Schools – A Discussion Paper” Department of Education and Science, Alexander, Rose and Woodhead, (1992) para 141.

(16) “Curriculum Organisation and Classroom Practice in Primary Schools – A Discussion Paper” Department of Education and Science, Alexander, Rose and Woodhead, (1992) para 147.

Bibliography

“Curriculum Organisation and Classroom Practice in Primary Schools – A Discussion Paper” Department of Education and Science, Alexander, Rose and Woodhead, (1992)

Blenkin, G.M., Kelly A,V. “The Primary Curriculum – A Process Approach to Curriculum Planning”, Harper& Row Ltd, London, (1987) 2nd edition.

Drever, E, (1995) “Using Semi-Structured Interviews in Small-Scale Research”, SCRE Practitioner Minipaper 15.

Green, L.E “Wasteland Wonderland” The Arts in the National Curriculum Primary Art and Design in the National Curriculum Perspectives 49, School of Education, University of Exeter,(1992)

Hall, J. “Initial Teacher Education: Specialists and Generalists – A review of the Literature.” SCRE (January 2000) Chapter 1, 2 and 3.

“A Curriculum Framework for Children in their Pre-school Year”, HM Inspectors of Schools, September 1997.

Lewis, I., Munn, P, (1987) “So You Want to Do Research! A guide for teaches on how to formulate research questions.” SCRE Practitioner Minipaper 2.

“Children’s Growth Through Creative Experiences – Art and Craft 8-13” School Council Publications, Van Nostrand Reinhold Co. Ltd, London, 1974, Chapter 4.

“Expressive Arts 5-14 National Guidelines” SOED, June 1992.

“Visiting Teachers in Primary Schools A Report by HM Inspectors of Schools”
(February 1993) SOED.

“Subject Specialists –Primary Schools”, Thornton, M., UCET Occasional Papers, 10.

: Universities Council for the Education of Teachers. (ed) (1998).

Appendices

Appendix 1

TRANSCRIPT Structured Interview with Generalist

Sample

Preamble

Thank you for agreeing to talk to me and for your time today. I know time is very precious! I'm grateful.

My name is ___ and I'm doing some work towards my study for a GTC Teacher Research Award I've been given.

The topic I've chosen to research is generalist versus specialist teachers in primary schools and I'm concentrating my work on P4 as I'm teaching P4 at the moment. I've particularly picked Expressive Arts, as I've always had a special interest in this area. Where I teach, we have specialist support available every week in Music and PE, but for Art and Drama the class teacher has complete responsibility. I'm interested in looking at the different models of specialist help available to class teachers in the Expressive Arts.

So now I'd like to ask you a few questions. Is there anything you want to clarify with me?

Our interview should take about 20 minutes. I've got a written schedule here, but in the

interest of accuracy, as well as scribbling some notes, I hope you don't mind if I record our conversation. Everything you say is confidential, only being used to help me with my work. If you'd rather withdraw it at the end then you're perfectly entitled to do so, (although I hope that you don't!). So I'd like to ask you first of all...

Questions for the Generalist

Probes and Prompt

1a) How long have you been teaching?

b) How long have you been teaching at this school?

c) How long have you been teaching P4?

2a) What is extent of specialist help available to you in Expressive Arts?

b) Do you feel that this is about the right amount of support?

c) Why?

3a) Are you expected to observe the specialist teaching of your class?

b) Are there any benefits from this observation? (hypothetical – could you see that there would be any benefits?)

4. Is there an allocation of time for communication between specialist and class teacher?

5a) Is your competence evenly spread over all areas of Expressive Arts?

b) Which area of Expressive Arts do you feel most confident teaching?

c) Are you ever tempted to allocate more time to this area?

6a) Are there enough CPD opportunities in Expressive Arts?

b) Would there be any benefits of joint CPD opportunities for class teachers and specialists?

c) Are there any areas of Expressive Arts that you would like to see more CPD opportunities in?

d) Why? (prompt – is it perhaps you're more confident in some areas?)

7a) What resources are available to you to support teaching of Expressive Arts?

b) Are resources adequate?

8a) How do you ensure cross-curricular links when teaching Expressive Arts?

b) How do you build on the skills taught?

9. What do think are the benefits of the generalist teaching the Expressive Arts?

10. What do you see as the limitations?

11. What do you see as the benefits of the specialist model?

12. What do you see as the limitations?

13a) Is there anything else you would like to add to the interview?

b) Is there anything else you would like to ask me?

Thank you again for your time

TRANSCRIPT (Sample) Structured Interview with Generalist

Case A

Preamble

Thank you for agreeing to talk to me and for your time today. I know time is very precious! I'm grateful.

My name is ___ and I'm doing some work towards my study for a GTC Teacher Research Award I've been given.

The topic I've chosen to research is generalist versus specialist teachers in primary schools and I'm concentrating my work on P4 as I'm teaching P4 at the moment. I've particularly picked Expressive Arts, as I've always had a special interest in this area. Where I teach, we have specialist support available every week in Music and PE, but for Art and Drama the class teacher has complete responsibility. I'm interested in looking at the different models of specialist help available to class teachers in the Expressive Arts.

So now I'd like to ask you a few questions. Is there anything you want to clarify with me?

Our interview should take about 20 minutes. I've got a written schedule here, but in the interest of accuracy, as well as scribbling some notes, I hope you don't mind if I record our conversation. Everything you say is confidential, only being used to help me with my work. If you'd rather withdraw it at the end then you're perfectly entitled to do so, (although I hope that you don't!). So I'd like to ask you first of all...

Questions for the Generalist

Probes and Prompts

1a) How long have you been teaching? *4 years*

b) How long have you been teaching at this school? *4 years*

c) How long have you been teaching P4? *1st year in P4*

2a) What is extent of specialist help available to you in Expressive Arts?

PE – blocks

Music & Drama – complete responsibility

Art - blocks

b) Do you feel that this is about the right amount of support?

Ideally would like specialist in each area.

c) Why?

Never observed a specialist in Drama

Would like to pick up tips

3a) Are you expected to observe the specialist teaching of your class?

Not an expectation, but most people do as it's good to learn from specialist.

b) Are there any benefits from this observation? (hypothetical – could you see that there would be any benefits?) *Definitely*

4. Is there an allocation of time for communication between specialist and class teacher?

At the beginning of year we chat with PE teacher about plan for year. In Art it might just be a chat at beginning of block.

The school is looking into the possibility of giving us more consultation time, especially without children there at same time.

5a) Is your competence evenly spread over all areas of Expressive Arts? *No*

b) Which area of Expressive Arts do you feel most confident teaching?

I'm OK in all areas but least confident in Drama

c) Are you ever tempted to allocate more time to this area?

Try not to. I'm probably tempted to put more time into it so I can improve in it.

There probably is a temptation though.

6a) Are there enough CPD opportunities in Expressive Arts?

Not enough courses and when there are any the places are booked up very quickly.

b) Would there be any benefits of joint CPD opportunities for class teachers and specialists?

Yes - specialist input would be valuable

c) Are there any areas of Expressive Arts that you would like to see more CPD opportunities in? *Drama*

d) Why? (prompt – is it perhaps you're more confident in some areas?) *Yes*

7. What resources are available to you to support teaching of Expressive Arts?

PE – notes for games. Use own lessons

Music – Sounds of Music (clear guidelines but you need to adapt them because there's too much listening)

Drama – First Steps in Drama audiotapes

Art – we try to tie this in with topic. Might get ideas from Books. No scheme.

b) Are resources adequate? *Yes but they need adapting. In Drama need more because we're not developing our own teaching skills.*

8a) How do you ensure cross-curricular links when teaching Expressive Arts?

Tied to topics eg when doing Romans we can transfer knowledge to Expressive Arts

PE – not so much depends on topics eg health

Music – might do Roman music but doesn't really lend itself to topics

b) How do you build on the skills taught?

Over the time block, evaluate and concentrate and then go back.

9. What do think are the benefits of the generalist teaching

the Expressive Arts?

Develop own skills and they're more aware of classroom topics to make good links

10. What do you see as the limitations?

Not as good as specialist. They have better ideas and skills.

Organisation of lesson is more difficult for us

11. What do you see as the benefits of the specialist model?

They're working in their own area. More experience in curricular area. Better idea of how lessons work.

12. What do you see as the limitations?

Might not know the children as well as the class teacher especially those with special needs, but that's all really.

13a) Is there anything else you would like to add to the interview? *No*

b) Is there anything else you would like to ask me? *No*

Thank you again for your time.

Questions on Generalist Tables.

1a) How long have you been teaching?

b) How long have you been teaching in this school?

c) How long have you been teaching in P4?

2a) To what extent is specialist support available to you?

b) Do you feel that the specialist support you receive is about the right amount of support?

c) Why?

3a) Are you expected to observe specialist teaching of your class?

b) Could you see that there are benefits from the observation of the specialist?

4. Is there an allocation of time for communication between specialist and class teacher and joint lesson planning?

5a) Is your competence spread evenly over all areas of Expressive Arts?

b) Which area of Expressive Arts do you feel most confident teaching?

c) Is there a temptation to allocate more time to this area?

6a) Are there enough CPD opportunities in Expressive Arts?

b) Would there be any benefits of joint CPD opportunities for class teachers and specialists?

c) Are there any areas you would like to see more CPD opportunities in?

d) Why?

7a) What resources are available to you?

b) Are resources adequate?

8a) How do you ensure cross-curricular links when teaching Expressive Arts?

b) How do you build on the skills taught?

9. What do you think are the benefits of the generalist teaching the Expressive Arts?

10. What do you think are the limitations?

11. What do you think are the benefits of the specialist teaching the Expressive Arts?

12. What do you think are the limitations of specialist teaching?

13. Is there anything you would like to add or ask me?

1a) How long have you been teaching?

b) How long have you been teaching in this school?

c) How long have you been teaching in P4?

<u>Generalists</u>	
<i>Case A</i> a) 4 years b) 4 years c) First year	
<i>Case B</i> a) 5 years b) 5 years c) First year	
<i>Case C</i> a) 10 years b) 5 years c) 3 years	
<i>Case D</i> Probationer	

2a) What extent of specialist support is available to you?

b) Do you feel that the specialist support you receive is about the right amount of support?

c) Why?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) PE and Art blocks</p> <p>b) No Ideally would like specialist in each area.</p> <p>c) Never observed a specialist in Drama. Would like to pick up tips.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) PE and Art blocks</p> <p>b) More would be better especially in Drama.</p> <p>c) Really need a programme of study like we had in South Lanarkshire.</p> <p>Comprehensive programme for teachers to follow.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) fully supported in Music and PE, Art and Drama class teacher complete responsibility</p> <p>b) It is in the areas we get support but it would be good to get it in other areas too.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) fully supported in Music and PE, Art and Drama class teacher complete responsibility</p> <p>b) No Would like more support in Drama and constructive support in Art.</p> <p>Need encouragement to make it more part of the school's activities.</p> <p>c) Drama hasn't been discussed the way other subjects have.</p>	

3a) Are you expected to observe specialist teaching of your class?

b) Could you see that there are benefits from this observation?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Not an expectation, but most people do as it's good to learn from specialist.</p> <p>b) Definitely</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) Not a necessity but it's beneficial to the class teacher.</p> <p>b) Pick up tips</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) Yes I can see that there could be links with class work. It's also good to see the children outside their classroom environment.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) Out of interest to see how children are performing. Weaker children in class may excel in Music. You could give positive feedback in class about this. Interesting to watch how other teachers manage behaviour and to learn new strategies.</p>	

4. Is there an allocation of time for communication between specialist and class teacher and joint lesson planning?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>At beginning of year chat with PE teacher about plan for year. In Art at beginning of block. School looking into giving more consultation time.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>No but Art specialist tries to link to topic</p> <p>PE specialist at beginning of year asks class teacher about forward plan. Puts forward suggestions</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>No</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>No real lesson planning maybe slight reference to topic</p>	

5 a) *Is your competence evenly spread over all areas?*

b) *Which area of Expressive Arts do you feel most confident teaching?*

c) *Is there a temptation to allocate more time to this area?*

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) OK in all areas</p> <p>b) Least confident in Drama.</p> <p>c) Try not to. Probably tempted to put more time into it so I can improve in it.</p> <p>There is a temptation though</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) Most confident in Music and least in Drama.</p> <p>c) Not really</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) Art</p> <p>c) Not really a temptation just do it!</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) Art</p> <p>c) Very tempted but the curriculum demands don't allow it.</p>	

6a) Are there enough CPD opportunities in expressive arts?

b) Would there be any benefits of joint CPD opportunities for class teachers and specialists?

c) Are there any areas you would like to see more CPD opportunities in?

d) Why?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Not enough courses Places get booked up very quickly.</p> <p>b) Specialist input would be valuable</p> <p>c) Drama</p> <p>d) Less confident</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) No definitely not and when there are places go very quickly.</p> <p>b) Great to pick up tips and get hands-on experience. Get more out of it</p> <p>c) Drama and PE</p> <p>d) Least confident in these areas</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) Not really</p> <p>b) We'd be working together from the same start point.</p> <p>c) Art and Drama</p> <p>d) Not as confident in Drama. Like more ideas</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) Class teachers would benefit from sharing ideas. More understanding of how each other works</p>	

c) Drama	
d) Could do with some more ideas	

7. Are resources adequate?

<u>Generalists</u>	
<i>Case A</i> Resources are adequate but need adapting	
<i>Case B</i> Not really. We'd like programmes of study to build on skills at each stage.	
<i>Case C</i> No	
<i>Case D</i> Probably not	

8a) How do you ensure cross-curricular links when teaching Expressive Arts?

b) How do you build on the skills taught?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Tie to topics as much as possibleb) Over the time block evaluate, concentrate then go back	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Look for links if suitable but don't do it to deathb) Hard to do without real programmes of study	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) Link to rest of curriculum in Art & Drama but PE skill-based</p> <p>Music links in when she can</p> <p>b) Don't really build on skills. In drama you might repeat areas where necessary</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Tie to topic workb) Interesting to do something completely different. More interesting at times and refreshing <p>Use skills they know already and mix in with new skills</p>	

9. What do you think are the benefits of the generalist teaching the Expressive Arts?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Can develop own skills and more aware of class topics</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>See skills you might not necessarily see in maths & language work. Different side to children on view. Self-esteem boost for children who might not be so good in class.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>More links with curriculum</p> <p>Know children better (can also be drawback)</p> <p>Allows you to see how children perform in other areas</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Seeing children achieving in different subjects</p> <p>Enjoyable for teacher as much as child because different atmosphere is created when doing expressive arts.</p>	

10. What do you think are the limitations?

<u>Generalists</u>	
<i>Case A</i> Organisation of lesson is difficult. Specialists have more skills and ideas	
<i>Case B</i> Limited knowledge and ideas. Organisation of lesson more difficult without full knowledge base	
<i>Case C</i> Lack of skills	
<i>Case D</i> Not fully skilled the way specialists are.	

11. What do you think are the benefits of the specialist teaching the Expressive Arts?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Working in their own area</p> <p>More experienced</p> <p>Know how lessons will work</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Expertise</p> <p>Child benefits from expert teaching</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Have more skills are specialists in their area</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Top quality teaching for kids</p> <p>Teaching correctly and ability to sort out mistakes</p> <p>Have specific skills and know their subject inside out</p> <p>Good routine to leave classroom and practise moving around as they will do when older.</p>	

12. What do you think are the limitations of specialist teaching?

<p><u>Generalists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Might not know the children so well especially those with special needs but that's all</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Time and money limit availability. Irregular attendance affects children and level of commitment affects how well they know children</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>They don't see the 'whole' child see in isolation</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Lack of communication could enhance class topic</p> <p>Difficulty in inking to topic</p>	

Appendix 2

TRANSCRIPT Structured interview with Specialist

Sample

Preamble

Thank you for agreeing to talk to me and for your time today. I know time is very precious! I'm grateful.

My name is ___ and I'm doing some work towards my study for a GTC Teacher Research Award I've been given.

The topic I've chosen to research is generalist versus specialist teachers in primary schools and I'm concentrating my work on P4 as I'm teaching P4 at the moment. I've particularly picked Expressive Arts, as I've always had a special interest in this area. Where I teach, we have specialist support available every week in Music and PE, but for Art and Drama the class teacher has complete responsibility. I'm interested in looking at the different models of specialist help available to class teachers in the Expressive Arts.

So now I'd like to ask you a few questions. Is there anything you want clarify with me? Our interview should take about 20 minutes. I've got a written schedule here, but in the interest of accuracy, as well as scribbling some notes, I hope you don't mind if I record our conversation. Everything you say is confidential, only being used to help me with my work. If you'd rather withdraw it at the end then you're perfectly entitled to do so, (although I hope that you don't!). So I'd like to ask you first of all...

1a) How long have you been teaching?

b) How long have you had links with this school?

2a) How many pupils do you have contact with in a day/week?

b) How well do you feel you know the children in your P4 class?

3a) What is your time commitment in this school to P4 each week/session?

b) Do you feel you have enough time in this school with the P4s?

4a) In what ways do you communicate with the P4 class teacher?

b) Is it important to you to consult with the class teacher before/after your lesson?

b) How easy/difficult is this practically?

5. Do you try to link your lesson to ongoing class work or is it best to develop your curricular area?

6a) Is your job with P4s at present the most satisfying it could be?

b) Can you think of any improvements you'd like to see made?

7. In your specialist role, do you feel part the team here?

8a) Have you had any CPD opportunities to link your work specifically to primary pupils?

b) Do specialists have enough opportunities to focus specifically on needs of primary pupils?

c) Do you think that more CPD opportunities would be helpful?

d) Would you like more CPD opportunities with class teachers?

9. What do you think are the benefits of the generalist teaching the Expressive Arts?

10. What do you see as the limitations?

11. What do you see as the benefits of the specialist model?

12. What do you see as the limitations?

13. Is there anything else you would like to add to the interview?

Thank you again for your time.

TRANSCRIPT Structured interview with Specialist (Sample)

Case A

Preamble

Thank you for agreeing to talk to me and for your time today. I know time is very precious! I'm grateful.

My name is ___ and I'm doing some work towards my study for a GTC Teacher Research Award I've been given.

The topic I've chosen to research is generalist versus specialist teachers in primary schools and I'm concentrating my work on P4 as I'm teaching P4 at the moment.

I've particularly picked Expressive Arts, as I've always had a special interest in this area.

Where I teach, we have specialist support available every week in Music and PE, but for Art and Drama the class teacher has complete responsibility. I'm interested in looking at the different models of specialist help available to class teachers in the Expressive Arts.

So now I'd like to ask you a few questions. Is there anything you want clarify with me?

Our interview should take about 20 minutes. I've got a written schedule here, but in the interest of accuracy, as well as scribbling some notes, I hope you don't mind if I record our conversation. Everything you say is confidential, only being used to help me with my work. If you'd rather withdraw it at the end then you're perfectly entitled to do so, (although I hope that you don't!). So I'd like to ask you first of all...

Questions for the Specialist

Probes and Prompt

1a) How long have you been teaching?

Been a primary specialist since 1990

b) How long have you had links with this school? *7 years*

2a) How many pupils do you have contact with in a day/week?

4 classes a day so 400-500/week

b) How well do you feel you know the children in your P4 class?

Don't know their names unless they're particularly good at art/need support or are strong characters. I don't know them as individuals. You develop strategies to learn names and things but it takes time and experience. The majority just merge. It's helpful to have class teacher with you. There's just too much information to carry in your head.

3a) What is your time commitment in this school to P4 each week/session?

Rotating timetable P4 10-12 sessions 1 and quarter hours

b) Do you feel you have enough time in this school with the P4s?

Yes spread over the year. Budgets make it too difficult to do more and lack of specialists.

4a) In what ways do you communicate with the P4 class teacher?

Time given prior to teaching block. Themes and topics discussed. This is more important for younger ones so they see things in context.

b) Is it important to you to consult with the class teacher before/after your lesson?

Yes A teacher might ask me to do an area that they're not confident in, like clay.

c) How easy/difficult is this practically?

Varies

5. Do you try to link your lesson to ongoing class work or is it best to develop your curricular area?

Has to be appropriate for age and stage. Relate to an experience eg Japan but not if the topic doesn't lend itself like Drugwise

6a) Is your job with P4s at present the most satisfying it could be?

No response moved quickly to b)

b) Can you think of any improvements you'd like to see made?

Like to have a designated art space rather than moving materials around all the time.

Wider more plentiful materials

7. In your specialist role, do you feel part of the team here?

Yes Good working relationship. Everyone looks forward to me coming. Staff enthusiastic and good to work with but sometimes although they don't really mean to,

I feel pushed and pulled and a commodity rather than a valued member of Staff. I know this not true but it sometimes feels like it.

8a) Have you had any CPD opportunities to link your work specifically to primary pupils? *Yes*

b) Do specialists have enough opportunities to focus specifically on needs of primary pupils? *No.*

c) Do you think that more CPD opportunities would be helpful?

Not enough tailored for primary specialists. Have to design our own or share ideas as a team

d) Would you like more CPD opportunities with class teachers?

Possibly. Everyone feels different about it. Must be generic – strategies for classroom management. Could be subject-specific.

9. What do you think are the benefits of the generalist teaching the Expressive Arts?

All teachers should be supported by specialists and I feel very strongly about that. Quality is poorer. Experience narrower. Even if they have own skills they might not be visually aware enough.

10. What do you see as the limitations?

Nervous Stick rigidly to what they know

Stick to books which are prescriptive and might not be so good

Lack of scope for individuality.

11. What do you see as the benefits of the specialist model?

Has bank of images.

Knowledge of materials and purposes/uses eg pastels. Have knowledge of media and know how to produce the most successful outcome.

12. What do you see as the limitations?

Limited by conditions/amount of pupils and time. If there was more money the sky would be the limit!

13. Is there anything else you would like to add to the interview or ask me?

Specialist support is degenerating situation. Devolved budgets have handed over responsibilities to head teachers so it's up to them if they have specialists

No new art specialists. People without real experience coming in and doing inappropriate work. They can be disorganised so school stops having them – a vicious circle.

Thank you again for your time.

Questions on Specialist Tables

1a) How long have you been teaching?

b) How long have you had links with this school?

2a) How many pupils do you have contact with in a day/week?

b) How well do you feel you know the children in your P4 class?

3a) What is your time commitment to P4 each week in this school?

b) Do you feel that you have enough time?

4a) In what ways do you communicate with P4 class teacher?

b) Is it important to you to consult with class teacher before/after lesson?

c) How easy/ difficult is this practically?

5. Do you try to link your lesson to ongoing class work or is it best to develop your curricular area?

6a) Is your job with P4s the most satisfying it could be?

b) Can you think of any improvements you'd like to see made?

7. In your specialist role do you feel part of the team here?

8a) Have you had any CPD opportunities to link your work specifically to primary pupils?

b) Do specialists have enough opportunities to focus specifically on needs of primary pupils?

c) Do you think that more CPD opportunities would be helpful?

d) Would you like more CPD opportunities with class teachers?

9. What do you think are the benefits of generalist teaching Expressive Arts?

10. What do you see as the limitations?

11. What do you see as the benefits of the specialist model?

12. What do you see as the limitations of the specialist model?

13. Do you have anything else you would like to add or ask me?

1a) How long have you been teaching?

b) How long have you had links with this school?

<u>Specialists</u> <i>Case A</i> a) 14 years b) 7 years.	
<i>Case B</i> a) 7 years b) 3 years	
<i>Case C</i> a) 28 years b) 12 years	
<i>Case D</i> a) 37 years b) 10+ years	

2a) How many pupils do you have contact with in a day/week?

b) How well do you feel you know the children in your P4 class?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) 4 classes/ day 450-500/week</p> <p>b) Don't know names. Strong characters will stick in mind or if they're good at art/ need support. Majority merge. Don't know as individuals.</p> <p>Having class teacher with you is helpful. Carry too much information in head.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) 120 x 5</p> <p>b) Pretty well</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) 140+ /day</p> <p>b) Very well. Been teaching them since P1</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) 200 so 1000+</p> <p>b) Known since P1 so very well. Work with class teacher and she updates me.</p>	

3a) What is your time commitment to P4 each week in this school?

b) Do you feel that you have enough time?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Rotating timetable P4 has 10-12 sessions of 1¼hours</p> <p>b) Yes enough time spread over the year</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) 2 lessons x 35 minutes b) Yes</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) 2x 40 mins b)Yes given all else they have to learn</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) About 2 and half hour/term 5 or 6 x 40min session/term</p> <p>b) Not enough time</p>	

4. a) *In what ways do you communicate with P4 class teacher?*

b) *Is it important to you to consult with class teacher before/after lesson?*

c) *How easy/ difficult is this practically?*

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Time given prior to teaching block. Especially important for younger ones to see things in context. Themes and topics are discussed.</p> <p>b) Yes They can ask me to do things they are not confident in eg clay.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) e-mail and face-to-face</p> <p>b) Yes.</p> <p>c) Very difficult always rushing off to next lesson. Special circumstances an exception if there's accident or issue with behaviour, good or bad.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) e-mail and face-to-face</p> <p>b) Not every lesson. Beginning of term or before concert.</p> <p>c) Not difficult</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) Verbally</p> <p>b) Always in contact especially if medical difficulties, special needs or home problems.</p> <p>c) Not easy. We do it in passing or as the class is arriving.</p>	

5. Do you try to link your lesson to ongoing class work or is it best to develop your curricular area?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Has to be appropriate for age and stage. Relate to own experience. Depends on topic. Japan, for example, is good but not Drugwise. Doesn't lend itself to adaptation.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Ideally yes but not really aware of other curricular areas. Can build it in if we can but the P4s have much more structured PE curriculum than earlier years.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Yes both. Links with music concepts and with class topics.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Where possible especially if it's something that suits, like creative dance.</p>	

6.a) *Is your job with P4s the most satisfying it could be?*

b) *Can you think of any improvements you'd like to see made?*

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Difficult to answer</p> <p>b) Would like a designated art space and wider more plentiful materials</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) Quite happy</p> <p>b) None really haven't taught P4 for long enough.</p>	
<p><u>Case C</u></p> <p>a) Yes quite happy</p> <p>b) No, not really</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) No</p> <p>b) I'd like more time to improve basic fitness. This would reflect in academic achievement.</p>	

7. In your specialist role do you feel part of the team here?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Yes good working relationship. Everyone looks forward to me coming. Staff enthusiastic. Sometimes feel pushed and pulled – a commodity rather than a valued member of staff. I know that’s not true but sometimes that’s what it feels like.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Yes I think so</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>No Part of neither school (Specialist teaches in Junior and Senior school)</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Really depends on school. As much as the school makes you.</p>	

8. a) *Have you had any CPD opportunities to link your work specifically to primary pupils?*

b) *Do specialists have enough opportunities to focus specifically on needs of primary pupils?*

c) *Have you had any CPD opportunities to link your work specifically to primary pupils?*

d) *Do specialists have enough opportunities to focus specifically on needs of primary pupils?*

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p>Case A</p> <p>a) Yes</p> <p>b) No</p> <p>c) Not enough tailored for primary specialists. Have to design own and share ideas as a team.</p> <p>d) Possibly Everyone feels different about it. Must be generic – strategies for classroom management</p>	
---	--

9. What do you think are the benefits of generalist teaching Expressive Arts?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>All teachers should be supported by specialists. Quality is poor and experience narrower. If they have some skills fine but they might not be visually aware.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>See girls in a different light. Quite often doing difficult things so you have a different relationship.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Know children really well and have more time to explore concepts thoroughly.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Depends on class teacher. They have too much on plate.</p>	

10. What do you see as the limitations?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Nervous – stick rigidly to what they know.</p> <p>Stick to directions in books which might not be so good</p> <p>Very prescriptive Lack of scope for individuality</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Technical knowledge</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Find it difficult to explore music schemes and explore creativity and inventing so shy away.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>No time to teach these areas properly</p>	

11. What do you see as the benefits of specialist model?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Carry excellent bank of images</p> <p>Have practical knowledge of materials and their purpose and use. We can use the correct media to produce the most successful outcome.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Girls get taught correctly from early stage of learning skills</p> <p>Cross-application of skills is vital</p> <p>Important also for class teacher to have some non-contact time</p>	
<p><u>Case C</u></p> <p>More able to explore creativity and have deeper understanding of concepts. Can give more help because of expertise.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>So important it can't be missed out. Vital to development of child. Poorer children relate to aesthetic subjects.</p>	

12. What do you see as the limitations of specialist model?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Limited by conditions/amount of pupils and time. With more money the sky's the limit!</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Time shortage – always on demand because the next class is coming along. Can't always develop skills as much as would like to or explore them due to time constraints.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Time factor is the only thing really. When the bell goes you sometimes don't get the time to develop things fully.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p><i>None</i></p>	

13. Do you have anything you would like to add or ask me?

<p><u>Specialists</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Specialist support is degenerating situation. Devolved budgets have handed over responsibilities to head teachers so it's up to them if they have specialists</p> <p>No new art specialists. People without real experience coming in and doing inappropriate work. They can be disorganised so school stops having them – a vicious circle.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>no</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Yes I do think that specialist input is vital. I think there should be more teachers teaching teachers. More intervention is needed between specialist and class teacher, especially in our school.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Specialists should be centrally funded. Should be an allocation of time and specialist to each school. Shouldn't be at the discretion of the head. The physical side of development must be addressed. It's every child's right.</p> <p>More communication to specialists too. This should be addressed personally rather than relying on school notice boards..</p>	

Appendix 3

Transcript FOCUS GROUP

Sample

Someone else is looking after my class today so that I can come and talk to you. I want to talk to you about some of the things you learn at school, and today I'm interested in talking about PE, Music, Art and Drama.

Your class teacher usually teaches you, but in PE and Music, sometimes you get a different teacher from your class teacher. You might go to the gym hall and have a teacher that teaches you PE or to the music room for a lesson with a music teacher. These teachers who are different from your class teacher are called specialists.

Do you get any specialists in P4 in this school?

What are they called?

Good. Let's think about these specialists. When we're talking I want you to think about the different teachers you get at school for PE and Art/Music.

2. Sometimes your class teacher will teach you. When it's not your class teacher taking the lesson how do you feel about having a change of teacher?

3. Would you prefer it if your class teacher taught you all the time for PE, Music, Art and Drama?

In my school, at the moment, the P4s are learning about the Weather. That is our topic. What is your topic at the moment?

4a) When you have a lesson with Mrs Y or Z does she ever teach you something to do with your class topic? (Give example once you know the topic)

*b) When Mrs Y does this, do you feel it helps you to remember about your topic?
((give topic name))*

5a) Which of these subjects do you enjoy doing most: PE, Music, Art or Drama?

b) Why?

c) Is it because you have a specialist or different teacher? Or is it something else?

6a) Do you feel your class teacher, Mrs X knows you well?

b) Does she know everything about you – what you're good at, and bad things too!

c) Does Mrs X know what you find difficult?

If you find things really difficult is she good at helping you?

7. Do Mrs Y and Mrs Z know everything about you?

8. Can they tell what you find difficult so they can help you with it? (what you're good at, and bad things too!)

9. *Let's think about just PE for the moment. How many times a week do you have PE?*

When you have your second lesson in PE is it easy to remember what you did in your first lesson the week before? (Adapt for school's timetabling arrangements)

10. *I want you to think very carefully for a minute and see if you can come up with good things about your class teacher teaching you PE, Music, Art and Drama.*

11. *Are there any things that are not so good about your class teacher doing all the teaching?*

12. *I want to ask you the same question about Mrs Y who comes in to teach you. What are the good things about her coming to teach you PE?*

What are the good things about Mrs Z coming to teach you Art/Music?

13. *Are there any things that are not so good about Mrs Y or Z teaching you?*

Well, I think that's the end of our chat together so I just want to say thank you to you all for helping me. Just before we go is there anything else you want to say about PE or Music/Art?

OK. Thank you.

Focus Discussion with Children (Sample)

TRANSCRIPT A

Someone else is looking after my class today so that I can come and talk to you. I want to talk to you about some of the things you learn at school, and today I'm interested in talking about PE, Music, Art and Drama.

Your class teacher usually teaches you, but in PE and Music, sometimes you get a different teacher from your class teacher. You might go to the gym hall and have a teacher that teaches you PE or to the music room for a lesson with a music teacher. These teachers who are different from your class teacher are called specialists.

1.a) Do you get any specialists in P4 in this school? *Yes*

b) What are they called? *Mrs X and Mrs Y*

Good. Let's think about these specialists. When we're talking I want you to think about the different teachers you get at school for PE and Art/Music.

2. Sometimes your class teacher will teach you. When it's not your class teacher taking the lesson how do you feel about having a change of teacher?

Shy

OK but like to stick to the usual one

Happy – I like having different teachers

3. Would you prefer it if your class teacher taught you all the time for PE, Music, Art and Drama?

It's good to have a change. Prefer teachers to teach you indifferent ways. Some teachers are funny. Class teacher wouldn't do things the way a PE teacher would eg keep us in a little gym.

They'd be too calm and boring.

In my school, at the moment, the P4s are learning about the Weather. That is our topic. What is your topic at the moment?

Weather

4a) When you have a lesson with Mrs X does she ever teach you something to do with your class topic? (Give example once you know the topic) *Sometimes in Music but not so much in PE*

b) When Mrs X does this, do you feel it helps you to remember about your topic?

(give topic name)

Yes it makes it more fun than just simply remembering from class.

5a) Which of these subjects do you enjoy doing most: PE, Music, Art or Drama? (Just choose area where specialist is working)

PE

b) Why? *You can run around and be free. It's more fun.*

c) Is it because you have a specialist or different teacher? Or is it

something else? No, not really. It's the space to move and enjoy

yourself.

6a) Do you feel your class teacher, Mrs Z, knows you well? *Yes*

b) Does she know everything about you – what you're good at, and bad things too!

Quite a lot. She only knows some things

c) Does Mrs Z know what you find difficult?

Yes (very definite!) She puts us in groups to help us

If you find things really difficult is she good at helping you? *Yes*

7a) Do Mrs X and Mrs Y know everything about you?

No they only know about PE and Music. Get confused sometimes even ask us what class we are 4B or 4C or 4H?

b) Can they tell what you find difficult so they can help you with it?

(for example, what you're good at, and bad things too!) *Yes but they really only know about music and PE.*

8. Let's think about just PE for the moment. How many times a week do you have PE? *3x*

When you have your second lesson in PE is it easy to remember what you did in your first lesson the week before?

(Adapt for school's timetabling arrangements)

Yes it's easy but only to remember the bits you like. It's most

important and easier to remember the basics (Reference to skills in basketball.)

9. I want you to think very carefully for a minute and see if you can come up with good things about your class teacher teaching you PE, Music, Art and Drama.

She would always be calm

10. Are there any things that are not so good about your class teacher doing all the teaching?

She's not really learned about these

11. I want to ask you the same question about Mrs X who comes in to teach you.

What are the good things about her coming to teach you PE?

She knows what she's got to do because she came to this school to teach PE. She really knows how good or bad you are at it.

What are the good things about Mrs Y coming to teach you Art/Music?

She makes it fun. Teaches you all sorts of different things to do with music. Puts new things into the lesson. Every week she puts more in and goes back if we find something difficult. She know lots of instruments too.

12. Are there any things that are not so good about Mrs X or Mrs Y teaching you?

Quite strict

Well, I think that's the end of our chat together so I just want to say thank you to you all for helping me.

13. Just before we go is there anything else you want to say about PE or Music/Art?

All teachers should do their own job that they're meant to do because that's what they're best at.

I think we should have an art teacher too. Our class teacher is not as good as an art teacher would be teaching art because an art teacher would enjoy it more. Although the good thing about a class teacher doing art is that she keeps everyone at the same step.

OK. Thank you.

Questions on Focus Group Tables

- 1 a) Are there any specialist teachers for your class?
b) What are their names?

2. When a specialist takes you how do you feel about having a change of teacher?

3. Would you prefer it if your class teacher taught you for PE, Music, Art and Drama?

4. a) When you have a specialist lesson does she ever link it to your class topic?
b) Do you feel it helps you to remember your topic?

5. a) Which of these do you enjoy most? (refer to specialist area)
b) Why?
c) Is it because it's a different teacher that teaches you or is it something else?

6. a) Do you feel your class teacher knows you well?
b) Does she know everything about you?
c) Does she know what you find difficult and is she good at helping you?

7. Do specialist teachers know everything about you? Can they tell what you find difficult so that they can help you?

8. Is it easy to remember what you're taught in PE/Music from one lesson to another?

9. What are the good things about your class teacher teaching you expressive arts?

10. Are there any things that are not so good about your class teacher teaching you everything?

11. What are the good things about a different teacher teaching you expressive arts?

12. Are there any things that are not so good about a different teacher teaching you PE, Music or Art?

Is there anything else you'd like to say about PE, Music, Art or Drama?

2. When a specialist takes you how do you feel about having a change of teacher?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Shy</p> <p>OK but I like to stick to the usual one</p> <p>Happy I like having different teachers</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Excited is she going to be OK</p> <p>Look forward to it but only if she's nice</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Excited because getting someone else is fun</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>You're just losing one teacher and gaining another. It's fine but you wonder what she's going to be like.</p>	

3. Would you prefer it if your class teacher taught you for PE, Music, Art and Drama?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Prefer teachers to teach you in different ways. Some teachers can be funny. Good to have a change. Class teacher wouldn't do things the way a PE teacher would.</p> <p>Keep you in a little gym and be too calm/boring</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>She might not be able to do it properly. She can't play the piano</p> <p>In PE would be good. She could really get you going.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Mixed responses yes/no</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>More fun to change teacher. Same one would be boring. It's good to meet new teacher.</p>	

4. a) *When you have a specialist lesson does she ever link it to your class topic?*

b) *Do you feel it helps you to remember your topic?*

<p><u><i>Focus Discussion</i></u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Sometimes in Music and not so much in PE</p> <p>b) no</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) Some links in Music but not always. It's up to the class teacher to put the ideas into her head.</p> <p>b) Not sure</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) Sometimes in Art, not usually in PE Rugby and World cup.</p> <p>b) Not really</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) Does in art but not in PE</p> <p>b) Yes it makes you think about it more</p>	

5. a) Which of these do you enjoy most? (refer to specialist area)

b) Why?

c) Is it because it's a different teacher that teaches you or is it something else?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) and b) Run around and be more free in PE</p> <p>c) No not really it's because you've got lots of space to run around and enjoy yourself</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) PE</p> <p>b) depends on what you're learning. Sometimes it could be music</p> <p>c) If you had the same teacher all the time it would be boring. Different teachers look different too.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>a) PE by some, art others</p> <p>b) just like it</p> <p>c) No you learn new things in these topics and they're more fun.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Like them all because it gives a break from class work</p>	

6. a) Do you feel your class teacher knows you well? b) Does she know everything about you? c) Does she know what you find difficult and is she good at helping you?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>a) Yes</p> <p>b) Quite a lot. Some things</p> <p>c) Yes she puts us in groups.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>a) Yes</p> <p>b) Doesn't know all about me, mostly school things.</p> <p>c) Yes sometimes. One child answered yes emphatically</p>	
<p><u>Case C</u></p> <p>a) Yes</p> <p>b) Not our dark secrets</p> <p>c) Yes she finds out when we can or can't do something</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>a) Yes</p> <p>b) Only work things</p> <p>c) Yes She explains it better</p>	

7. Do specialist teachers know everything about you? Can they tell what you find difficult so that they can help you?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>No. Only know about music and PE. Sometimes she gets confused and doesn't know what class we are 4C, 4B or 4H?</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>No not as well as Miss Z.</p> <p>Yes they can give you more special help</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>No Only about art or PE</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>No Mrs Y off too much</p> <p>Yes but just about PE</p>	

8. Is it easy to remember what you're taught in PE/Music from one lesson to another?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>Yes it's easy to remember the bits you like. Easy to remember the basics because they're important.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>Not easy too much to remember. Hard because you can't fit it all in your mind.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Yes said the boys in group</p> <p>No said the girls. (Current teaching block is rugby)</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Easy because she goes over it and reminds us.</p>	

9. What are the good things about your class teacher teaching you Expressive Arts?

<p><u><i>Focus Discussion</i></u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>She's calm</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>She knows about cross-country. She's fun. She'd get fit.</p> <p>She knows about what we like to do and what we find easiest.</p> <p>Don't know if she knows instruments.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>She explains things properly</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>She knows us better</p>	

10. Are there any things that are not so good about your class teacher teaching you everything?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>She's not really learned about these</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>She might get notes wrong in music because she doesn't know it that well. She knows what we like to do and what we find easiest. She'd have to practise. Miss Z (class teacher) wouldn't be able to show us as well. Her examples might be clumsy and in PE she might have an accident and then we wouldn't have a teacher!</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>She can't show the things or give the same examples that Mrs X can</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>She stops sometimes because she reads it off a sheet and she loses her place.</p> <p>She had a different way of doing it and sometimes it's boring. Mrs X knows more about PE.</p>	

11. What are the good things about a different teacher teaching you Expressive Arts?

(ask this of any specialist support available to group)

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>She knows what she's got to do because she came to this school to teach PE. She knows how good or bad you are at it.</p> <p>Music teacher has been practising for a long time. She's very clever and knows lots of instruments. She can play the piano and turn over pages at the same time.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>She can give you more help.</p> <p>She really knows what she's doing and she teaches you exactly what she knows.</p> <p>Knows how to do all the games and tells us the correct way to do all the games.</p> <p>She's very fit.</p> <p>Puts new things into lesson. Every week she puts more in and goes back if we find things too difficult.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>She shows you how to do things. Very active and fit. She's good at PE herself. She makes it fun.</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>She's been somewhere to teach her about PE. More ideas.</p> <p>You get better examples. We get a chance to see it step by step instead of just being drawn on the board.</p> <p>Art teacher is a really good drawer.</p>	

12. Are there any things that are not so good about a different teacher teaching you PE, Music or Art?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>She can be quite strict.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>She panics when you do something wrong.</p> <p>They want it to be perfect.</p> <p>Can be confusing. They just know so much!</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Puts us onto games too quickly</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Explains things really fast. Hard to understand what to do.</p>	

13. Is there anything else you'd like to say about PE, Music, Art or Drama?

<p><u>Focus Discussion</u></p> <p><i>Case A</i></p> <p>All teachers should do their own job that they're meant to do, because that's what they're good at.</p> <p>Art teacher enjoys it more so she would be better. Good thing about class teacher is that she puts everyone at the same stage.</p>	
<p><i>Case B</i></p> <p>We'd like to have a specialist for art too.</p>	
<p><i>Case C</i></p> <p>Nothing added</p>	
<p><i>Case D</i></p> <p>Nothing added</p>	